

# **Parliament of Tasmania**

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

# **INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS**

**Members of the Committee** 

Mr Tony Fletcher Ms Lin Thorp Mr Jim Wilkinson (Chair) Mr Don Wing

Secretary: Mr David Pearce

# **Table of Contents**

Executive Summary 3
Summary of Recommendations7
Introduction 11
Part 1 – The Potential 14
Part 2 – Role of Government 23
Part 3 – The Impediments 41
Part 4 – Marketing and Recruitment 51
Part 5 – Pastoral Care and Assistance
Part 6 – Offshore Activity 92
Part 7 – Primary Economic Driver 111
Part 8 – Additional Matters 113
Glossary of Terms 120
Attachment 1 – List of Witnesses 122
Attachment 2 – List of Submissions 125
Attachment 3 – List of Documents 128
Attachment 4 – Minutes of Proceedings 130

## **Executive Summary**

Australia is a major provider of international education and training services, and continues to perform strongly against its major competitors, the United States, United Kingdom, Canada and New Zealand.

From a national perspective the value of Australian education exports continues to grow. This is in contrast to many other export industries which have faced difficulties brought about by drought, global uncertainty and variations in currency exchange rates.

During the 2002 calendar year Australian education exports were worth approximately \$4.2 billion, a 2 percent increase on 2001. Education services remains Australia's third largest exporter in the services sector behind tourism and transportation services.

As stated by the International Development Program Education Australia (IDP) Chief Executive, Ms Lindy Hyam earlier this year in a media release –

"It is important to remember that Australia's international education industry contributes much more to this country than simply a financial return. The thousands of international students who choose to study in Australia each year bring immeasurable social, cultural, business, political and diplomatic links and benefits, and help secure Australia's position around the world, and in particular in this region."<sup>1</sup>

The year 2001 final international student numbers published by Australian Education International (AEI) indicate that there were 233,408 international student enrolments with Australian education providers. There has also been a strengthening in the area of offshore higher education enrolments, which numbered nearly 43,000 in 2001.

In terms of the performance of other states and territories, in 2001 New South Wales hosted the largest number of onshore international student enrolments with 74,329, followed by Victoria with 48,248 and Queensland with 33,990. These three states increased their share of total onshore overseas student enrolments from eighty-two per cent in 2000 to eighty-three per cent in 2001.

Of the total onshore enrolments for the three abovementioned states, forty-two per cent were enrolments in the higher education sector. It seems to the Committee that the higher education institutions with large international student populations can rely far less on marketing and more on reputation alone to attract students.

It is against this national backdrop that Tasmania must compete in terms of offering a range of education and associated support services to international students. The benefits of international students studying in Tasmania are

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> IDP Media Release, 28 March 2003

significant. There are benefits from direct spending on tuition, accommodation and other consumption expenditure, estimated to be \$20,000 annually for each full-time equivalent student. Whilst not supported by statistics there is anecdotal evidence which suggests that international students here in the State generate a flow of visitors-family and friends, who in turn purchase local goods and services. Benefits are also gained from the formation of international links, together with the exposure of Tasmanians to different cultures, at both the institutional and community levels. It is clear also that greater access to educational opportunities for local students has occurred as a result of the international student enrolment. Various programs and courses offered at all levels are, in many cases, developed and further enhanced.

Whilst the number of international students has grown in recent years, Tasmania's share still remains relatively small. There is no doubt that potential does exist for further and continued growth, although a number of challenges are faced.

Tasmania must build upon efforts to date. The profile of Tasmania as an education destination of quality must be raised internationally. Growth in student numbers must be commensurate with the adequate provision of resources and infrastructure necessary to support increased numbers.

There are strengths and weaknesses in what our State and education system has to offer. This combined with visa processes and the competition from the higher profile mainland city providers creates a great challenge. Growth may well be incremental in nature. This however, may also be desirable.

The larger education providers have become market orientated, customer focused and entrepreneurial in their activities. As a consequence of this type of orientation full-fee paying international students are being attracted to Tasmania.

Tasmanian onshore and offshore enrolments as published by AEI were 2,142 in 2001. 1,839 students were enrolled onshore and 303 were enrolled in offshore higher education courses. Tasmania had just under one per cent of all overseas students resident in Australia. Approximately half of the onshore enrolments are in the higher education sector. The Vocational Education and Training (VET) numbers and school numbers have remained relatively steady during the 2000 and 2001 years. The number of English Language Intensive Course of Study (ELICOS) students increased over the same period. In fact ELICOS enrolments in Tasmania increased from 401 to 536 enrolments.

The higher education sector in Tasmania, based on 2001 final student numbers, has about a fifty per cent share of the market. The ELICOS sector has a twenty-nine per cent share. The remaining market share is split between the VET and School sectors. Schools account for fifteen per cent with the VET sector holding the remaining six per cent of the international onshore student market.

The Committee is of the view that onshore international student numbers can be grown. With the marketing effort becoming increasingly focussed through cooperative arrangements and formal partnership agreements, desired outcomes can be pursued in a strategic way. The Committee cautions against increasing student numbers without the appropriate infrastructure, particularly accommodation, and other support structures and facilities. Clearly there is some capacity in certain areas to immediately increase numbers. However, to double existing numbers, for example, will require a considerably greater level of resources, improved support arrangements and a significant investment in infrastructure.

It is the opinion of the Committee that if the number of international students coming to Tasmania is to increase in a significant way then Tasmania's best interests are served by greater levels of coordination and cooperation. The level of expertise in the field of international education needs to be shared and further developed across all providers.

A vision for the future at the broadest level is required. The Committee's view is that an industry Forum be the vehicle to establish the objectives and consider how best Tasmania can work toward meeting them.

The development of a strategy for the future would need to involve all international education providers and include the widest possible range of Tasmania's sector representatives.

It is the Committee's view that to achieve increased success in the delivery of education to international students, both onshore and offshore, involves the consideration of a range of matters in developing appropriate strategies for the future.

In the Committee's opinion these matters include:

- the development of adequate levels and appropriate standards of accommodation to meet the future requirements of students;
- the future coordinated and innovative marketing of Tasmania as a destination to obtain quality education and instruction and experience a quality lifestyle opportunity;
- the provision of a wide range of coordinated support services for students, particularly services to assist students during the initial settling-in period;
- the establishment of a mechanism to allow all those involved in the delivery of education and associated support the opportunity to meet and discuss their experiences and to enable feedback into policy for the future;
- the need to maintain contact with past international students when they return home; and
- the future feasibility of further program delivery offshore;

The Committee supports measures which attract international students to study in Tasmania and any which may assist in retaining school-age students. In the Committee's opinion the need to reduce the flow of international students from Tasmania to other mainland universities to continue their studies is important. Whilst the attraction of cities such as Melbourne and Sydney is strong, the year 13 proposition explained in evidence does deserve further investigation.

From the Committee's point of view there is very little point in filling schools or other educational institutions with international students if their personal needs cannot be adequately catered for.

In addressing the Committee's Terms of Reference the Report does contain an overlapping of certain issues that necessarily involves an element of repetition of facts, opinion and comment.

The Committee gratefully acknowledges all individuals, organisation and departmental representatives, teachers, University, TAFE and school officials and students who provided submissions and gave evidence to the Committee.

The Committee also expresses its appreciation for the administrative support provided to it by Mr David Pearce, Secretary of the Committee and other officers of the Legislative Council and the valued research assistance provided by Ms Marina Fusescu from the Parliamentary Research Service.

Parliament House, Hobart 12 December 2003 Jim Wilkinson MLC Chair

# **Summary of Recommendations**

#### The Committee recommends:

#### Part 1

- (1) That a Forum of education providers and other interested parties convened by the State Government, be held to define the vision for international education in Tasmania to the year 2020.
- (2) That further investigation be undertaken of possible new niche courses and programs.
- (3) That there be pursued the development of relationships with interstate education providers with a view to having international students who are studying interstate spending a semester in Tasmania.
- (4) That links between education, tourism and migration for business be further developed.

#### Part 2

- (1) That the State Government requests the Department of Immigration, Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs to:
  - (a) further streamline the processing of student visa applications and reduce the application fee for student visas to a level that is competitive with other countries offering similar educational opportunities;
  - (b) amend the requirements for pre-payment of living expenses to have regard to all relevant circumstances;
  - (c) treat the Australian Maritime College as a special case in terms of processing applications for student visas for all countries having regard to the College's outstanding record concerning students not overstaying following the expiry of their visas; and
  - (d) not require students to undertake ELICOS courses where they have previously successfully completed educational courses in Australia at the same or a similar institution.
- (2) That all international education providers develop:
  - (a) a formal meet-and-greet process;
  - (b) a formal mentoring program involving volunteer mentors;

(c) a database of information for international students to provide assistance, particularly during the settling-in period.

#### Part 3

- (1) That a detailed assessment be undertaken of present and future student accommodation requirements and identify opportunities to encourage and promote public and private investment in student accommodation.
- (2) That a central register of home-stay families be developed and that such a register be available to all education institutions.
- (3) That the profile of Tasmania as an education destination be increased internationally whenever and wherever possible.

#### Part 4

- (1) That continued opportunities in new markets be explored.
- (2) That the combined marketing of academic programs and recreational pursuits be investigated.
- (3) That future marketing campaigns have an emphasis on parents of students as they, in many cases, make the decisions.
- (4) That the use of familiarisation and study tours be increasingly used to give parents, prospective students and agents an experience of Tasmanian institutions and environment.
- (5) That wherever practicable emphasis be placed on providing marketing material in the language of the country where the marketing effort is focused.
- (6) That there be increased collaboration and co-operation between the various sectors of education providers in marketing and recruiting international students.
- (7) That surveys be conducted in selected markets to assess the type of short or tailored courses which may appeal to prospective students.

#### Part 5

(1) That wherever practicable institutions arrange briefings for international students before they leave their home countries, provide adequate pastoral care while studying in Tasmania and maintain regular contact after they return home.

- (2) That cross-cultural information and training be given to all who have responsibilities to international students.
- (3) That government and community leaders host civic receptions or similar functions to welcome international students to their area wherever appropriate and on an annual basis, if possible.
- (4) That each educational institution establish a mentoring system appropriate to their circumstances, including participants from the country of origin of individual students as well as local students.
- (5) That each international student be provided with the name and contact details of a person from whom they may seek support, help and guidance when required.
- (6) That International Student Officers be given the benefit of a support subcommittee which is representative of various cultural groups.
- (7) That an organization of similar structure and with similar objectives to the former Council for International Student Support (CISSTAS) be established with State Government support and funding assistance.

#### Part 6

- (1) That the strategies identified in the partnership agreement between the State Government and the University of Tasmania, insofar as they relate to offshore programs, be vigorously pursued with a continued focus on collaboration and the pooling of resources.
- (2) That other sector institutions continue to examine the feasibility of finding an off-shore partner to provide and support the delivery of off-shore programs.

#### Part 8

- (1) That an assessment be made of support arrangements provided to teachers involved in the delivery of programs to international students in Government schools.
- (2) That there be increased opportunity for deliberation between teachers and administrators by way of a Forum to be held annually.
- (3) While the Committee acknowledges the high quality educational experience being delivered to full-fee paying international students in many State schools and colleges, it recommends the examination of the concept of the development of educational precincts, that is, a cluster arrangement of high schools and a college for more focused resource allocation.

(4) That the concept of a year 13 transition year of study in Tasmania be fully investigated.

# Introduction

### Appointment and Terms of Reference

On Tuesday, 9 October 2001 the Legislative Council resolved that a Select Committee of Inquiry be appointed "to inquire into and report upon:

- (1) the potential for attracting greater numbers of international students to Tasmania;
- (2) measures that could be undertaken at the Federal, State, Local Government and other levels to enhance that potential;
- (3) any matters which may act as impediments to Tasmania attracting more international students;
- (4) the effectiveness or otherwise of the methods employed by the State Government and Tasmanian educational institutions in marketing and recruiting international students;
- (5) the level and adequacy of the pastoral care and assistance given to international students in Tasmania;
- (6) the potential and action needed for Tasmania to establish educational institutions or courses in other countries and the effectiveness or otherwise of any attempts to do so to date;
- (7) the potential for education to become a primary economic driver in the Tasmanian economy; and
- (8) any other matters relevant to marketing, recruiting and catering for the educational and personal needs and welfare of international students in Tasmania."<sup>2</sup>

The Committee comprised four Members of the Legislative Council – Ms Lin Thorp, Mr Tony Fletcher, Mr. Jim Wilkinson (Chair) and Mr. Don Wing.

The Select Committee ceased its activity on 1 February 2002 due to the prorogation of Parliament and was subsequently re-established on 12 March 2002. The Committee was again not able to conduct business due to the Dissolution of the House of Assembly and the Prorogation of Parliament on 21 June 2002 prior to the State Election.

The Committee was again re-established when the Parliament resumed, this time on 25 September 2002.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Legislative Council Select Committee on International Students – Terms of Reference

### **Reasons for Establishing the Committee**

The matter of international education and Tasmania's performance in attracting international students to study in Tasmania has been an area in which several Members of the Legislative Council have over some time, been particularly interested. Debates in the House on specific legislation including the Universities Registration Amendment Bill 2001 and the University of Tasmania Amendment Bill 2001, together with 'take-note' Motions on Budget Bills and the Estimates Committee examination of Ministers have drawn attention to and advocated the value of attracting international students to study in Tasmania.

These debates have heightened the recognition of the importance of international education. There is a strong desire to see international education in Tasmania develop further.

The Motion to establish a Select Committee of Inquiry was moved in the House by the Honourable Jim Wilkinson MLC on 9 October 2001. Many points were raised in the Debate in relation to attracting international students to Tasmania. In terms of the financial contribution to the State's economy; the impact it has on employment; the potential for collaboration in research; the future networking possibilities so vital in international trade and diplomacy; the broadening of our own understanding of other regions and the cultural interchanges, it was suggested that Tasmania should have a relevant stake in this important area of activity.

In addition, Tasmania has established a reputation for excellence in education. This foundation, together with Tasmania's many other advantages, provides a solid base from which to continue the effort in the marketing of Tasmania as a destination of choice.

It was considered important that a Committee be established to consider Tasmania's role in the education of international students; to understand the extent of the issues; to address aspects of what is a significant growth industry; and at its conclusion to provide the House with a Report with recommendations as to how best Tasmania can meet its true potential as an education destination for overseas students. The Motion was subsequently passed.

### Proceedings

The Committee called for submissions in advertisements placed in the three regional daily newspapers. In addition key stakeholders were contacted and requested to provide information to the Committee.

Forty-five written submissions were received and verbal evidence was given by forty-eight witnesses in Tasmania. In addition, the Committee travelled to Queensland and New South Wales, visited educational institutions and met with key representatives involved in international education.

The Committee met on twenty-six occasions. The Minutes of Proceedings of meetings are included in this Report in Attachment (4).

The witnesses examined are listed in Attachment (1). Documents taken into evidence by the Committee are listed in Attachment (3)

# The Potential

# Part 1

Term of Reference 1 – The potential for attracting greater numbers of international students to Tasmania.

#### **1.1** A Focus on International Students

The competition between other states of Australia and other countries to attract international students is fierce, as governments of all persuasions have identified that international students not only contribute dollars to their economy but also enrich communities with their cultures, while developing a life-long appreciation of ours. The importance that is placed on international education in Queensland for example, is demonstrated by Premier Beattie's establishment of the Queensland Education and Training International Board. The students of today will help guide the political, cultural, and economic development of their countries in the future.

Tasmania has been recording a steady growth in international student numbers in recent years, however the State's share is still relatively small when compared with the rest of Australia. This is illustrated in Table 1: Time Series of Overseas Student Enrolments by State/Territory 1994 to 2001, and Table 2: Overseas Student Enrolments by State/Territory and Major Sector, 2000 and 2001 at the end of this Part.

If Tasmania is to attract more students to its shores, we must identify what factors influence where these students wish to further their education and then direct our efforts accordingly.

#### 1.2 The Decision to Study Overseas

In addition to Australia there are many countries offering the opportunity to study overseas including the United States, United Kingdom, Canada, New Zealand and others.

The reasons why students make a decision to study overseas are many and indeed varied. These include:

- relatives have studied overseas;
- scholarships are offered;
- the advantage of a Western education;
- more likely to get a university place after completing secondary and senior secondary school;
- gain status by speaking fluent English;
- fulfilling requirements of a twinning program;
- long-term plan to migrate or start a business overseas;
- permanent residency is easier to obtain after you graduate; and

• parents consider that their child is not going to obtain a university place in their home country.<sup>3</sup>

#### **1.3** Tasmania as a Destination

There were again many reasons given as to why students particularly decide to come to Tasmania to undertake study. Evidence suggested the three primary reasons were as follow:

#### • A friend or relative has studied in Tasmania previously

The Committee found generally in evidence that students returning home after undertaking study in Tasmania have been able to tell of a very positive experience. The submission from Ms Lisa Butler and Mr Rick Snell from the University of Tasmania (UTAS) Law School included the following passage:

"The approach to attracting international students should not be primarily market and project driven. A greater emphasis should be placed on fostering existing networks and relationships, consolidating relationships already made. A key to fostering existing networks is the development of sustained relationships that endure and continue once students as graduates leave this country and return home to pursue their professional careers. The development of a sustained relationship requires that during their time in Tasmania students receive a high level of education and also a unique and premium level of personal and pastoral care."<sup>4</sup>

At the UTAS Law School, for example, contact has been maintained with graduates via emails, visits by staff to home countries and return visits by graduates. The feedback from this approach has been significant. It has shown that the students who studied in Tasmania have a pride in having earned a degree from the UTAS. They display an eagerness to assist the University and the wider interests of Tasmania. In effect they see themselves as ambassadors or representatives for the UTAS.

An email received by Mr Rick Snell from the UTAS Law School from a graduate stated the following:

"nothing like word of mouth to promote the Uni and I am sure that none of the graduates I know have anything bad to say about the UTAS. ...I am always proud to advertise the fact that I am a UTAS graduate...the fact is that the legal fraternity here views the UTAS degree very highly especially since some of our graduates now occupy very senior posts in the legal field..."<sup>5</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Jan Kuplis, submission, April 2002, p. 2-3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Lisa Butler and Rick Snell, UTAS Law School, submission, April 2002, p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Email from Mere Rakuita – law graduate from Fiji

#### • A scholarship has been received

From the UTAS perspective the Committee is aware that since the introduction of the International Scholarships Program in 1999 there has been improvement in the quality of applicants and in their academic standards.

This program does attract higher quality international students to the State and offers a twenty-five per cent fee reduction.

#### • Cost, program quality and lifestyle

Evidence generally suggests that the Tasmanian lifestyle is appealing. There is however, a different type and style of study process to which students must adapt. Some students have a long term plan to bring their families to Tasmania and start a business here. Students can undertake the course of their choice. Many are fulfilling a requirement of a twinning program. Generally a twinning program involves students undertaking parts of their study program in educational institutions in two countries. Evidence suggests also that Tasmania is seen as a safe place to study and that smaller classes and access to teachers are positive advantages.

It is issues such as smaller class sizes, better access to teachers, safety and lifestyle that are often deciding factors for students to study in Tasmania as opposed to another Australian state. Mr Paul Rigby, Director of International Services at the UTAS said:

"There is a perception that the University of Tasmania offers a reasonable balance between the quality of the institution and the program it offers, a long history, a strong reputation, an old institution, if not a sandstone, but at least up there in that top bracket of Australian universities; and cost of the program.

We attract perhaps a slightly more price sensitive part of a market where students are looking at a balance between the quality of an education, the cost of attending that institution, the cost of living and the quality of life offered in the location.

Tasmania, not only at University level but at all levels, looks to sell a combination of Tasmanian lifestyle which is affordable, tuition fees which are towards the lower end of the scale by national comparison, combined with a perception that the education is high quality."<sup>6</sup>

A further witness, representing the National Liaison Committee for International Students (NLC) Ms Ching Ching Ko said:

"I think the most important thing is the fees of the University, which are much lower than other universities"<sup>7</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Paul Rigby, transcript, December 2002, p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Ching Ching Ko, National Liaison Committee for International Students, transcript, November 2002, p. 2

#### **1.4** The Potential of the Educational Sectors to Attract Students

The Committee notes evidence which indicates that growth in international student numbers is limited by certain impediments. Certain of these impediments have application across all sectors and include the following:

- the limited number of institutions in the State;
- the availability of suitable accommodation;
- the relative smallness of local institutions;
- the desire by institutions to maintain a balanced cultural mix;
- competition from larger and better resourced institutions;
- the natural 'pull' and attraction of larger metropolitan areas;
- isolated geographical location;
- the student visa requirements;
- for post-secondary students, the greater opportunities for part-time work available in other centres;
- the smallness of ethnic communities from major source countries;
- the lack of "mass market" postgraduate course work programs;
- the limited numbers that can be accommodated in popular courses at the UTAS;
- small population and a perceived lack of activities;
- no direct international flights, resulting in extra cost of travel to Tasmania;
- relatively small number of international tourists to Tasmania.

There is the potential to grow existing international student numbers given appropriate quality marketing, with the inclusion of more institutions and with accommodation issues being satisfied. However, it may not be in our best interests to have a disproportionate number of international students to local students. The proportion of overseas students does need to be appropriately balanced and determined in light of the following factors:

- projected available school places;
- ethnic balance;
- accommodation on and off campus;
- available English language teachers and language and classroom support;
- school and individual student support services;
- ratio of international students to each class and teachers;
- community acceptance of international students.

Attracting European and native English speaking students to Tasmania will continue to be difficult. If this is to be done much more advertising money needs to be spent on raising the profile and recognition of Tasmania as a desirable destination in terms of education quality, job opportunities and lifestyle.

If Tasmania can raise its profile and provide good education packages, it can confidently enter new markets anywhere in the world. To do this however, Tasmania needs to be recognised as a world-class destination through widespread advertising and promotion before we can expect to benefit from an increased education market share. There is a definite need to develop links between education, tourism and migration for business.

The Committee believes that Tasmania has considerable potential for increasing overseas student enrolments by developing niche programs aimed specifically at niche markets. This coupled with the development of a research institute would attract students from all over the world, including Europe and America. Tasmania therefore needs to be even more entrepreneurial in its approach in order to maximise future potential.

Opportunities may exist for joint ventures with other universities both within and outside of Australia.

Semester or 'sandwich' courses of six months in an interstate or overseas university, with six months study in Tasmania. Shared semester courses may well represent further potential to capitalize on aspects of Tasmania's uniqueness.

The matter of work experience placement for international students was also considered. The Committee understands the difficulties and constraints in accessing work experience placements for not only international students but domestic students as well. At the tertiary level, in disciplines such as engineering and health science, it is extremely difficult to find work experience placements. Any measures developed between education providers, Government and private enterprise in terms of work experience placements for students generally would be a welcome initiative.

There is little doubt that Tasmania needs to be as competitive as possible in the international student market. Tasmanian providers must endeavour to develop programs which attract students. As indicated in evidence this includes:

"developing programs that are going to teach the teachers who are going to teach these kids and give us the kind of recognition that will make the children of the students educated here want to come back."<sup>8</sup>

#### 1.4.1 Schools

The potential to grow the School sector is limited mainly because of Tasmania's present limited capacity to accommodate students in housing and in schools. There is a real need to build student accommodation on college sites in the future and to involve more schools in the program for attracting overseas students.

There is however, further potential to develop package courses and try-beforeyou-buy study tours which could be offered during holiday periods. These courses could focus on a particular niche market among younger students who can take advantage of their own school holidays to get a taste of study in Tasmania. Holiday programs like this have been successful in the past and have provided good returns. These programs can be developed in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Associate Professor Richard Herr, transcript, October 2002, p. 4

collaboration with individual schools.<sup>9</sup> Programs during holiday periods, including during the longer summer break would involve institutions making facilities available. In terms of accommodation, it may require an assessment of the commercial viability of utilising boarding houses and other similar facilities.

Of course, younger students coming alone, either for short programs or otherwise, raise duty of care issues which must be addressed. They place a great deal of responsibility on home-stay families, counselling services, teachers, principals and the community as a whole. Encouraging younger students to come in groups may well alleviate some of this pressure as there are usually group leaders who can assume some responsibility.

#### 1.4.2 TAFE

The Committee believes there are future opportunities for development in this sector.

Evidence received indicates that the concept of technical and further education (TAFE) is only starting to be understood in some Asian countries. The contention is, that once there is a wider acceptance of TAFE and it is seen as a desirable pathway to university for overseas students who may have difficulties with the English language, then potential target areas will present themselves. Evidence suggests that over time TAFE may well be in a prime position to expand and develop its onshore courses for international students.<sup>10</sup>

#### 1.4.3 University

This sector continues to be the largest growth area. Innovative marketing and profiling needs to continue if Tasmania is to increase the numbers of international students at the tertiary level.

The potential in the post-graduate area is increasing due to the ability to deliver parts of courses off-shore. This enables students to study part-time and in their own time, and does not mean that they have to travel away for periods of time, leaving their families and employment behind. In developing more offshore programs enrolments may well increase.

#### 1.4.4 Special niche courses

Evidence was received concerning Tasmania's island status and relative geographic isolation. There are institutions like the World Bank, the United Nations, the Asian Development Bank, and others, that buy educational services. As Associate Professor Richard Herr said:

"What are we going to sell them? Now if you think you are going to sell them a leafy suburban high school you have got another think coming because that's not what they are in the business of trying to buy. What

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Jan Kuplis, op.cit., p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> ibid, p. 4

they are trying to buy is specialist training, specialist education and that means looking at what it is about Tasmania that makes us special, makes a desirable destination."<sup>11</sup>

The Committee heard that what Tasmania needs to do is endeavour to identify opportunities that readily may not be available in other places – opportunities which have special appeal to people in other places.

One of the opportunities put to the Committee by Associate Professor Herr, is the development of a Tasmanian centre for island studies.

What Tasmania does have is a special affinity with countries which share the unique problems associated with being an island. An example was provided where the contract for training the Solomon Island's police force was awarded to Victoria several years ago. A comparison was drawn between the similar responsibilities of a Tasmanian police officer and those of an officer in the Solomon Islands - the responsibility to deal with crime, the protection of the environment together with maritime law enforcement. The unique island status opportunity is the point being made here. The opportunity to assist with specialist training and support, not only for pacific island countries particularly but others also, is worthy of greater investigation. In terms of a Western environment, with conditions which are similar in many ways to those experienced by other smaller island countries, Tasmania is well positioned to deliver specialised programs on how to cope with life and conditions on an Additional examples were put forward to the Committee. island. These included aspects of bush fire-fighting in an island environment, restoration of mining sites in coastal zones and harbour and aquaculture development.

The "island studies" concept is noted by the Committee as being one worthy of further consideration.

### Recommendations

The Committee recommends:

- (1) That a Forum of education providers and other interested parties, convened by the State Government, be held to define the vision for international education in Tasmania to the year 2020.
- (2) That further investigation be undertaken of possible new niche courses and programs.
- (3) That there be pursued the development of relationships with interstate education providers with a view to having international students who are studying interstate spending a semester in Tasmania.
- (4) That links between education, tourism and migration for business be further developed.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Jan Kuplis, op.cit, p. 6

		Change		Change											
State/Territory	1994	94-95	1995	95-96	1996	96-97	1997	97-98	1998	98-99	1999	99-00	2000	00-01	2001
New South Wales	36 627	16.6%	42 710	19.6%	51 070	0.8%	51 475	-7.2%	47 764	5.2%	50 250	14.8%	57 674	28.9%	74 329
Victoria	21 332	21.3%	25 866	22.3%	31 631	9.1%	34 499	1.0%	34 829	6.3%	37 017	14.5%	42 391	16.2%	49 248
Queensland	14 273	22.7%	17 517	29.7%	22 725	0.0%	22 720	-11.4%	20 127	1.3%	20 390	23.1%	25 103	35.4%	33 990
Western Australia	12 661	21.5%	15 380	21.1%	18 627	-2.9%	18 089	-9.4%	16 395	-1.6%	16 139	4.4%	16 850	14.6%	19 316
South Australia	4 759	13.8%	5 414	18.2%	6 397	12.0%	7 163	-22.0%	5 584	-0.5%	5 554	11.4%	6 189	17.0%	7 239
Australian Capital Territory	2 489	5.4%	2 623	7.6%	2 823	-10.8%	2 517	-0.2%	2 513	-5.7%	2 369	24.2%	2 943	28.5%	3 782
Tasmania	1 230	11.7%	1 374	12.4%	1 545	-0.6%	1 535	-11.9%	1 353	-3.8%	1 302	22.4%	1 594	15.4%	1 839
Northern Territory	200	13.0%	226	12.4%	254	15.0%	292	15.4%	337	4.2%	351	23.9%	435	13.3%	493
Multistate	151	12.6%	170	-9.4%	154	-16.2%	129	-96.9%	4	200.0%	12	1508.3%	193	91.7%	370
Total Onshore	93 722	18.7%	111 280	21.5%	135 226	2.4%	138 419	-6.9%	128 906	3.5%	133 384	15.0%	153 372	24.3%	190 606
Offshore Students	8 431	30.8%	11 026	13.9%	12 563	29.8%	16 309	38.2%	22 538	30.8%	29 481	18.4%	34 905	22.6%	42 802
Total	102 153	19.7%	122 306	20.8%	147 789	4.7%	154 728	-2.1%	151 444	7.5%	162 865	15.6%	188 277	24.0%	233 408

### Table 1: Time Series of Overseas Student Enrolments by State/Territory 1994 to 2001

Source – Australian Education International (AEI) year 2001 Final International Student Numbers

### Table 2:Overseas Student Enrolments by State/Territory and Major Sector, 2000 and 2001

Onshore Delivery											Offshore Delivery Higher Education		Total Onshore and Offshore	
	Higher Education		Vocational Education		School Education		ELICOS		Total Onshore					
State/Territory	2000	2001	2000	2001	2000	2001	2000	2001	2000	2001	2000	2001	2000	2001
New South Wales	22 172	25 972	15 655	20 925	2 640	3 662	17 207	23 770	57 674	74 329	10 322	12 497	67 996	86 826
Victoria	22 038	25 185	8 249	9 455	4 782	5 349	7 322	9 259	42 391	49 248	10 896	12 884	53 287	62 132
Queensland	13 679	18 487	2 512	3 640	2 481	2 801	6 431	9 062	25 103	33 990	4 159	5 399	29 262	39 389
Western Australia	8 502	9 178	2 949	3 889	1 713	1 637	3 686	4 612	16 850	19 316	5 224	6 347	22 074	25 663
South Australia	3 349	3 713	920	1 300	621	660	1 299	1 566	6 189	7 239	3 407	4 670	9 596	11 909
Australian Capital Territory	1 817	2 261	318	473	436	534	372	514	2 943	3 782	320	642	3 263	4 424
Tasmania	791	912	120	118	282	273	401	536	1 594	1 839	489	303	2 083	2 142
Northern Territory	176	193	36	43	174	196	49	61	435	493	5	6	440	499
Multistate	193	370	0	0	0	0	0	0	193	370	83	54	276	424
TOTAL	72 717	86 271	30 759	39 843	13 129	15 112	36 767	49 380	153 372	190 606	34 905	42 802	188 277	233 408

Source – Australian Education International (AEI) year 2001 Final International Student Numbers

Term of Reference 2 – Measures that could be undertaken at the Federal, State, Local Government and other levels to enhance that potential.

### 2.1 Federal Level

At the Federal Government level matters relating to student visas are of considerable importance.

This subject was dealt with by many witnesses in submissions and in evidence given to the Committee. The manner in which student visa applications were dealt with by the Australian processing authorities was seen as detrimental to Tasmania's attempts to attract more international students.

The joint submission of the former Department of State Development (now the Department of Economic Development, DED); the Department of Education (DOE); TAFE and the UTAS put considerable emphasis on lengthy visa processing times and the effect of recent changes to visa regulations:

"New Commonwealth legislation relating to providers of courses to international students, and changes to immigration requirements, came into effect on 1 July 2001.

It is noted that visa processing times have only marginally improved and in some countries such as the People's Republic of China, is still running at approximately 12 weeks. This lengthy time period is a frustration to applicants and potentially, could impact negatively on Australia through students choosing alternate destinations. Tasmanian Government Schools have lost students to New Zealand, where visa processing times are shorter and requirements are, seemingly, less rigorous.

The University of Tasmania has been involved in a twinning program in Vietnam with a local University for six years, whereby students spend up to the first two years studying an Engineering degree in Vietnam before transferring to Tasmania for the remainder of their course. The changes to visa requirements of 1 July 2001 have significantly impacted on the program with parents concerned about their capacity to meet the new financial requirements for visa approval. This in the future may see the students in the twinning program transferring to New Zealand or other countries, which do not have such stringent visa requirements. The program also faces increased in-country competition from other Australian universities establishing campuses in Vietnam and also increased marketing activity from institutions from other countries, which will impact on the University of Tasmania's recruitment in the future from Vietnam.

Any reduction in visa processing times by Australia's overseas missions, as well as a possible review of the visa changes of 1 July 2001

concerning financial requirements for visa approvals, would be welcomed.

The immigration changes of July 2001 now allow graduates of post secondary institutions to apply for permanent residence status onshore, as opposed to having to leave Australia and apply offshore.

This change is regarded positively by the respondents in that it is likely to favour Australia as an education destination firstly, and thereafter a permanent home".<sup>12</sup>

Visa issues are also having an impact elsewhere. Mr Ron Perschky, Principal of the WEC Missionary Training College in Launceston said in his submission:

'This year [2002] for the first time we had five students refused visas to study in Tasmania. I understand from my colleagues at the Maritime College that they too experienced similar refusals especially for diploma courses. Most of the refusals were to students who seemingly met immigration requirements but were refused visas by the local consular officials.'<sup>13</sup>

Another concern for the WEC Missionary Training College is that Korean students have been placed in a higher risk category by the Department of Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs. Mature-age students have been asked to post guarantees of \$29,000 in order to obtain a visa and must also show evidence of capacity to pay fees and living expenses. As a result no new Korean students were enrolled in 2002. Mature-age students with children are further burdened by having to pay \$3,500 a year for a primary-age child plus \$1,800 for English as a Second Language (ESL) teaching if that is needed.<sup>14</sup>

Further, it is clear that the student visa application fee to study in Australia is considerably higher than the fee charged by competitor countries, such as the United Kingdom (UK) and the United States of America (USA). The Committee was told it is the highest in the world. Currently the Australian fee is AUD\$315.

In the UK, a student visa costs AUD\$101 (£36).

In the USA, there are two fees, an application fee and an issuance fee. The application fee is AUD\$190. The issuance fee varies according to the nationality on the passport. For example, for:

- Australian passport holders, the issuance fee is AUD\$199.50;
- French and Indian passport holders, it is AUD\$142.50; and
- Sri Lankan passport holders, it is AUD\$180.50.

For some countries, for example, passport holders from China, Indonesia, Korea and South Africa there is no issuance fee.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Joint submission-Department of State Development; Department of Education; the Institute of TAFE Tasmania; and the University of Tasmania, April 2002, p. 2-3

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Ron Perschky, Principal, The WEC Missionary Training College, submission, April 2002, p. 1
 <sup>14</sup> ibid, p. 1-2

In addition, there is evidence that the processing time for applications for UK and USA student visas was of the order of two to four days in some Asian countries including India, Bangladesh and Pakistan, compared with between four to six months for Australia.

Mr Alan Campbell, General Manager, Investment, Trade and Development of the DED, gave the following apt evidence to the Committee:

"But the point about the visas is it must be seen in the context of what our competitors are doing. This is the point about it all. If everybody is taking five months, so what? But if New Zealand's taking three weeks as they were at one stage, I don't know what they're doing at the moment, and we're taking five months we are going to lose students to New Zealand and we certainly have lost to New Zealand. So that is the point I want to make. That we have to be at the benchmark of our competitors otherwise we are going to lose".<sup>15</sup>

Later in his evidence Mr Campbell said:

"I think on the visa issue the competition situation of Australia vis-a-vis other countries must always be there. We must compete".<sup>16</sup>

With ample evidence of prolonged delays in processing Australian student visa applications from some countries, coupled with the much higher application fees payable for Australian student visas, it is proving very difficult for Australian institutions to compete in many instances.

A prime example is the Australian Maritime College (AMC) located in northern Tasmania. The Committee received evidence that these factors have led to a substantial and disturbing decline in enrolments at the College, especially from India, Bangladesh, Pakistan and Sri Lanka. These countries have provided a large number of students in past years.

As these countries have been placed in a category of high risk countries by the Department of Immigration, Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs (DIMIA), the processing of their student visa applications is more thorough and time consuming than is the case with other countries.

This exacerbates the already existing problems of higher application fees and the inaccessibility of processing places. On this point, the Committee has been given to understand that in India, for example, applications are made and processed only in New Delhi. This means that students from other parts of India often need to travel very long distances, and remain away from their homes for considerable periods, while visa applications are being processed.

In the case of prospective AMC students, this usually means that they are unable to work and receive income during the period their application for a student visa is being processed - up to six months. Married applicants need to support their families, so it becomes a very costly exercise.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Alan Campbell, transcript, November 2003, p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> ibid, p. 4

Given the travel required, it should be possible for the Australian authorities to conduct all necessary interviews and examinations in a shorter time to enable applicants to return to their homes as soon as possible, thereby keeping their expenses to a minimum.

Evidence was received that in one Asian country a student was required to visit the Australian High Commission Office on a number of occasions for interview, several weeks apart. This involved extra travelling costs, as well as the loss of income through inability to work during the whole process. The information required could quite possibly have been provided at one interview.

It is difficult to understand why applicants need to be so inconvenienced and put to so much extra expense and why applications are not processed more expeditiously.

The risk of students overstaying or breaching visa conditions in Australia is given as justification for lengthy delays in processing applications from perceived high risk countries. The Committee was told that in the case of the AMC there was no known case of a student overstaying. This is no doubt due to the fact that most of the AMC students from the countries previously mentioned are of mature age, usually married with children and who are anxious to return to their families and to full-time paid employment. In addition to maintaining themselves in Australia they have the responsibility of maintaining their families in their home countries and usually have no income or any employment while they are at the AMC.

It is not surprising therefore that student numbers from these countries have declined alarmingly at the AMC.

The advice received from DIMIA in relation to previous history of an educational institution stated that no exceptions can be made to student visa requirements, including where a particular education provider has a history of complying students. The advice further stated that it is the applicant, not the provider, who must satisfy the visa requirements.<sup>17</sup>

Advice from DIMIA states that in Tasmania during the period 2001-02 there were eleven students overstaying their student visa.

The AMC listed as one of the impediments to Tasmania attracting more international students the following:

"the cost and difficulty in obtaining a student visa and extensions to such visas, where legitimately required. It is much easier and cheaper to obtain a visa to England."<sup>18</sup>

In giving evidence to the Committee, Mr Robert Jones, from the AMC said:

"The visa issue is a real issue. It has had an impact on students from the sub-continent, numbers of them. We understand the reasons why the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Abul Rizvi, First Assistant Secretary, Migration and Temporary Entry, DIMIA, additional information, March 2003

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Australian Maritime College, submission, May 2002, p. 2

current regime is there, it does apply consistency and transparency; there's no question about that, and that's what the objective of it was. We have been given a good ear both at State - I know the State Government has supported us - and at the Federal level, as to our issues, but it has been made clear to us that any solutions are going to be from within the current legislative framework and that we won't be given special treatment and there are options being examined to assist us in that area."<sup>19</sup>

It is regrettable that the AMC is not treated as a special case because of its impeccable record with students returning to their home countries. If current practices prevail they will no doubt continue to have a most detrimental effect on the enrolment at this important Australian tertiary institution.

Mr Jones viewed the problem as a comparative one. He said:

"You walk into the Australian High Commission - you walk through the door, you've just got off a ship, you're earning \$100,000 a year as a second mate and you want to get your Master's ticket - and if they give you a book and a heap of papers this thick and say you have to read this, you have to do this, you have to do all that and you walk out the door and over to the British High Commission and they say, 'Here's your visa in 10 days, son', you vote with your feet. So I think it is more that other countries are facilitating these people and we're not facilitating them."<sup>20</sup>

The Committee is of the opinion that in view of these circumstances the AMC should be treated as a special case for the purpose of processing and issuing student visas.

The following Table lists offshore visa processing times for student visas for the period 1 July 2002 to 31 October 2002:

	Minimum Processing	Average Processing	Maximum Processing
Country	Time (days)	Time (days)	Time (days)
BANGLADESH Average	9.67	29.26	121.17
CHINA, PEOPLE'S REPULIC OF Average	17.57	96.84	291.14
INDIA Average	15.86	57.30	178.43
PAKISTAN Average	63.50	87.39	166.83
SRI LANKA Average	15.33	39.74	125.83

#### Table 3:

Source: DIMIA submission March 2003

In terms of the countries list in the above Table, DIMIA has offices which perform student visa processing in the following locations:

◆ Adelaide Offshore Processing Centre – Beijing, People's Republic of China;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Robert Jones, AMC, transcript, October 2002, p. 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> ibid, p. 18

- New Delhi, India;
- Colombo, Sri Lanka;
- Islamabad, Pakistan; and
- Dhaka, Bangladesh

Mr Abul Rizvi, First Assistant Secretary, Migration and Temporary Entry, DIMIA, advised that in March 2002, a pilot Chinese student repatriation project was implemented whereby Chinese student visa applicants in the People's Republic of China (PRC) lodge their applications through the Offshore Processing Centre (OPC). The pilot was designed to manage the large and increasing number of student visa applications from the PRC, to reduce overall processing times and enable DIMIA offices in China to focus more on integrity checking.

Mr Rizvi further advised that a staged approach towards processing has been adopted under the model, allowing OPC to develop appropriate skills to identify non-bona fide applications. Phase 1 involved the OPC in providing basic functions such as registration, receipting, preparation of files and acknowledgement letters (forwarded to Beijing for dispatch) as well as responding to client enquiries.

The pilot moved to phase 2 on 1 June 2002. In addition to phase 1 tasks, the OPC began undertaking pre-visa assessments (PVA) of applications and making recommendations to Beijing. Beijing re-assessed the cases and sent PVA approval letters to applicants if it concurred with the OPC recommendation. Beijing finalises all cases.

Phase 3 arrangements commenced from 3 February 2003 and applies to all applications received by the OPC. The OPC processes fully all lower risk cases thus reducing the number of dual-assessment cases. It will continue to undertake preliminary assessment of some higher risk cases. Beijing makes additional checks on these cases for fraud, makes a final decision and provides feedback to the OPC where variations occur.

In terms of measures which may speed up the processing of student visa applications the Committee was advised by Mr Rizvi that processing times are something the Department strives to reduce wherever they can.

The Committee was advised that:

"DIMIA has already taken a number of measures to reduce processing times. These measures include the repatriation of certain student caseloads to centralised processing centres in Australia and the introduction of eVisa initiatives enabling the increased use of the internet for both electronic lodgement and electronic grant of student visas.

DIMIA is acutely conscious of the need for quick turn-around times between application and grant. Processing times are often affected by the time it takes for applicants to submit medicals and provide requested documentation. The current student visa criteria should assist decisionmakers to make a faster and more consistent determinations as they clearly set out objective requirements. At the same time, we cannot compromise on measures that ensure high levels of integrity and security."<sup>21</sup>

The Committee welcomes and commends the decision by DIMIA which allows all assessment level 1 students to make application and be granted student visas over the Internet.

To reduce the time that international students are separated from their families and away from their countries the AMC has shortened the length of a number of courses, whilst retaining the same content. It is to be hoped that similar consideration will be shown by DIMIA to international students proposing to attend the AMC. This would be likely to have a dramatic effect in reversing the severe decline in international student numbers at the AMC.

The Committee is very mindful of the need for DIMIA to make adequate investigations to be satisfied of the credentials, genuineness, health and character of the student applicants. Nevertheless, in most cases, it should be possible for Australia to process student visa applications within benchmark time frames met by other countries.

The report, Tasmanian Industry Audits: Government Services, Department of State Development (1999) recommended that:

"The Government make strong representations to the Federal Government to ease entry requirements for Asian students, particularly those from India."<sup>22</sup>

Student visa restrictions were seen to be an identified weakness in the recruitment of students in a number of submissions, including those from the UTAS and the DOE.

In a paper entitled "Exporting Excellence - Selling Tasmanian Education to Indonesian School Students", Miss Kate Chipman during an internship with the Honourable Sue Napier MHA concluded in her Executive Summary that:

"Visas and immigration need to be more streamlined".<sup>23</sup>

The UTAS is less affected than the AMC, as evidenced by the following passage from the evidence given by the Deputy Vice-Chancellor, Professor Rudi Lidl:

"...No, we are really lucky in that respect and, as the numbers indicate, our numbers increased quite sharply because our source countries are not predominantly in the category of the AMC's source countries. So we get our big numbers from Malaysia, Singapore. The only one which is a problem area is Vietnam again - I mentioned earlier on we have about 100 students from Vietnam and the annual intake may be about 30 or around that figure - and that is because the restrictions on visas and the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Abul Rizvi, First Assistant Secretary, Migration and Temporary Entry, DIMIA, op.cit., March 2003

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Tasmanian Industry Audits: Government Services, 1999, p. 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Kate Chipman, Parliamentary Intern Paper, No. 278 of 2001, Executive Summary

impost of financial proof and so on is probably dampening the potential numbers we could have from Vietnam."<sup>24</sup>

Evidence from Mrs Helen Cox, Director of the Tasmanian College of English, contended that new student visa regulations have adversely affected the English language industry markets of South America, Korea, China and Vietnam.<sup>25</sup> Ms Cox said in her submission:

"Lobbying by the relevant state bodies, and contribution to the DIMIA consultation process could be extremely useful for Tasmanian education providers in future and for those present visa issues."<sup>26</sup>

The submission made the following further points:

"2.1 Federal Level

The new student visa regulations introduced last year [2001] have impeded many students in obtaining visas to travel to Australia to study. The new student visa regulations have in many cases discouraged educational agents in a number of countries from promoting Australia as a study destination. Many of these education agencies have chosen to promote other destinations (a good example is New Zealand) rather than Australia.

Decisions of the category of each country and therefore the visa conditions of the student visa were often made by DIMIA without proper consultation or consideration of the views of the overseas posts or recommendation of the overseas posts."<sup>27</sup>

Ms Cox also referred to working holiday visas designed to allow holders to work for twelve months, to travel and to study English for a limited period of twelve weeks. Visa holders may spend a maximum of only three months with any one employer and a maximum of three months studying the English language.

Ms Cox questioned why English language study was limited to three months and not, say, six months which would bring in double the fees to the Australian economy. She expressed the view that:

"It would be to Tasmania's benefit if the study restrictions of the working holiday maker were to match the work rights they now enjoy, that is, the opportunity to study for 12 months, restricted to 12 weeks in one destination".<sup>28</sup>

The Committee notes that the processing of working holiday visas is being done exclusively at the DIMIA Headquarters in Hobart and appears to be working most efficiently. This has created significant extra employment in Tasmania.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, transcript, October 2002, p. 22

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Helen Cox, submission, April 2002, p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> ibid, p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> ibid, p. 1-2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> ibid, p. 2

The Committee questions if similar procedures could be employed in processing student visa applications, at least from countries assessed as low risk.

Ms Cox also noted in her evidence that the 2001 changes to visa regulations meant that countries were categorised in terms of risk levels and that:

"...related to the methodology that DIMIA have used there was a greater over-stay risk related to Korean visa holders, which meant that Korea became a high-risk country in terms of immigration and a number of extra measures were introduced, extra hurdles that students have to jump over to get to Australia to study.

They examined the numbers of students who over-stayed their visa, and unfortunately Korean students slipped into the next bracket, and statistics show they are slightly higher risk. It was very minimal.

The upshot is that, whereas prior to these changes to the visa regulations, a good many students came to Australia from South Korea, the number of English language students from this source country has declined significantly".<sup>29</sup>

The experience of the WEC Missionary Training College (Worldview Centre for Intercultural Studies) at St Leonards in northern Tasmania shows that some of the student visa regulations are applied inappropriately – even absurdly.

The following is a summary of the content of the College's written submission and the evidence given to the Committee by Dr Alan Pang, Academic Dean of the College.

The College was established in 1956 to train people to serve as missionaries in different parts of the world. The organisation under which the College operates – the Worldview Centre for Intercultural Studies - has workers in about forty countries on six or seven continents of the world. It has had about a thousand graduates and for the last twenty five years it has taken international students in increasing numbers. In October 2002 there were forty-three students studying at the College of whom about twelve or thirteen were overseas students.

In this Christian College students are trained for cross-cultural work. They study biblical, theological and intercultural subjects such as world religions, cross-cultural communications and cultural anthropology. Courses also include aid and development. Some graduates go on to work with aid organizations.

According to the College's submission and Dr Pang's evidence, none of its international students has ever overstayed his or her visa and, until the past year [2002], none of its international students has been refused a visa.<sup>30</sup>

In 2002 however, for the first time, five students were refused visas to study at the College in Tasmania.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Helen Cox, transcript, October 2002, p. 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Ron Perschky, Prinicpal, WEC Missionary Training College, op.cit., p.1 and Dr Alan Pang, transcript, October 2002, p. 6

The following extract from the College's written submission highlights the absurdity of the situation described:

"Most of the refusals were to students who seemingly met immigration requirements but were refused visas by the local consular officials. For example, two potential students were refused visas on the grounds that because they were not 'missionaries', they therefore did not need training to become missionaries. Do we refuse visas for people wishing to study medicine because they are not already doctors?"<sup>31</sup>

In his evidence Dr Pang spoke of the detrimental effect of a DIMIA monetary requirement which was not relevant to the particular circumstances pertaining to the College. He said:

"Worldview is a residential college, so when students pay their fees and it is advertised in the CRISCOS, on the internet system and so forth, we put a lump sum which includes tuition, food and accommodation, which is about \$5,000 a year for a single person. Our problem is that the overseas posts, whether it is Korea or India or Venezuela, will look at that and say they need to see evidence that a student has this money to pay Worldview, plus the air tickets, plus the general policy of AUD\$12,000 a year for miscellaneous expenses of the students. We can understand it as a general policy, but we are a residential college, and our fees cover food and accommodation as well as tuition. Therefore we felt that the general policy of AUD\$12,000 they like to see evidence of before they get a visa is not valid for our college".<sup>32</sup>

Dr Pang went on to say:

"that usually the students need only about \$10 a week pocket money – which is more than enough, and there is no need for them to show evidence that they have AUD\$12,000 a year – and if they come for three years they need to show evidence that they have AUD\$36,000 for those three years, which is just impossible for them to show evidence of and therefore they did not get the visas to come to our college".<sup>33</sup>

In the College's written submission, Principal Ron Perschky said:

"For Korean married couples that has meant huge sums of money. This year we enrolled no new Korean students because of the finance involved and the fact that they are able to go to New Zealand for similar courses without such guarantees. In the past Koreans have always constituted a large percentage of our overseas students, especially those wishing to study English. We understand from official figures that Korea was considered a large market for Australian education. The present restrictions and requirements of guarantees will only help to shrink that market".<sup>34</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Ron Perschky, op.cit., p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Dr Alan Pang, transcript, op.cit., p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> ibid, p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Ron Perschky, op.cit., p. 1-2

A further problem is experienced when dependent children are involved. Whereas by and large the Department has waived a monetary requirement in this respect, it is now being enforced.

The submission went on to say:

"The education of children of international students is also a concern. The requirement of AUD\$3,500 per annum for primary age children of international students (an extra AUD\$1,800 for ESL teaching if the children need English) is also a hindrance to mature age students studying in Tasmania. This requirement has not been enforced by the Department of Education for deserving cases and we are extremely grateful to them, but it is still a concern".<sup>35</sup>

The Committee heard evidence from a student from India who had completed two successful courses at the AMC and who, at the successful completion of the second course, applied in Australia for a student visa to enable him to undertake a further course. After waiting in Australia for three weeks at considerable cost and loss of income, he was eventually informed that he would need to make that application in his own country. That information was received after he had transferred funds to Australia at a considerable loss, only to be required to transfer them back and again suffering a financial loss.

Once back in his country he began the process of applying for a student visa. The Australian immigration officials informed him that he was required to pass the International English Language Testing System (IELTS). This was notwithstanding the fact that he had already completed two successful courses at a tertiary institution in Australia. As he was then too late to study in that semester he went back to sea, because he could not afford to do otherwise.

After some months at sea, reestablishing his finances, he again applied for a student visa and was told he was required to undertake the English language course. He did this at a cost of AUD\$2,100. As he was therefore unable to go to sea for three months, he further suffered the loss of three months' income. This of course he could ill afford to do.

The processing of his application in his own country required several visits to the only city in his country which processed student visa applications. These visits were necessary for interviews and medical tests. This all took several months during which time he was unable to earn any income but had to support himself and his family.

By comparison the processing of student visas for the USA and the UK takes only a matter of hours.

When these facts were put to Ms Jan Kuplis, who has had extensive experience with international students and international education, her response was:

"It is absurd and that 10 week course (IELTS) is applicable to new students not to returned students"<sup>36</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Ron Perschky, op.cit., p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Jan Kuplis, transcript, June 2002, p. 29

The submission by the Friends' School contained the following comments concerning the visa issue:

"There is one significant impediment which is worthy of effort to remove. The difficulty of obtaining entry visas to Australia. Even in the most desirable source country a period of several weeks to even months elapses before a student visa is issued. Our major competition the UK, USA, New Zealand and Canada issue visas quickly, sometimes instantly, and without any significant hurdles particularly for high school aged children. While the Federal Government have recently introduced a system of grading countries and education sectors within those countries, the so-called eased prescriptions remain far more stringent than those of our competitor countries.

It is very frustrating and not cost effective for schools to invest in recruitment of students from overseas markets only to lose the student to a competitor because of the stringency of our entry requirements. While we support the need to guard against overstays, the level of pastoral care exercised by, in particular, independent secondary and senior secondary schools makes overstaying unlikely. The entry requirements and the sometimes ridiculously long processing times (up to 18 months in some instances) simply make us uncompetitive.

This situation could be readily addressed by extending the Pre-Qualified Institution (PQI) program to all school sectors to allow independent schools, the Catholic system schools and Government schools administration to fast-track the issuing of student visas to applicants from preferred countries of origin."<sup>37</sup>

By way of explanation, in a commendable move the Australian Government and DIMIA introduced a program known as "Pre-Qualified Institution" (PQI).

This was described in DIMIA's Fact Sheet 56 - Overseas Students in Australia - under the heading "November 2000 Changes":

"The 2001 program is a cooperative arrangement between selected education providers and DIMA (as it was then known). It seeks to allow for controlled but sustained growth of the student visa market in nongazetted countries such as the People's Republic of China, India, Pakistan and Vietnam. Under the 2001 PQI program, participating education providers are able to recoup up to a certain number of students by way of more streamlined entry requirements.

In return, PQI providers are required to fulfil a number of obligations, including the assessment of a sponsored student's bona-fides; ensuring that applications lodged under the PQI program are complete and fully documented; and monitoring the academic performance and attendances of PQI students while in Australia".<sup>38</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> The Friends' School, submission, April 2002, p. 1-2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> DIMIA Fact Sheet 56

The PQI program has been successfully used for students coming to Tasmania. The PQI program has however been under review since March 2002 when a Discussion Paper was released.

It was indicated to the Committee that the Review had found that there had been a steady decline in the take-up rate of available places under PQI. Given the cost of administering the program and the increasing levels of fraud the Review Report recommended either discontinuing or modifying PQI.

The PQI program has now been abolished. The Committee understands however that a significant streamlining has occurred in relation to visa applicants' financial requirements.

DIMIA's website at 1 December 2003 contained the following detail under the heading of 'Review of the 2001 Student Visa Reforms':

#### Implementation of the outcomes

The Government has agreed to the implementation of the recommendations of the review, with effect from 1 December 2003.

A summary of the changes flowing from these recommendations is provided below.

Once implemented, the changes are expected to position the industry for further strong growth, while also building on the flexibility and integrity of the student visa program.

#### Student guardian visa

The student guardian visa, which was announced as part of the Government's budget initiatives earlier this year, will commence on 1 January 2004.

Further details of the student guardian visa will be made available in the coming weeks.

#### Other changes

Of particular note in the package of legislative changes is the move towards greater flexibility in the financial requirements for student visa applicants from higher risk countries.

A number of changes will also be made to the existing English language proficiency requirements.

These changes include provisions to accommodate students who have previously studied outside Australia in some English-speaking countries, and to support alternative pathways to university.

A number of changes will also be made to the legislation to augment the integrity measures that are a key feature of the student visa program.

The legislation will be amended to introduce an English language proficiency requirement from 1 April 2004 for older School sector students from high-risk countries.

The Department has written individually to each school-sector provider to inform them of this change.

Changes will also be made to the financial requirements to ensure that decision-makers are able to more effectively gauge a student's financial capacity, by removing unliquidated non-cash assets as an acceptable source of funds.

The Department remains committed to the sustained growth of the overseas student program.

The aim of the changes is to achieve a balanced approach that allows for the continued growth of the international education industry, while also ensuring that the integrity of the student visa program is maintained.<sup>39</sup>

Mr Greg Suitor, a former Principal of the Elizabeth College in Hobart and now Assistant Principal, South Ocean Education Development Group in China, appeared before the Committee. When questioned about DIMIA's policies based on the risk of international students not returning to their home countries he said:

"I reckon that there is going to be less and less of that risk with China because more and more overseas Chinese are going back to China .... the economy is booming. If I were in the Federal Government now I would be loosening that rule and taking a bit more of a risk; the benefit would be greater than the cost."<sup>40</sup>

In view of the great benefits to Australia in having more international students studying in our country the Committee is of the opinion that it is imperative that the legislative and regulatory requirements, the guidelines and procedures for processing applications for student visas to Australia be urgently reviewed by the Australian Government and DIMIA with a view to variations being made to place Australia on a responsibly competitive basis with other countries seeking international students.

### 2.2 State Level

International education was wholly in the domain of the DOE until April 1999 when the marketing function was transferred to the then Department of State Development (DSD), now the Department of Economic Development (DED). Witnesses expressed a variety of opinions as to the value of this move. However, the DED recently initiated an education marketing alliance, bringing together nineteen international education providers to look at a whole-of-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> DIMIA website

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Greg Suitor, transcript, November 2002, p. 16-17

government approach to international education. This is seen by the Committee as a necessary and positive initiative. It appears, whilst only in its early stages, that the alliance is delivering some desirable outcomes.

The Committee has no evidence of the degree of resourcing that this alliance receives, but the experience in other states has been that a proper recognition of the resourcing of the international student sector results in increased enrolments of international students and a more satisfactory outcome for them educationally.

The Committee is of the view that increased collaboration and cooperation between the various sectors is highly desirable.

As previously indicated there is a good deal of potential for the Institute of TAFE Tasmania to be a destination for more international students. The General Manager - Development for TAFE Tasmania, said in his submission:

'There is limited interest among parents of International students in TAFE qualifications as an end in themselves. To respond to this the Institute is seeking to position itself in the international student market place as an alternative pathway to a university degree for those students who do not immediately meet university entry requirements. This strategy has the full support of the University of Tasmania and is ably supported by the collaborative arrangements that exist between the University, the Institute, the Department of Education and the Department of State Development.'<sup>41</sup>

Mrs Jan Kuplis in her submission to the Committee, put forward many suggestions that could be undertaken at State Government level to enhance Tasmania's position in the international education market.

These include: maintaining sister city/province/school/district relationships to generate continuing interest in Tasmania; reciprocal study tours by educators, students and parents to encourage flow-on business; improving hosting of and hospitality extended to international students; overseas visits by Tasmanian principals and teachers to source countries in order to participate in local teaching to demonstrate how Tasmanian teachers interact with students; and reciprocal visits to Tasmania by teachers and students from source countries.<sup>42</sup>

Other evidence indicated the need for improved teacher training and greater numbers of ESL teachers in the school system in order to support international students<sup>43</sup>. There are obvious resource implications here.

## 2.3 Local Government Level

With particular regard to international opportunities, the Hobart City Council (HCC) has established international relationships in the form of sister city

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> C K Murphy, General Manager – Development, TAFE Tasmania, submission, November 2001, p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Jan Kuplis, op.cit., April 2002, p. 5-6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Australian Education Union, submission, October 2002, p. 8-9, Janet Harrington, submission, April 2002, p. 3; Jan Kuplis, ibid, p. 18

affiliations with Yaizu in Japan and L'Aquila in Italy. Council is keen to see these relationships deliver real benefits to the citizens of Hobart.<sup>44</sup>

To further develop these relationships, the HCC has established community committees to support the further development of cultural and economic ties between Hobart and its sister cities. One committee was established in May 2001 to assist in further developing the relationship with Yaizu. A further committee to develop the L'Aquila relationship was established in March 2002. These committees provide a primary source of information and feedback to Council on its sister city activities from a community perspective.<sup>45</sup>

The Committee views these decisions by the HCC as extremely constructive and in the interests of the City of Hobart specifically but the State of Tasmania generally and supports such initiatives.

The Committee is aware that the HCC's Networking for Harmony Committee, in conjunction with the Institute of TAFE, has previously organised an official welcome to the City of Hobart for international students.

As indicated by the HCC in their submission:

"This event was organised in response to the issue of harassment and abuse experienced by international students in the Elizabeth Mall on their way to TAFE."<sup>46</sup>

Events like this do demonstrate that local government can play a role in supporting a positive environment for international students. As indicated by the HCC, the official welcome did attract over four hundred international students. The Committee would see ceremonies such as these as one positive way of recognising international students and making them feel welcome.

The Committee is of the view that every consideration should be given to welcoming the various groups of overseas delegates who come to the two major cities in Tasmania for the purpose of attending seminars and conferences. A civic type reception further provides opportunity to promote Hobart and Launceston as education cities.

The submission from the Assistance Fund for Overseas Students in Tasmania (AFOST) contained similar views. Mrs Robin Bowden, a committee member, said:

"The Lord Mayor has done quite a bit around Harmony Day on 21 March [2002] which falls fairly conveniently close to the beginning of the academic year. He has focused on that occasion now for two years running by having a function in the Mall to acknowledge and make feel welcome international students. That's been a good initiative, and I'm sure that somebody like Janie Dickinson would do similar things in Launceston given half the chance and maybe the State Government can co-host some of that or something of that nature. International Students

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> HCC, submission, April 2002, p.2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> HCC, op.cit., p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> ibid, p. 4

Week always used to have a function hosted by the Parliament of Tasmania and I think that was significant."<sup>47</sup>

Mrs Jan Kuplis, affirmed the value of civic receptions, particularly in relation to Asian visitors:

"Civic receptions for important international visitors or substantial school groups will establish a nice link and give them the right impression of civility of Tasmanians. The impression in Asia is that Australians in general are less than civil and far too free with our morals and behaviours. Asians like ceremony and like to see some sort of hierarchical social system in place. This gives them a sense of security. If they see our society is structured on sound moral principles, they may feel more comfortable about sending their children here."

The Committee during the course of its inquiry found that the ability to obtain suitable accommodation for international students is a major obstacle in being able to significantly grow numbers. There may be existing and future opportunities for local government through their links with community and other groups to promote home-stay opportunities.

A formal meet-and-greet process at either State or local government level is seen also as a positive way of welcoming international students arriving in our State for the first time. Mr Ted Alexander, past President of the Tasmania University Union indicated in his submission that a formal welcome by the Premier or the Lord Mayor would give a sense of inclusion for students.<sup>49</sup>

The Committee supports the development of a formal meet-and-greet process.

## 2.4 Other Levels

At the tertiary level at least, the desirability of quality mentoring programs was raised in evidence. The point being made was that there needs to be more effort toward integrating international students into the University community. The idea put forward was that a student from the same culture would become the mentor of the newly arrived international student. It was seen that this type of link would provide an increased opportunity for improved integration as well as providing a contact point should problems arise or advice be required. The Committee is supportive of this type of program involving volunteer mentors.

An extension of this is that local cultural and community groups could increase their involvement in providing mentoring, pastoral care and other community based programs aimed at assisting international students. The Committee is supportive of measures which provide such assistance. Additional information being made available on databases and the further development of meet-andgreet process are areas where the Committee believes improvement can be made.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Robin Bowden, committee member, AFOST, transcript, October 2002, p. 9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Jan Kuplis, op.cit., p. 6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Ted Alexander, past President, Tasmania University Union, submission, March 2002, p. 2

## Recommendations

The Committee recommends:

- (1) That the State Government requests the Department of Immigration, Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs to:
  - (a) further streamline the processing of student visa applications and reduce the application fee for student visas to a level that is competitive with other countries offering similar educational opportunities;
  - (b) amend the requirements for pre-payment of living expenses to have regard to all relevant circumstances;
  - (c) treat the Australian Maritime College as a special case in terms of processing applications for student visas for all countries having regard to the College's outstanding record concerning students not overstaying following the expiry of their visas; and
  - (d) not require students to undertake ELICOS courses where they have previously successfully completed educational courses in Australia at the same or a similar institution.
- (3) That all international education providers develop:
  - (d) a formal meet-and-greet process;
  - (e) a formal mentoring program involving volunteer mentors;
  - (f) a database of information for international students to provide assistance, particularly during the settling-in period.

## The Impediments

# Part 3

41

Term of Reference 3 – Any matters which may act as impediments to Tasmania attracting more international students.

## 3.1 General Impediments

During the course of its inquiry the Committee heard a great deal of evidence concerning matters which act as impediments to attracting more international students.

The matter of the Federal Government's recognition of student funding by overseas governments was raised. The Federal Government presently accepts guarantees of funding only from central governments. The Committee was made aware of argument about whether there is capacity within the existing legal framework to allow the acceptance of funding guarantees from an autonomous provincial government in order to support a flow of international students. This issue had arisen particularly in relation to a number of students from Xingiang in China whose funding guarantees from the provincial government was not acceptable to the Federal Government.

Mr Alan Campbell from the DED advised the Committee that this was a matter to be pursued with the Federal Government. Evidence was also received from Mr Ian Duncan on this point.

Other evidence received by the Committee suggests that two of the principal impediments to attracting a greater flow of international students are the visa issues vis-à-vis other competing countries and the availability of appropriate accommodation.

There are however, a number of other factors which do influence a student's personal decision to undertake study overseas. These include:

- home country economic/political situation;
- cost of travel, course fees and living expenses;
- first-hand recommendation of an institution;
- reputation perceived popularity and quality of institution;
- success rate of institution;
- size of institution;
- size of the city (entertainment, places to go, choices of housing)
- number of other students from same country in the same institution;
- safety particularly for the school sector;
- language support;
- assistance on arrival.<sup>50</sup>

From the UTAS perspective, Professor Lidl in his submission to the Committee, pointed to additional issues which have a bearing on his institution being able to attract greater numbers of students. The weaknesses identified were:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Jan Kuplis, op.cit., April 2002, p. 7

- lack of popular postgraduate coursework programs. The lack of popular postgraduate coursework programs is seen as a major obstacle in attracting students from countries such as Thailand, India and China.<sup>51</sup>
- cold climate;
- isolated geographical position;
- small population, lack of activities in cities;
- no direct international flights;
- sensitivity to performance in rankings such as the Good Universities Guide;
- lack of part-time work for students;
- no migrant base from target markets;
- low international profile;
- inability to attract international tourists (Tasmania attracts less than 1% of international visitors to Australia);
- the limited resources of the University's Schools to accept larger numbers of international students.<sup>52</sup>

Professor Lidl further identified other matters perceived by the UTAS as threats to Tasmania's success. These were:

- growth in competitor activity, both nationally and internationally;
- global economic volatility;
- fluctuations in currency exchange a strong Australia dollar will erode positive cost comparisons with overseas competitors;
- accommodation places both on-campus and off-campus not being readily available.<sup>53</sup>

Professor Lidl also noted in his submission that there are other factors which affect the University's ability to attract full-fee paying overseas students (FFPOS). A major limiting factor in terms of increasing FFPOS numbers on campus is the capacity of the more popular courses to expand their intake. Architecture, Medicine, Pharmacy, Engineering, Information Systems (postgraduate) either have strict quotas or have reached the limits of their capacity to take any more FFPOS.

The Committee was made aware of certain source country impediments affecting the flow of Asian students to Australia generally over which Australia has no control. These include:

- government's providing local incentives to study in the home country; and
- loyalty to home country Thais for example are loath to go against the wishes of their King who advocates his people supporting Thai education, Thai industry and the Thai economy.

Tasmania is not widely known overseas. From an education customer's point of view, Tasmania has the following failings that may impact on a students decision to choose Tasmania as an educational destination. These are:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Jan Kuplis, op.cit., p. 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, submission, November 2001, p. 4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> ibid, p. 4-5

- neither well known nor popular;
- too far away;
- too small;
- lacks the attraction offered by larger cities like Sydney and Melbourne;
- not on a direct flight route from Asia and therefore costs are incurred to cross Bass Strait;
- does not have a significant Asian migration base which could provide emotional and cultural support.<sup>54</sup>

The Committee notes however that some of these factors are also considered advantages by parents. Whilst these perceived impediments cannot be readily altered it is important to capitalise on those which do offer appeal.

The joint submission of the DED, the DOE, TAFE and the UTAS identified impediments similar to those previously outlined. However, the joint submission noted additional factors which are deemed to be limiting factors upon growth of student numbers. These are:

- the limited number of institutions in the State Tasmania has nineteen registered providers out of a total of 1,153 in Australia; and
- the strong desire by institutions to maintain a balanced cultural mix amongst international students;<sup>55</sup>

## **3.2 Resource Allocation**

The Australian Education Union (AEU) noted in its submission that the major issue of concern for the Union, is that of the allocation of resources, both financial and human, to the secondary colleges and schools that accept international students.

The submission highlights the importance of ensuring that both local and overseas students are able to access the same high quality education.

The submission stated:

"A lack of necessary resources means that the quality of the educational 'product' may be reduced and as international students can take up other options the Tasmanian experience will be compared critically with other states or countries. If the success of the international students program is to be built upon there is a need to ensure that those who fund and manage the system constantly look for ways to make it a more attractive option.

When international students were first accepted on a full-fee paying basis they were counted as students for the student census. This meant that a college not only received funding from the fees paid by the students but also from central education funds in respect of their enrolments. That is,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Jan Kuplis, op.cit., p. 8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Joint submission, Department of State Development (now DED), Department of Education, Institute of TAFE Tasmania and the University of Tasmania, op.cit., p. 4

the international students were counted as part of the student cohort on which staffing and resource package allocations were made. This situation did not apply in 2000 and 2001 when international students were not counted as core-students for secondary college staffing allocation purposes. This decision meant that there were comparatively fewer resources that could be used for international students. While colleges have used the income from international student fees to employ Counsellors and to staff introductory classes for the International Students Program, in effect staffing was allocated to the colleges as if the international students did not exist. This had an effect on class sizes – an issue to which we will return later. However, in 2003 colleges will be staffed on a basis that takes international students into account. This is a welcome development.

The AEU understands that funds from international students are not always used exclusively and directly to support the education of the international students who have paid the fees. That is, classes have been staffed and resources provided from the School Resource Package. Funds flowing from enrolments under the International Student Program have been used for development of the school or college campus. In reality these funds are therefore supporting the broader college or school educational program – not being spent directly on the education of those international students whose parents have outlaid the funds. While these funds can assist in providing resources for colleges it is important that all students are able to access a quality program.

Some international students have a tendency to demand greater time from their teachers in and out of class. Where resources are tight – such as in subjects with large class sizes – there is an argument that the resources that come from the international students as a fee for their education should be spent on direct in-class support to ensure that everyone receives a fair deal. Such support can consist of English as a Second Language, aides or tutors who accompany students to their classes or small subject tutor groups."<sup>56</sup>

The AEU believes that the great majority of the resources that flow from the International Students Program should be directed to supporting the direct delivery of education to those students. This includes support in the form of specialist aides or tutors and the further professional development of teachers who are required to teach international students who do not possess a high level of English language competency.

As Mr Phil Cox, a member of the AEU said in evidence to the Committee:

"I think our impediments are really what we have discussed during the morning, and that is that the resource model is wrong, that we really need to look at the balance between what goes into the classroom and what goes into infrastructure."<sup>57</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> AEU, submission, October 2002, p. 3-4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> AEU – Phil Cox, transcript, October 2002, p. 16

The senior officers representing the DOE in providing evidence on this point, indicated that most of the total fee paid by an international student goes to service delivery in the school or college.

In terms of the percentage of total fee going directly to education delivery, Mr David Kilpatrick, Manager, Tasmanian Government Schools International (TGSI), said:

"The more accurate evaluation based on this year's figures [2002] would be in the order of sixty-one per cent. That proportion of funding is used exclusively on delivering the actual education. The remaining thirty-nine per cent would be used for providing accommodation services, for the expenses associated with marketing and expenses associated with paying agents and different partners in this enterprise."58

The Committee was advised that Year 12 students pay a fee of \$8,500 with about \$5,500 of that fee going directly to the institution. In terms of the remaining \$3,000, Mr Kilpatrick advised the Committee as follows:

"There would be a payment to an agent in that fee. There would be a budget to the Department of Economic Development to assist in their activities. There would be resources used for providing the accommodation and to the admissions process. There is a lot of communication and forwarding of documents and administration around placing students in the appropriate school and the issues to do with quality control in view of the compliance the Department of Education has to have to the Commonwealth register of international providers as well."59

In relation to the \$5,500 which goes directly to the institution, the Committee was interested in whether there is any discretion available to the institution which could see a portion of this amount being allocated elsewhere based on judgements of the school managers.

Mr Kilpatrick responded in the following terms:

"There are service level agreements between the schools and colleges and the central office which would talk about the sorts of staffing that we would expect to see in the schools for international students; the provision of ESL teachers; the provision of international student counsellors and administration staff doing the day-to-day stuff, like taking the students to the bank to open a bank account and all those sorts of caring activities."60

The Committee is very much aware of the need to keep fees as low as possible, particularly in terms of marketing the program. It was indicated to the Committee that increases in fees increase the difficulty in marketing the International Student Program. The Committee notes however, that fee

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Department of Education, Tim Doe, Robert Phillips and David Kilpatrick, transcript, November 2002, p. 15-16 <sup>59</sup> ibid, p. 15-16

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> ibid, p. 16

disbursement does have a critical impact upon the educational opportunity being delivered.

## 3.3 Accommodation

The matter of accommodation is one which was consistently raised during the course of the Committee's inquiry. The lack of sufficient housing particularly for University students, both international and local, remains a real concern. The Committee was made aware of the University Union Housing Scheme and numbers accommodated at the three University colleges – Jane Franklin Hall, Christ College and St John Fisher College.

Mr Ted Alexander, of the Tasmanian University Union (TUU), gave evidence that a number of international students in the private rental market are experiencing great difficulty in finding private accommodation within a reasonable distance from the University.<sup>61</sup>

Mr Alexander went on to say:

"So we've looked at measures to help alleviate this. The University is in the process of planning the new UTAS student residences which should be up and running by 2004. That's got probably another 150 rooms in it and that's meant to alleviate the pressure that's being caused by the extra international students. The union's been looking at ways to get extra properties into its housing scheme for students."<sup>62</sup>

The Committee is cognisant of the very real problems for international students at the tertiary level, particularly in Hobart, in finding suitable accommodation. The Committee was advised that seventy-five per cent of international students at the UTAS attend the Hobart campus.<sup>63</sup> Evidence received also suggests a shortage of home-stay accommodation for students. With affordable rental accommodation near the UTAS becoming increasingly difficult to obtain students look for home-stay opportunities.<sup>64</sup>

The UTAS does have a large home-stay program for students in English language with some two hundred families in the program. Indications are that it is very difficult to increase that beyond current numbers nothwithstanding the efforts undertaken. These include letter-drops, advertising and radio promotion.<sup>65</sup> As Mr Paul Rigby, Director of International Services at the UTAS said:

"It is very hard to see where more families are going to come from to join the program".<sup>66</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Ted Alexander, past President, Tasmanian University Union, transcript, October 2002, p. 17

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> ibid, p. 17

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, transcript, October 2002, p. 9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> V.B. Armstrong, General Manager, Hobart City Council, submission, April 2002, p. 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Paul Rigby, op.cit., December 2002, P. 13

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> ibid, p. 13

The submission from the HCC suggests that a centralised and strategic approach to seeking suitable home-stay families would seem desirable. It was indicated that it is generally left up to individual education institutions to seek out home-stay families.

The HCC submission promoted the development of a register available to education institutions. The Committee notes this suggestion which it believes merits further investigation.

The acquisition and refurbishment of property and the construction of new accommodation being currently undertaken by the UTAS in Hobart are welcome initiatives. As Professor Lidl said to the Committee:

"The University has partly anticipated the housing problem and has tried for about 18 months to interest private investors in student accommodation and we were unsuccessful so only recently the University Council decided that we have to build the additional accommodation ourselves and we have set aside funds to create 150 new beds. They will be, hopefully, available in January 2004. It's obviously too late to try anything sooner and the mid-year intake wouldn't help that much, but with one year's delay we have 150 more places and that's envisaged as phase 1 of an expansion of accommodation.

The precise number of the second phase hasn't been determined yet but in preliminary discussions, in which we tried to attract private investment in student accommodation, we talked about 300 in one instance, even 400 places, but it was very difficult and it has proved very difficult elsewhere as well to attract that investment."<sup>67</sup>

The Committee notes the submission received from Mr Brian Hicks, Director. GoldRiver Group Ltd. Ltd (formerly Metrostate Holdings Pty Ltd). This operating out Sydney, develops specialised company, of student accommodation, catering for both international and local students, mainly in the higher education sector. The Committee was made aware of the development in 2001 of an apartment accommodation complex in Adelaide's central business district in partnership with Education Adelaide - a statutory body set up to accelerate the growth of South Australia's education export industry. Other projects have also been undertaken.<sup>68</sup> The complexes are known as Unihouse. Mr Hicks advised the Committee that a high quality education experience and first class accommodation go together in attracting international students. The Unihouse developments were aimed specifically at the growing overseas student market in the City of Adelaide.

The Committee was advised that Adelaide City Council's "New Directions" statement places a greater emphasis on overseas students, with a target to double overseas student numbers to 13,000 by 2005.<sup>69</sup> Further it was suggested that students are now wanting a higher standard of accommodation within close proximity to all facilities and their place of study.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, op.cit., p. 9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> GoldRiver Group Pty Ltd (formerly Metrostate Holdings Pty Ltd), submission, March 2002, p. 8-9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> ibid, p. 6

## 3.4 Past Experience

Evidence suggests also that the past experience of students is a very telling factor in terms of the future capacity to attract students. Mr John Backhouse, a witness before the Committee who has undertaken post-graduate study in the Northern Territory had this to say:

"I don't know but from my observation, it would be past experiences. For instance, I doubt that many international students that went to Darwin – and they range from quite a lot of countries – would give good referees' reports to the next lot of students there. Also some of the students who came from India found that the agent – the university were using an agent in India to sell the product obviously – was slightly falsifying the information. So a lot of the Indian students felt as though they were being hard done by in that regard. The students from Papua New Guinea were happy to be out of the country but I think they were in the wrong university. The Papuans would have been better off in the Tasmanian University because it had things of their interest which is basically forestry operations in Papua that they are interested in and Indonesians are interested in forestry operations. So they would have been better off."<sup>70</sup>

The Committee accepts and recognises the point made by Mr Backhouse in terms of the potential there is for negative experiences of students whilst in Tasmania to have ramifications for future recruitment.

Further the Committee notes the comments raised by Mr Ted Alexander of the TUU in his evidence concerning the asylum seekers situation in Australia and the affect this has had on Australia's image internationally.

When asked whether or not the asylum seeker situation is likely to impose some impediment on our marketing and recruiting, Mr Alexander responded:-

"I'd say so. I would say that it would have done already, and probably the number of international students that we got this year [2002] may have decreased already because of it. Coming into the second semester as well, presumably in a year or two people will have forgotten about it, but there will be other issues I'm sure."<sup>71</sup>

## 3.5 Other Support

Information was also provided to the Committee which supported the need to have languages, for example, Korean and Japanese on the IT network, particularly at UTAS. An international honours students from Korea who appeared before the Committee could not understand why the Korean language was not available on the UTAS Mac computers. It was indicated that a software solution was available and that this would make it easier for Korean or Japanese students to work in their own language.<sup>72</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> John Backhouse, transcript, October 2002, p. 4-5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Ted Alexander, past President, Tasmanian University Union, op.cit., p. 19

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Tony Ryan and Chiria Lee, transcript, October 2002, p. 6

The Committee supports any move which would positively improve the experience of international students especially if it made their study and associated work less onerous in terms of language.

A further difficulty experienced by international students, particularly initially, is the availability of community support groups from their own culture. This is a matter further developed in this Report in Part 5.

The Committee heard evidence from the Anti-Discrimination Commissioner and her officers on some of the difficulties which confront international students. Issues such as inter-racial and inter-cultural tensions were identified. The Committee is not able to indicate the level or extent of tension or discrimination, as no relevant statistics are available to it. However, there is the view that problems between different cultural groups are inevitable and occur in any society from time to time.

The point being made by the Commission's witnesses generally was that there needs to be clearly articulated policies and processes which can be readily accessed by those students who have a need and that these should be part of the standard student orientation procedure.

## 3.6 Recognition Changes

Mr Rick Snell gave evidence that changes in the professional recognition of degrees internationally is a further impeding factor.

Mr Snell said:

"There's changes in professional recognition whether it's engineering in Singapore, whether it's law in Malaysia or elsewhere. When those things happen or they look like they're happening we need to be able to access political influence at the State Government level and the Federal Government to effectively intervene to try to plead special cases."<sup>73</sup>

When asked how the State Government might be expected to become involved in areas where it may not be aware of those types of circumstances, Mr Snell responded:

"Yes. Well part of it I think is that there needs to be a core area within the State Government which all this can feed into. It surprises me; I'm staggered to find that there's not at the moment – a central unit, or if there is I'm not aware of it. But a central unit or central body that actually spends a lot of time on this."<sup>74</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Lisa Butler and Rick Snell, transcript, 23 October 2002, p. 10

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> ibid, p. 11

## Recommendations

The Committee recommends:

- (2) That a detailed assessment be undertaken of present and future student accommodation requirements and identify opportunities to encourage and promote public and private investment in student accommodation.
- (2) That a central register of home-stay families be developed and that such a register be available to all education institutions.
- (3) That the profile of Tasmania as an education destination be increased internationally whenever and wherever possible.

# Marketing and Recruitment Part 4

Term of Reference 4 – The effectiveness or otherwise of the methods employed by the State Government and Tasmanian educational institutions in marketing and recruiting international students.

## 4.1 The Market

International education is economically significant to the Tasmanian economy. Figures at 2001 indicate 1,839 international students were enrolled and making a financial contribution in the range of \$40-42 million annually. The major market for schools and colleges is China, with fifty-five per cent of the international students enrolled in 2002 from that country. Other key markets include Japan, Korea, Thailand and Malaysia.

Mr Greg Calvert, a former manager of TGSI, drew attention in his submission to the most recent report on the potential for attracting greater numbers of international students to Tasmania - the Tasmanian Industry Audit – Government Services (1999). This report contained statistical data on international education and a number of recommendations for improvement. Mr Calvert contends however that most of these recommendations appear not to have been acted upon.<sup>75</sup> The Committee notes the responses made by the Government to the recommendations contained in the document 'Industry Audits: Government Services 1999'.

The potential for attracting greater numbers of international students to Tasmania has been clearly established. The 1999 Tasmanian Industry Audit Report anticipated that there could be a fifty per cent increase in this market in the foreseeable future. Marketing of the education product is therefore of critical importance.

Whilst no market research work had been completed at that time, information uncovered by the Audit and supported by witnesses to this inquiry, suggests there are large market opportunities being generated by the increasing affluence appearing in China and India, and the easing of the economic crisis in South East Asia.

Mr Hans Kelder, a teacher recently returned from China, stressed the great potential for attracting students to Tasmania, given that the one-child policy has made overseas education very affordable for Chinese families. Mr Kelder said:

"there is great affluence in China and education of children receives wider family support...practically all Chinese wish to do international business courses and all Chinese students wish to be very proficient in business English."<sup>76</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Greg Calvert, submission, November 2001, p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Hans Kelder, submission, February 2002, p. 2

In fact the Campus Review of October 9-15 2002 stated that nationally:

"Australia is on the cusp of becoming a real knowledge economy on the back of a predicted boom in higher education exports, set to grow domestically from \$4 billion in 2000 to more than \$38 billion by 2025. The  $16^{th}$  Australian International Education Conference heard that the total demand for Australian education is set to increase nine-fold over the period 2000 – 2025."<sup>77</sup>

Mr Greg Calvert further advised the Committee:

"Even though in absolute terms the number of international students has increased in Tasmania over the past 6 years, the percentage of the national numbers has continued to decline. It would appear that there is scope to reverse this trend."<sup>78</sup>

There is however clearly growing national and international competition for overseas students and it is important that Tasmania markets itself well in order to attract an increased proportion of international students.

Professor Rudi Lidl cast considerable light on the competitive nature of marketing between various educational institutions due to the importance of fee paying overseas students to those institutions. Professor Lidl said:

"International education has become an extremely important and therefore competitive activity of all higher education institutions in Australia and internationally. In some cases the viability of the institution depends on success in international activities. Therefore institutions jealously guard some information as being commercial in confidence, such as details of marketing activities (where, why and how much marketing occurs), details of business plans, etc.".<sup>79</sup>

4.2 International Education Providers In Tasmania

There are currently nineteen registered international education providers in Tasmania. They are:

- University of Tasmania
- Tasmanian Department of Education Tasmanian Government School International
- Australian Maritime College
- TAFE Tasmania International
- Tasmanian College of English
- Worldview Centre for Intercultural Studies
- The Hutchins School
- The Friends School
- Calvin Christian School

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Campus Review, Vol. 12, No. 39, published by Campus Review Pty Ltd, Brisbane, Qld, p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Greg Calvert, op.cit., p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, 19 November 2001, cover letter to Chair of Committee

- The Tasmanian School of Fine Furniture
- Fahan School
- Fusion
- Shipwright's Point School of Wooden Boat Building
- Launceston Church Grammar School
- Leighland Christian School
- Scotch Oakburn College
- St Michael's Collegiate School
- St Patrick's College
- Guilford Young College Inc

The UTAS has the largest share of the market, with about fifty per cent of overseas students coming to Tasmania studying at UTAS campuses. School education accounts for approximately fifteen per cent of overseas student enrolments.

TGSI, as noted, is a section within the Tasmanian DOE. It is responsible for the administration of the international student fee-paying program and offshore schools. TGSI replaced Schools Tasmania Ltd which was registered with the Australian Securities Commission in December 1996 and which, at that time, set out to market the expertise of the DOE nationally and internationally as well as within the State.

The schools covered by TGSI include Tasmania's six senior secondary colleges, as well as Taroona, Queechy and Clarence high schools. TGSI has about a thirteen per cent market share of international students in this State.

The AMC is an important provider also to international students. Evidence provided to the Committee indicated that at October 2002 there were approximately 100 full-time equivalent (FTE) international students at the AMC. In 2001 the total campus number was about 890 FTE students. To obtain that number the AMC had a total enrolment of about 2,100.<sup>80</sup>

TAFE Tasmania International is responsible for overseas students undertaking TAFE studies at some of the thirty campuses statewide. Less than ten per cent of overseas students coming to Tasmania study at TAFE.

The Tasmanian College of English was established in 1998 and is part of the South Australian College of English. This College offers a wide selection of English language courses as well as social programs and opportunities to participate in eco-tours and adventures in addition and complementary to classroom English. The College aims to provide an educational pathway to further education. The ELICOS sector holds a significant percentage of the market share.

The Worldview Centre for Intercultural Studies (formerly the WEC Missionary Training College) has a little over one per cent of Tasmania's international students studying at its centre in St. Leonards, Launceston. It is the first private institution to award a university-recognised degree in Tasmania.<sup>81</sup> It offers a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Elizabeth Vagg and Robert Jones, AMC, transcript, October 2002, p. 9, 22

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> Weekly News Review, January 16 2003

foundation English language course for overseas students, with a flexible timetable. All students live on the campus where they have ample opportunity to practise their English skills.<sup>82</sup>

The remaining share of international students is distributed among the remaining providers - Fusion, the Tasmanian School of Fine Furniture and the Shipwright's Point School of Wooden Boat Building.

#### 4.3 Market Research

Successful marketing requires an analysis of international students' needs and expectations, so that not only can these be addressed but advertising and promotional material can be better focused in reaching potential students.

Significant market research was seen in AEI's *Study In Australia 2000*, an educational marketing campaign developed to take advantage of the features of the Australian Tourism Commission's *Brand Australia* profile which was supported by a three-year \$150 million marketing program.

As part of the *Study in Australia 2000* initiative, research was done in Thailand with six focus groups of students to explore reactions to images, messages and promotional material to assess consumer attitudes, motivation and barriers to Australia as an education destination. Tasmanian images of wilderness were included in the research.

Of interest were the images which students selected as important to their decision-making. In order of priority, the images selected were:

- university life;
- ♦ study;
- environment;
- tourist attractions; and then equally
- accommodation, recreation activities and facilities.

The *Study in Australia 2000* campaign noted that web sites were listed as an important source of information for many students and some parents.

Word-of-mouth via friends was also cited as an important influence on choosing a country for study, and having relatives or friends in a country was also important, giving a sense of security and possibly reducing costs.<sup>83</sup>

Those involved in business and commerce have long recognised the importance of market research in order to target a market in the most effective way. The Committee believes that the type of market research indicated above does highlight very useful points which may be utilised by Tasmanian providers. The Committee is of the view that further market research to identify the best ways of marketing the Tasmanian product would be of significant value. The UTAS submission made the point that images of wilderness, heritage buildings and prison ruins are not attractive to our major target markets in Asia". In

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> Worldview Centre website

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Tasmanian Industry Audits: Government Services, 1999 Executive Summary, p. 26

#### 4.4 Targets

Marketing is not undertaken in isolation but must take into account many interdependent factors.

It is clear to the Committee that Tasmania could attract increased numbers of international students.

It is seen as preferable by many educational institutions to achieve cultural diversity in terms of international student enrolments, rather than allowing students from one country to dominate. The submission by The Hutchins School pointed out that this is one aspect which is attractive to many parents of international students. Parents want an environment where their children will not have the opportunity to mix with large numbers from their own country as this can tend to inhibit their English language development.<sup>85</sup>

There is also a desire among TGSI schools and colleges to achieve cultural diversity amongst their international student enrolment.<sup>86</sup>

There has also been a strong resolve generally to provide quality programs and support services for international students, rather than simply attracting greater numbers whose needs cannot be catered for. This was highlighted by Dr Martyn Forrest, Secretary of the DOE.<sup>87</sup>

Targets have been set by the major providers based on their own ability to meet both the educational needs of international students as well as providing other support services.

At the Government level, targets for growth are set in consultation with the DED and the principals of TGSI schools and colleges.

The following Table provides a summary of the targets of the TGSI, as documented in their Business Plan 2001 – 2003.

Table 4: Targets
------------------

PROGRAM	2001	2002	2003
International Students	250	300	400
Study Tours	5	6	8
Education Agreements China	3	4	5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, submission, November 2001, p. 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> W D Toppin, Principal, The Hutchins School, submission, November 2001, p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Martyn Forrest, Secretary, Department of Education, background information, November 2001, p. 2 <sup>87</sup> ibid, p. 3

Education Consultancies Offshore	1	1 new consultancy	1 new consultancy
Offshore Schools		1 new international school contract	
(Source: Department of Education – Overview and Background Document: November 2001)			

At the UTAS targets for international students are set through a process of consultation and negotiation between International Services staff and relevant Heads of Schools and Deans. Projections take into account the capacity of Schools to accept international students and market related issues.<sup>88</sup>

The following Tables, detail the projected full-fee paying overseas students (FFPOS) enrolments for 2002 - 2004 by head count and load equivalent full-time student unit (EFTSU) for each faculty.<sup>89</sup>

FACULTY	2002	2003	2004
Arts	68	85	102
Health Science	116	128	132
Commerce	222	241	259
Science and Engineering	450	489	533
Education	12	15	16
Law	47	61	63
Cross-Institutional	183	232	269
TOTAL	1098	1251	1374

	Table 5: Projected Internation	nal FFPOS Enrolments by Head Count
--	--------------------------------	------------------------------------

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, op.cit., p. 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> ibid, p. 6-7

FACULTY	2002	2003	2004
Arts	125	156	187
Health Science	108	120	126
Commerce	175	182	209
Science and Engineering	463	516	564
Education	14	18	19
Law	37	47	49
TOTAL	921	1049	1152

#### Table 6: Projected International FFPOS Enrolments by Load (EFTSU)

Not all providers set targets. Mr Bill Toppin, Principal of The Hutchins School in his submission said:

"The School does not have set targets. Rather, it has accepted most students who have applied (some it has rejected because of poor reports from home). Hutchins would consider limiting its number of international students from a specific country when it felt that there was a large enough mass which adversely affected their ability to mix and learn english."<sup>90</sup>

The Committee is cognisant of the fact that educational institutions seem to be very much aware of the need for a balance between numbers of students and the quality of education provided, rather than simply attempting to attract as many fee-paying students as possible. At the end of the day, if this latter approach were adopted, it may well be to the detriment of our Tasmanian educational institutions. As pressure to provide additional and adequate support services increases, the resultant impact on the educational opportunity delivered may well suffer.

## 4.5 Current Marketing Strategies

Background information obtained from witnesses regarding the development of marketing strategies to attract overseas students suggests to the Committee that marketing started in an ad-hoc way, with the various providers implementing whatever marketing methods seemed suitable to them. However, there has been recognition at all levels that the education of international students is a very significant product which Tasmania has to offer, and that there needs to be a more cooperative effort to market in a focused and targeted manner.

A range of marketing techniques have been identified.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> W D Toppin, Principal, The Hutchins School, op.cit., p. 2

## 4.5.1 Word of mouth and first-hand experience

Now that thousands of students have studied in Tasmania, their positive experiences can be a powerful tool for attracting others to study here. An example of this was brought to the Committee's attention and has already been quoted at Part 1.3 of this Report.

This type of feedback demonstrates to the Committee the very positive aspects which flow from international student graduates.

Mr Rick Snell from the UTAS Law School also made the point that the status of the UTAS and the brand name 'Tasmania' needs to be continually promoted and enhanced whilst the investment in international students should be viewed as a long-term strategy that is intended to reap social, cultural and economic benefits.<sup>91</sup>

A letter to a Member of the Committee from a former student from Sabah, who studied under the Colombo Plan at The Hutchins School and the UTAS, shows the importance of first-hand experience. This individual was so appreciative of the assistance provided by the Australian Government and impressed with his educational opportunity in Tasmania that he later sent three of his sons to The Hutchins School and then to the UTAS.<sup>92</sup>

## 4.5.2. Government Agencies

#### Federal

AEI is part of the Commonwealth Department of Education, Training and Youth Affairs (DETYA). In 2001 AEI described itself as "the public face of the Australian Government's commitment to [the nation's] international education and training industry." As a Commonwealth Government organization, AEI is able to represent all States, Territories and industry sectors.<sup>93</sup>

AEI actively consults with all sectors involved in education of international students. Education and training counsellors are currently located in many overseas cities, including Bangkok, Beijing, Jakarta, New Delhi, Kuala Lumpur, Seoul, Taipei, Tokyo and Hanoi. Australian Education Centres are established in these places as well as Paris, Hong Kong, Osaka, Brunei, Guangzhou, Shanghai and other areas.

AEI has a major role in marketing the Australian education product to the world. Education providers, governments and peak bodies are encouraged by AEI to purchase its Market Information Package which provides up-to-date information to assist in educational marketing.<sup>94</sup>

#### State

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Rick Snell, UTAS Law School, additional submission, October 2002

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Letter from Nordin Abdul Rahman to the Honourable Don Wing MLC

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> AEI website

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> AEI website

The Tasmanian Government currently provides funding for the marketing of educational services to attract students to Government schools and TAFE in Tasmania. A Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) exists between all providers of education services in Tasmania, which reinforces a pathways approach to marketing Tasmanian educational opportunities.<sup>95</sup>

The DSD (now the Department of Economic Development) took over marketing and recruitment of full-fee paying international students for TGSI and TAFE in April 1999. A dedicated International Education Marketing Unit (IEMU) was established within the Trade and Marketing section of the Department for this purpose.

As indicated by the then Chief Executive of the Department, the Unit's initial task was to reverse the declining numbers of the three years preceding 1999 and then initiate strategies aimed at building numbers in the Government schools and TAFE sectors.<sup>96</sup>

The IEMU receives an allocation of funds from the DOE to meet the cost of salaries, advertising, travel and administration. Approximately twelve per cent of the revenue derived from the international students' tuition fees program is allocated for that purpose. The vast majority is allocated to schools and colleges. TGSI office administration costs and the payment to agents accounts form about twenty-five per cent of the tuition fees.<sup>97</sup>

The Institute of TAFE Tasmania further allocates a sum for the provision of marketing and enrolment services on behalf of the Institute. The General Manager – Development, indicated in his background submission that an amount of \$173,000 per annum is provided.<sup>98</sup>

The IEMU also works with other providers. For example, it has hosted a delegation of seventeen Thai education agents on a visit to both government and private education providers in the State. This type of hosting gives agents the opportunity to experience Tasmania and be briefed first-hand about the respective educational institutions in both Hobart and Launceston. Other cooperative activities have also occurred.

The IEMU recognises the need for a formal collaborative structure with providers to overcome problems of scale, provide broad-based solutions to market needs and further enhance Tasmania's international image.

## 4.5.3 Scholarships

Over recent years the UTAS has introduced scholarships as a marketing technique to attract international students. The submission from the UTAS states:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> Government response to Tasmanian Industry Audits: Government Services, August 1999

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Jeff Kelly, CEO, Department of State Development, letter dated 16 November 2001, p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Martyn Forrest, Secretary, Department of Education, submission, 23 November 2001, p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> C P Murphy, General Manager – Development, TAFE Tasmania, background submission, November 2001, p. 3 of Attachment 1

"The University of Tasmania's main focus for international students is on full-fee paying international students in undergraduate and postgraduate courses.

Until 1998, the University's marketing strategy relied upon attendance at exhibitions, presentations to students at institutions and public seminars, advertising and facilitating academic visits. However, while these activities yielded satisfactory results, long-term targets were not met.

In 1998 a marketing strategy to position the University in the marketplace was developed, with two factors being identified as significant determinants of students' choice – quality and price. The University's place as one of the original state universities was seen as a major advantage, and the fact that tuition fees and living costs are lower than most other education destinations gave the University a strategic position in the market place.

In 1999 the International Scholarship Program was changed to make it more attractive to students, more marketable and easier to administer. Scholarships now offer 25% off the full cost of coursework programs."<sup>99</sup>

Clearly this has been a successful technique and has led to increased enrolments.

The submission further stated:

"The scholarships have proved to be immensely popular, attracting interest from students, institutions with transfer arrangements and some of our competitor institutions. Seventy-seven Tasmanian International Scholarships were awarded in semester one 2001, after a full year promoting the scheme. The scholarships are attracting better than average students, improving the overall academic standard of the international student body, and will enhance the long-term influential effectiveness of the overseas Alumni network."<sup>100</sup>

Professor Lidl further advised the Committee that in 2001 there were 130 students on international scholarships, and in 2002 this had increased to 215 students.<sup>101</sup> This is a very positive outcome.

## 4.5.4 Educator and student study tours to Tasmania

Bringing educators to Tasmania to see first-hand the facilities offered is a valuable marketing tool. For example, during 2001 TGSI organised two student study tours to Tasmania involving twenty-six students, as well as organising a group of twenty-two Japanese school principals on a one-day visit to Howrah

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, op.cit., p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> ibid, p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, letter dated 31 October 2002 and containing additional information requested by the Committee.

Primary School.<sup>102</sup> In 2002 TGSI further organised two educators study tours involving twenty-four teachers from Japan.<sup>103</sup>

#### 4.5.5 Establishing and providing resources to international schools

The involvement of Tasmania in overseas schools, particularly in China, is important. The provision of course and material support and other resources including teachers has important consequences. Our reputation as a provider of a good educational product is enhanced through this involvement and as a consequence provides further opportunity to promote Tasmania as a desirable future education destination.

The DOE has held a contract for eleven years to provide staffing, resources and support for curriculum delivery to Tanjung Bara International School in East Kalimantan in Indonesia.<sup>104</sup>

In 2000-2001, the Tasmania Principals Institute, in conjunction with the UTAS and TGSI provided training in school management and leadership to school principals in Thailand.<sup>105</sup> This consultancy involved funding from DETYA and the Thai Education Ministry.

The Department also has three agreements to provide curriculum and delivery support for Year 10 Tasmanian Certificate of Education subjects to schools in China.<sup>106</sup> These agreements form an integral part of the DED's marketing strategy in China.

In September 2002 the Department commenced operations supporting the delivery of the Tasmanian Certificate of Education (TCE) at the Australia-China International School in Dalian. As at January 2003 there were fifty-seven feepaying students enrolled in the school. Agreement has been reached to establish the China-Australia International School Program in additional schools commencing this year.<sup>107</sup>

Private international schools with Tasmanian connections are being established and undoubtedly these will promote our State in various ways. One such school is the Australia-China Foreign Language School in Zhangzhou.

#### 4.5.6 Education and career fairs and exhibitions

Government, consortiums and education authorities promote directly to international students at education fairs and exhibitions in overseas countries to attract them to Tasmania and our educational institutions. If Tasmania is to gain maximum advantage from such exhibitions, it would be helpful to maximise Tasmania's exposure in the country prior to such exhibitions being held.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> Martyn Forrest, background information, op.cit., p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> TGSI, 20 January 2003, additional submission, p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Martyn Forrest, op.cit., p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> ibid, p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> ibid, p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> TGSI, op.cit., p. 1

#### 4.5.7 Agents

Education providers, both private and Government, utilise agents in overseas countries to promote Tasmania's educational institutions and distribute specially prepared brochures and other promotional material to particular target groups.

When speaking with a number of international students at Fahan School it was apparent that their major reason for choosing Tasmania and Fahan School was because of the information and advice provided to them and their families by an agent.

Overseas agents provide the necessary contact in-country for the dissemination of information and the handling of student applications. Mrs Jan Kuplis made the following comments concerning agents:

"A good agent will negotiate for exclusivity and work purposefully for you for the duration of the contract. A bad agent will have a full-time job in another area and just handle a few students to top up his or her bank account. They have no interest in the particulars of systems or institutions and are often inept at handling the application process."<sup>108</sup>

Locally, migrants and overseas business people living or working in Tasmania, tend also to act as agents for family, friends and communities in their country of origin. People like this are generally reliable and informed about the process and product.<sup>109</sup>

Mr Alan Campbell from the DED had this to say concerning agents:

"They are the link. And we've tested this by going to trade shows by ourselves and then of course the follow-up issue becomes quite complicated because you could e-mail the student or wait for the student to e-mail back. So we've done it both ways, alone and then with the agent in the foreign country. The moment the agent in the foreign country is there there's far greater follow-up – the student has somewhere locally to go. So that is working quite well.<sup>110</sup>

The Committee recognises the importance of the work of agents in attracting international students to Tasmania and supports the bringing of agents to Tasmania to experience what the State has to offer.

#### 4.5.8 Internet websites

The internet is regarded as a powerful marketing tool which allows potential students from around the globe to readily access information. Most Tasmanian institutions use the internet to promote their educational product. All the major education providers have excellent, informative websites with detailed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> Jan Kuplis, op.cit., p. 12-13

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> ibid, p. 13

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> Alan Campbell, op.cit., p. 8

information regarding english language courses, international scholarship programs and generally have the capacity to undertake on-line applications. Websites facilitate a vast quantity of enquiries and are an excellent tool for individual institutions to showcase their curriculum and facilities.

#### 4.6 Language Skill

The capacity to succeed is dependent on a student's ability to comprehend and utilise English. There is significant potential to expand the English language teaching area in Tasmania, to provide pre-course English training so that international students can go on to cope better with higher education.

DIMIA has an interest also in English language proficiency in that certain tertiary graduates can go on to apply for permanent residency under the skilled migration program. English language proficiency is a key factor to successful settlement and employment in Australia.

The introduction of the Intensive English Language Testing System (IELTS) as the standard English language proficiency test has introduced consistency and transparency to the English language proficiency requirements.

As a consequence of the Review of the 2001 Student Visa Reforms the Australian Government will amend legislation to introduce an English language proficiency requirement from 1 April 2004 for school sector students outside Australia aged sixteen years or over from high risk countries.

The Committee notes that DIMIA has written individually to each school-sector provider to inform them of this change. The Committee understands from evidence received that the introduction of this new English language proficiency requirement will certainly impact on Tasmania's future international student numbers, particularly out of China. As Mr Kilpatrick from the DOE said earlier this year when this change was still being considered:

"what they [students] will do is they will go to New Zealand or the UK instead where there is not a requirement. It is not a possibility for them to come out of schooling, which is eleven or twelve hours a day for many of these students, to then go and prepare for an IELTS test".<sup>111</sup>

The Committee notes the new English language proficiency requirements. These requirements discriminate against those students who wish to travel to Australia for the sole purpose of becoming proficient in the English language.

The Committee recommends that the Tasmanian and Australian Governments consider varying this requirement to enable such students to travel to Tasmania for the sole purpose of studying English.

Another aspect of the English language problem was dealt with in the submission of the Anti-Discrimination Commissioner, Dr Jocelynne Scutt, and her colleagues. They outlined the problems students have with lecturers

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> Department of Education, David Kilpatrick, transcript, March 2003, p. 6

speaking too quickly and students being unwilling to complain.<sup>112</sup> These problems highlight the need not only to focus on developing English language skills but also to look at ways where modification or adjustment can be made in terms of the delivery of material. Our major providers in Tasmania provide opportunities to develop English language skills. The Committee notes the work and role of the Tasmanian College of English in this regard.

### 4.7 Co-operative Approach

Some providers have made concerted efforts to work together and with Government to develop strategies to capitalise on marketing the education product more effectively. The formation of the Tasmanian Education Alliance is a very positive outcome whereby providers jointly undertake a range of marketing related activities.

TGSI and TAFE Tasmania work separately and co-operatively with the IEMU to market Tasmania as a centre of educational excellence. Further the State Government and the UTAS have developed a partnership agreement. Schedule 6 of this agreement specifically relates to international education and sets out the issues, strategies and performance indicators agreed to. The two key issues that the parties have identified are:

- the need to increase the number of overseas students enrolled at the UTAS, TAFE Tasmania and schools in Tasmania; and
- the need to improve the rate of conversion of students already studying at Tasmanian Government schools and TAFE Tasmania into the UTAS.

The Committee believes that the same issues apply to Independent Schools.

The partnership agreement also sets out strategies that the parties will employ. These strategies include joint marketing initiatives where appropriate in terms of:

- joint representation of each other's programs where appropriate;
- pooling of market intelligence;
- shared space at education exhibitions where feasible;
- expansion of marketing strategies and materials which promote Tasmania as a destination;
- collaboration in bringing educational agents and other international visitors to Tasmania.

Other strategies relate to a pathways approach through all levels of education; collaboration on international projects; and the pooling of resources for the internationalisation of the education sectors in Tasmania.<sup>113</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Anti-Discrimination Commission, transcript, October 2002, p. 1-2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, op.cit, p. 3-4

The Committee notes the identification by the Industry Audits Report in 1999 of Intred Australia, a consortium comprising the University of Tasmania, the AMC and TAFE Tasmania. As described in the Report the primary role of InTred is to market to international students more than two hundred Tasmanian training and educational courses from certificate through to degree level, masters and doctorates of philosophy."<sup>114</sup>

The AMC is a national educational institution, funded by the Commonwealth Government. While the State Government is supportive of the AMC's operations, it does not contribute to its funding. Marketing and recruiting is carried out by the AMC from its own resources.

The AMC has however participated in joint marketing exercises coordinated by the Tasmanian Government. It was part of the promotional and marketing brochure which was produced to showcase all aspects of the State's educational offerings.<sup>115</sup>

The Institute of TAFE and the AMC have also worked cooperatively in Kuwait.

The AMC has been active in Kuwait through its commercial arm, AMC Search, since 1993. The AMC submission indicates that this year a range of mainstream programs would be offered in Kuwait in partnership with the Australian College of Kuwait.<sup>116</sup>

The Committee was also advised by submission that The Hutchins School is a member of the Tasmanian Independent Schools Overseas Student Services (TISOSS) which allows participation in overseas marketing efforts and provides a structure for closer liaison with the DED's education marketing unit. The Committee is aware that a number of other schools are members of TISOSS. The Committee sees this as positive.

#### 4.8 A Pathways Approach

A Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) exists between all the providers of education services in Tasmania which reinforces a pathways approach to marketing Tasmanian educational opportunities.

Though schools, TAFE and the UTAS each have a different educational focus, they often undertake joint marketing activities overseas to reinforce the concept of an educational pathway that is available to students from school through to tertiary level.<sup>117</sup>

#### 4.9 Marketing Results

There have been limited tools to adequately measure the success of marketing campaigns to date.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Tasmanian Industry Audits: Government Services, 1999, p. 4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Dr Neil Otway, Principal, AMC, submission, May 2002, p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> ibid, p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> Government response to Tasmanian Industry Audits: Government Services, August 1999

One way is to assess expenditure of the marketing exercise against income generated, though this is not a simple task. Private providers might treat this information as commercial in confidence, although Government should be able to provide data for the cost of its marketing activities. However, this method does not take into account the many non-economic benefits of encouraging international students to study in Tasmania.

Providers who have set targets are able to measure targeted figures against those achieved in order to evaluate their success. The UTAS indicated:

"Following each intake, a thorough review is undertaken by the University to measure actual student numbers against targets."<sup>118</sup>

Similarly TGSI is able to measure actual numbers against those targeted. The targeted number of international fee paying students for TGSI for 2001 was 250. The actual number of students was 278 thereby exceeding the target. However, the target for 2002 was 300 students whereas the actual number reached was 266.<sup>119</sup>

The Committee realises the difficulties in setting targets, and target numbers over only two years are not sufficient evidence on which to base any conclusions. However, the Committee is of the view that further marketing endeavours will assist in the meeting of desired targets.

In their partnership agreement the UTAS and the Government agreed that the performance indicators to be used would be:

- a greater proportion of International students progressing from schools and TAFE Tasmania to the University of Tasmania by 2002.
- improved market share for all Tasmanian education providers by 2002.<sup>120</sup>

Indeed, these seem to be the best available indicators of marketing success. Information provided to the DOE by Ms Sue Lacey from the UTAS, indicates that the first of the measures is being met -

"In 2003, 22 fee paying international students commenced study at the University of Tasmania after completing Year 12 in a Tasmanian school (government and non-government sector) This represents a slight increase in comparison with 2002, when 16 fee paying international students enrolled at the University of Tasmania."<sup>121</sup>

This is encouraging as the majority of international students who complete secondary education in Tasmania travel interstate to pursue their tertiary education.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, op.cit., p. 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> Simon Barnsley, Acting Secretary, Department of Education, letter dated 19 August 2003, p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, op.cit., p. 4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> Simon Barnsley, op.cit., p. 1

As to the second performance indicator relating to market share, there is evidence that, in absolute terms, numbers of international students are increasing in the major sectors. For example, in 2001 there were 223 international students attending the Institute of TAFE Tasmania, which represented 0.78% of the TAFE total student population. Figures for 2003 show growth, with 252 international students attending which represents 0.87% of the TAFE total student population.<sup>122</sup> This is a positive trend and indicates success in current marketing practices.

#### 4.10 Weaknesses Of Current Marketing Practices

Under its Terms of Reference, the Committee invited comment on the effectiveness or otherwise of marketing methods used to recruit international students to Tasmania. This led to some constructive criticism that might be noted in terms of future marketing as well as the way we deal with overseas students in other ways.

Lack of knowledge about Tasmania as a destination is one major criticism. Clearly if Tasmania is unheard of as a place, let alone as an educational destination, then we are at a distinct disadvantage. The UTAS submission refers to the lack of awareness of Tasmania overseas, citing the ABS statistic that Tasmania receives less than one per cent of international tourist visits to Australia.<sup>123</sup> Further, a former Malaysian student, now a law graduate of the UTAS, stated: "I have also had the unfortunate experience of being asked by fellow peers where is Tasmania? Some of them don't even know that it is in Australia." <sup>124</sup>

Similarly Mr Hans Kelder who has taught in China, stated that "the Australian Embassy in Beijing had very little promotional material from Tasmania [whereas] other states were covered reasonably well."<sup>125</sup>

It is important also that information is accurate and that Tasmania is marketed as a place in its own right. Mr Kelder also said that "at the Beijing Australian Education Exhibition, which was highly promoted on China English Radio and attracted many people, the University of Tasmania was promoted under the State of Victoria."<sup>126</sup>.

Witnesses have cited lack of marketing dollars as a major hurdle to effective marketing. China does continue to provide a "window of opportunity". Whilst the market may be strong, access to it can be limited by the level of financial resources available to undertake marketing activities as opportunities present themselves.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> ibid, p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, op.cit., p. 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup> Email to Rick Snell, University of Tasmania Law School

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>125</sup> Hans Kelder, op.cit., p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> ibid, p. 2

Evidence received suggested that the State Government provides no State budget funding to international education.<sup>127</sup>

The IEMU located within the DED, is funded by the DOE and TAFE Tasmania. The submission from the DED of November 2001 indicated a combined allocated budget of \$297,00 which provided for the salaries for three full-time staff members as well as marketing expenses. Staffing costs accounted at that time for fifty-six per cent of the combined allocated budget.<sup>128</sup>

Whilst innovative and marketable programs and models are being developed, these do need to be supported in terms of financial resources available to promote and sell the product.

Criticism was levelled at the operations of the IEMU. It was contended that, being responsible for marketing the two public providers, the IEMU is at odds with any contribution it might make for the other providers. It was also contended that in the time it has existed - since April 1999 - the IEMU has not been able to capitalise on linkages with other areas of the DSD (now DED) such as Tourism Tasmania. It was also claimed that the IEMU has conducted marketing trips with no apparent outcomes in terms of student recruitment.<sup>129</sup>

The Committee merely notes these claims. The Committee well understands that to grow numbers and avoid a plateau in numbers additional effort must go into marketing. There is no evidence before the Committee to test the claims made above. However, in evidence to the Committee Mr Alan Campbell from the DED indicated the returns from the dollars spent on the marketing effort are within expectations.<sup>130</sup>

Lack of coordination across all current providers was seen by many to be a weakness. However, the fact that there will be competition between some providers means this will not be easy to resolve. It was suggested that Tasmania's small number of providers working with a common purpose under an agreed brand name may be able to improve our State's proportion of total international students.<sup>131</sup> The Committee does recognise that greater cooperation and collaboration between the sectors is an essential element in securing the best possible outcomes in terms of accessing new markets and growing numbers.

A claim was also made that there has been an over-reliance on the Chinese market by providers to the detriment of developing other new markets.<sup>132</sup>

Australia-wide most international students are coming from Asia. The Committee accepts that China is a major market however, it recognises that there ought to be a focus on other emerging markets. As stated by Mr Alan Campbell:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup> Greg Calvert, op.cit., p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Jeff Kelly, CEO, Department of State Development, background briefing submission, November 2001, p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> Greg Calvert, op.cit., p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup> Alan Campbell, op.cit., p. 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> Greg Calvert, op.cit., p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> ibid, p. 5

"it is not good to have all the eggs in one basket at any stage...we have to keep the balance"<sup>133</sup>

The Committee notes that in Queensland there is a strong focus on new markets, particularly Scandanavian countries and also countries in South America.

Further witnesses to the inquiry pointed out that international students who have completed courses often have knowledge only of their Faculty or School. The TUU suggested that there needed to be more effort put into enlightening students about the wider UTAS programs so they can take that information home with them.<sup>134</sup>

The Committee agrees that it would be of immense value to have graduating international students act as "ambassadors" for UTAS. Therefore to broaden students' knowledge beyond their own Faculty or School to the wider activities and programs of the UTAS would be positive and may well serve in attracting the attention of prospective students.

#### 4.11 **Opportunities for Improvement**

#### 4.11.1 Niche marketing and Tasmania's strengths

It is clear to the Committee that:

- Tasmania has something unique that it can offer the world as a educational destination for international students; and that
- Tasmania must focus on specific niche markets overseas where there may well be an untapped demand for Tasmania's education product.

The Committee notes that there were two aspects of "niche" market identified by witnesses – first, that Tasmania is a niche market, and second that there are niche markets overseas that we can tap into.

Many witnesses referred to the relative safety and security that the Tasmanian environment offers, particularly in the wake of recent and continued terrorist activities. The submission from The Hutchins School encapsulates this sentiment:

"There is a niche market in Tasmania within the Hobart environment for parents who are seeking safety, cleanliness, and freedom from terrorism. The events of 11 September may see a shift of students away from America to Australia. Another reason for their coming is that parents are

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> Alan Campbell op.cit., p. 9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> Ted Alexander, past President, Tasmania University Union, submission, March 2003, p. 2-3

attracted to cities that are not as big as Sydney, with distractions such as drugs.<sup>135</sup>

Therefore the marketing of Tasmania as an educational destination could well focus strongly on a lifestyle approach in attracting students.

Tasmania also offers an increased opportunity for overseas students to interact with local Tasmanians rather than becoming emerged in subcultures of their own country as can and does occur in, say, Sydney or Melbourne. Again The Hutchins School submission stated:

"They [parents] also want an environment where their children will not have the opportunity to mix with many people from their own country, which can tend to inhibit their English language development."<sup>136</sup>

There was clearly a view on the part of witnesses that with the right "niche" marketing, Tasmania could considerably increase its market share. They highlighted many distinct strengths of Tasmania that would appeal to overseas students as a place for study as well as the need for these aspects to be featured in marketing activities and campaigns.

Tasmania does have considerable positive aspects should continually be emphasised for marketing purposes. These include:

- good educational standards and world-class reputation in certain specialist areas;
- relatively low tuition fees of UTAS compared to other universities in Australia and overseas;
- relatively low living costs;
- pristine environment and proximity to natural wilderness;
- a quieter lifestyle with fewer distractions than in the larger Australian cities;
- a perception as a safe place;
- relative freedom from violence and drugs;
- the availability of the UTAS scholarship program;
- the size of the main cities and towns and educational institutions is conducive to friendly communities.

#### 4.11.2 Longer term strategy

A number of comments were made by witnesses in terms of the improvement of current marketing practices. Certain evidence indicated that the approach to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> W D Toppin, Principal, The Hutchins School, op.cit., p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> ibid, p. 1

attracting international students demands a strategy that is long term and systematic. It was suggested that -

"The focus of the strategy should not be directed primarily at new projects and markets. Instead, the strategy should incorporate a program that fosters and invests in existing relationships with graduates and their parents so that they in turn recommend the State of Tasmania as the place to gain a unique and premium educational and cultural experience. Such a strategy is premised upon the provision of a high level of personal and pastoral care to students during their time in Tasmania. This will provide the foundation for continuing and enduring relationships in the future".<sup>137</sup>

#### 4.11.3 Use of agents

Comments were made about the need to improve one of the traditional marketing methods, that of using agents in overseas countries. It is important to provide agents with a Tasmanian experience, as well as building a relationship of trust and faith with them. When so many nations are vying for international students, it is vital that Tasmanian providers and the Government retain good and ethical agents.

It has been claimed the role agents play in the recruitment of international students is pivotal, and indeed they are the link. There is no doubt that when an agent is available overseas the capacity to follow-up with students is much improved. Whilst email is a useful tool it is far better for the student to have someone local to contact and to whom they can personally go to for advice and assistance.

Mr Greg Calvert suggested in his submission that a scheme of Tasmanian accredited educational agents should be investigated and incentives such as familiarisation visits to Tasmania for agents be investigated.<sup>138</sup>

The Committee is supportive of the further consideration of this type of proposal. Such a scheme would in the Committee's view build upon the practice which has occurred of bringing agents to Tasmania.

#### 4.11.4 Status and specialised programs

The status of the educational institution is undoubtedly important to many international students and their families. Witnesses commented on the need to market in order to elevate the status of the UTAS or indeed Tasmania generally as an educational destination. Like Australian students, many overseas students use the *Good Universities Guide* in making their choice of which university to attend. Status is of great importance, particularly to some cultural groups. A former Malaysian student commented that:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>137</sup>Rick Snell and Lisa Butler, UTAS Law School, op.cit., p. 6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> Greg Calvert, op.cit., p. 3

"it is very Asian for parents to try and out-do one another" ... "especially Chinese families feel that it is important to maintain status".<sup>139</sup>

The former student noted also the importance in Malaysia of the name of the university and that the name of the University of Melbourne is well recognised and has status attached to it, whilst the UTAS is not well recognised.

The submission by the NLC included the following point:

"We must understand that the international academic standing of the nation is influenced by the quality and reputation of its university and any other educational institution. Thus the promotion of good quality education should be a matter of higher priority not only for the institution but the local government as well. From the observation made in our current capacity of representation, we are of the opinion that in the effort of developing international education in Tasmania, the general direction seems to be focused on the marketing of the industry and not much has been done to maintain, if not improve, the above favourable position that Tasmania enjoys".<sup>140</sup>

There may well be the potential to further market the vocational education and training (VET) aspect of education, as the State has excellent VET resources and outcomes. It has been suggested that TAFE be used as a foundation year for tertiary education. Some witnesses referred to the potential Indian market for VET studies and the possibility of establishing an agent network in India.

The need for the State to focus on specialised or tailored courses has been touched upon. There seems to be some further potential in this area. Tailored short courses to provide entry to further studies would be attractive to many international students.

Associate Professor Richard Herr of the UTAS made a very interesting point in his submission when he commented on the potential for Tasmania to establish a "Tasmanian Centre for Island Studies" at the tertiary level. This has been noted previously in this Report. Associate Professor Herr believes there is a genuine educational opportunity in training to meet the special needs of small island communities. In his submission he said:

"However, if the opportunity represented by such an international need were to be utilised, it would be necessary to establish an appropriate centre to draw together the strengths Tasmania has in 'islandness'.<sup>141</sup>

Associate Professor Herr further commented:

"Clearly, I believe the 'Tasmanian Centre for Island Studies' could be marketed widely. More than just the small islands, developing states would be interested in meeting the special needs of small islands. There are large numbers of small islands associated with large states that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>139</sup> Email attached to Rick Snell and Lisa Butler submission from Iwan Rashman bin Gulamoydeen, UTAS Law Graduate working in Malaysia.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> Ching Ching Ko, NLC, op.cit., p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>141</sup> Associate Professor Richard Herr, submission, June 2002, p. 2

would be willing to send students to the 'Tasmanian Centre for Island Studies' if it offered the training programmes they need to meet their own special needs."<sup>142</sup>

Examples of expertise available in Tasmania with value for island nations and states suggested by Associate Professor Herr include:

- island fire-fighting techniques;
- aquaculture in an island environment;
- harbour development; and
- communications and transport services.<sup>143</sup>

The 1999 Government Services Audit also focused on the need to build upon the specialised courses experience:

"Niche products could be configured for these markets, building on local centres of excellence and combining related subjects into imaginative course combinations. Comprehensive courses in development-related subjects such as aquaculture or rural health could be appealing to overseas students, particularly from increasingly affluent China or the communities of South East Asia."<sup>144</sup>

The report noted that Tasmania has demonstrated a capacity to develop niche markets, particularly in those areas around the world that share similar geographic, climatic and demographic characteristics.<sup>145</sup>

The Committee supports any extension of funding by Government and the educational institutions aimed at expanding educational marketing into niche markets.

The submission from Mr John Backhouse drew attention to the fact that international students are attracted to sporting and recreational activities that are unique and readily accessible in Tasmania compared with their home countries. Mr Backhouse cited examples of recreational fishing and rugby union, indicating that rugby union offers a unique international sport to both men and women. He commented that the UTAS fields three men's and one women's team on a statewide roster.<sup>146</sup>

Tasmania does offer a wide range of sporting and other recreational activities and this may well be an area that providers can further tap into when undertaking marketing.

<sup>145</sup> ibid, p. 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>142</sup> ibid, p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>143</sup> Associate Professor Richard Herr, transcript, October 2002, p. 8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>144</sup> Tasmanian Industry Audits: Government Services, August 1999, p. 25

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>146</sup> John Backhouse, submission, February 2002, p. 2

### 4.11.5 Media use

It was not apparent from submissions how effectively the overseas media is used in advertising Tasmania as an education destination. The Committee was made aware however that in China one US college advertises on local radio and television.<sup>147</sup> It has been indicated that TV advertising works best for families. This type of advertising is expensive, however it is claimed that this is really the only viable method of arousing parents and students interest.<sup>148</sup>

The Committee agrees that this type of advertising is a very powerful means of delivering Tasmania's educational message overseas and would encourage further consideration of this method.

### 4.12 Future Marketing Opportunity

The Committee recognises that future opportunities, particularly at the tertiary level, are in expanding into new markets; the further development of offshore programs; the augmentation of post graduate courses; and the growth in enrolments at the English Language Centre at the UTAS and other English language centres.

Restated, Professor Lidl indicated:

"There are other factors which affect the University's ability to attract Full Fee Paying Overseas students (FFPOS)...A major limiting factor in terms of increasing FFPOS on campus is the capacity of the more popular courses to expand their intake. Architecture, Medicine, Pharmacy, Engineering, Information Systems (postgraduate) either have strict quotas or have reached the limits of their capacity to take any more FFPOS."<sup>149</sup>

The need to educate the Tasmanian public about the importance of international students to our economy, and the objective of making these students welcome and ensuring they have positive experiences while in Tasmania, cannot be overstated. People who have been educated here and who have had positive experiences form an important link to future study and tourism visitations.

Education marketing currently takes many forms. Personal contacts, industry exhibitions, school visits, publications, exchanges, study tours, the Internet and radio and television advertising are all used. However 'word of mouth' probably remains the most potent marketing tool in attracting international students. This is well recognised and consequently much effort needs to be channelled into providing a quality educational experience to international students. With that of course comes the associated need to provide appropriate support for these students.

Past and current marketing techniques have met with a measure of success. International student numbers are growing. Any assessment of effectiveness

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>147</sup> Hans Kelder, submission, op.cit., p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>148</sup> Jan Kuplis, submission, op.cit., p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, submission, November 2001, p.5

must be balanced by the fact that Tasmanian education providers appear to have a strong desire to provide support services for overseas students and appreciate that a quality product and experience should not be compromised.

The Committee shares the view that the marketing focus should not just be on getting large numbers of students into the State and agrees that a focus on qualifying students, establishing career pathways and developing tailored and specialised courses must remain high on Tasmania's agenda.

It is further apparent that it is vital that advertising techniques utilised must also be targeted to those who will be making decisions about an education overseas - that is, the parents.

As Mrs Jan Kuplis pointed out in her submission:

"Except in the post-graduate area, it is most often the parents who will pay the fees and therefore need to be convinced of the value of an overseas education. In Asia, the parents make the decisions for their children until they are about 30 years old. Whatever enthusiasm a young person may have for studying overseas, it is the parents who must be persuaded in the end, or in most cases, it doesn't happen."<sup>150</sup>

The Committee strongly supports any measures which educate parents about Tasmania as a possible future education destination for their children. This would have most impact if the advertising material was in the language of the country being targeted. Familiarisation visits for parents and study tours for prospective students should be encouraged.

There is a need for further market research to analyse student profiles in order to gain reliable data on why current students choose Tasmania over other institutions in Australia, or indeed overseas, and to determine what future strategies will be effective in targeting students.

Due to the financial resources involved, providers are looking to maximise their returns on the marketing dollar being expended. There is strong opinion that Tasmania must promote itself as one unified educational destination and that subsequent benefits would flow on to all providers, whether that be the UTAS, TAFE, Government and private schools or others. The Committee supports this contention. Collaboration and cooperation are the cornerstones of improved recruitment of international students. This may well require future change in the way providers conduct their business; with such a small state and population, a pooling of resources is desirable.

In evidence Mr Andrew Barr, Principal of Scotch Oakburn College said:

"I am just thinking of the marketing and of working together – Government, University, and schools. I think they can work together to promote. I'm probably speaking from Launceston's point of view rather than across the State – but this is a wonderfully rich learning centre, a very historical learning centre and we could market that very strongly. I

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>150</sup> Jan Kuplis, op.cit., P. 14

think it is to an extent, but it is a bit fragmented. Dare I say it, my main competitor is the oldest continuing Independent school and there's just such a wonderful rich history of education here across both the Independent and State system. I just think we could really work on that and get them together and I think that Government is the only body that can do that."<sup>151</sup>

The importance of feedback provided by students to others in their home country cannot be over emphasised. If students have negative experiences such as those involving racism, poor housing and insufficient educational resources, that will result in negative feedback. Tasmania cannot entirely separate marketing from the educational experience that students have. There is a need to focus not only on advertising to sell the product, but on providing a quality product in the first instance so that it can sell itself through 'word-of-mouth'.

The concept of developing niche markets requires further investigation. Tasmania's special attributes and its specific appeal must be the focus of future marketing campaigns, particularly in a world with heightened political and social tensions and the continued fear of terrorism. Tasmania's unique attributes, which include our relative safety and security, our smaller cities within close proximity to a pristine environment, our lower cost of living and lower tuition fees, must be further capitalised upon.

The demand to broaden existing markets however, must be balanced against criticisms that there can be an over-emphasis on marketing when there should be a greater emphasis on maintaining or improving the quality of the educational experience. Any consideration of marketing must include continual efforts to improve the product being marketed.

#### Recommendations

The Committee recommends:

- (1) That continued opportunities in new markets be explored.
- (2) That the combined marketing of academic programs and recreational pursuits be investigated.
- (3) That future marketing campaigns have an emphasis on parents of students as they, in many cases, make the decisions.
- (4) That the use of familiarisation and study tours be increasingly used to give parents, prospective students and agents an experience of Tasmanian institutions and environment.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>151</sup> Andrew Barr, Principal, Scotch Oakburn College, transcript, March 2003, p. 12

- (5) That wherever practicable emphasis be placed on providing marketing material in the language of the country where the marketing effort is focused.
- (6) That there be increased collaboration and co-operation between the various sectors of education providers in marketing and recruiting international students.
- (7) That surveys be conducted in selected markets to assess the type of short or tailored courses which may appeal to prospective students.

# **Pastoral Care and Assistance**

# Part 5

Term of Reference 5 – The level and adequacy of the pastoral care and assistance given to international students in Tasmania.

Due to its smaller population and size Tasmania has an advantage over larger and more populous States in terms of establishing a good reputation for pastoral care and assistance to international students.

Tasmania has a well-earned reputation for being a welcoming and friendly place to visit and in which to live. Visitors find Tasmanians not only friendly but also helpful. There is a need to capitalise on the opportunities that these characteristics present to make pastoral care a definite marketing feature and advantage in endeavours to attract more international students.

This attitude is clearly recognised by the UTAS. In his evidence to the Committee Professor Rudi Lidl said:

"The one aspect that we stress quite strongly in international exhibitions and interactions with Asians and other education agencies is that we are a small to medium sized university. The pastoral care aspect, the accessibility, the possibility of interaction between university staff members - that's academics and general staff - and the student, is much better here than in many other places. We also pride ourselves that our international services section, for example, places great emphasis on pastoral care and we can demonstrate that through aspects of predeparture care that we take of students, on arrival - meeting them at the airport, providing briefing sessions about the cultural life. It is not about the academic program. You start with lecture one and do assignments and so on, it has to do with where do you find a doctor and banking, how do you do your shopping and living et cetera. That can be done because we are a small university and it can be done very much at an interactive level with smaller groups of students. It is those aspects that enhance the educational experience of students."<sup>152</sup>

He went on to say:

"..... informally, prior to graduation sessions, for example, I host small group meetings with the students and their parents because for graduations, parents fly in from overseas. It is a very big occasion and so we want to make it bigger and more special by inviting the parents with students to a small reception hosted normally by me."<sup>153</sup>

The submission from the Friends' School made the point that Independent Schools provided their own pastoral care and that this was of a high standard. Mr Bill Toppin, Principal of The Hutchins School said:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>152</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, transcript, October 2002, p.4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>153</sup> ibid, p.4

"I think it is a school issue, not a State issue, and rather than waste your time in giving a long answer to it, it is hard work and we think we are doing it probably as well as we can for the dollars we put in."<sup>154</sup>

Mr Christopher Hall, Director of Development at The Hutchins School added:

"There is an enormous amount of care and it takes up a lot of time and a lot of dollars."  $^{\rm 155}$ 

The Committee acknowledges the points made in the above submissions. It is of the opinion however that at the tertiary level especially an opportunity exists for State and combined institutions' involvement.

Opinions varied on this subject. When asked about the value of this wider role in pastoral care, Ms Helen Cox, Director of the Tasmanian College of English said:

"I think everything is of value. The educational institutions are mainly able to provide that. They have their own counsellors, their own activities' programs so I think while it's nice to have, I wouldn't see it as essential."<sup>156</sup>

On this issue the joint submission made by the DSD (now DED), the DOE, the Institute of TAFE Tasmania and the UTAS reads:

"For an institution to retain its registration as a provider for international students, an appropriate level of pastoral care must be maintained. Pastoral care is provided on an individual institution basis and includes student counselling services, advocacy support, dispute resolution support, accommodation services, English language support, learning support, monitoring of academic achievement, and the provision of emergency contact numbers for after hours use.

The Department of Education commits considerable resources to assuming the responsibility for accommodation and welfare arrangements for students under the age of 18, and strives to achieve high quality care in this area. Similarly, the University of Tasmania puts significant effort into accommodation services, including arranging homestay.

The majority of Tasmania's international students have sufficient financial resources to fund their full-time study. Evidence does not suggest that additional financial assistance is required by these students. The existing pastoral services provided are considered adequate."<sup>157</sup>

Ms Merren Dalgleish and Ms Toni McWaide, Tasmanian Branch Representatives, ISANA International Education Association gave the following evidence:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>154</sup> W D Toppin, Principal, The Hutchins School, transcript, October 2000, p. 22

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>155</sup> Christopher Hall, Director of Development, The Hutchins School, transcript, October 2002, p. 23

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>156</sup> Helen Cox, op.cit., p. 14

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>157</sup> Joint submission, op.cit., p. 6

"Ms Dalgleish: ..... but in terms of the pastoral care the student support I think is the poor relative."

Ms McWaide: I think the experience of our members is that our students perceive the support staff to be extremely busy. They often actually apologise to us for taking up our time, so the students' perception of the support staff is that they do not have a lot of time and they do not have a lot of resources, and that they are very busy people. We really would like to change that. Not that we don't want to be busy, but it is probably not a good perception for the students to have.

Ms Dalgleish: We're obviously not meeting the students' needs if they feel they can't come and receive the support that they need."<sup>158</sup>

International Students Officer, Students Association Inc at the UTAS in Launceston, Mr Chun-Wah Chin, provided a written submission and also appeared before the Committee. He expressed the view that pastoral care for international students was adequate but there is room for improvement in that more attention to assist new students to fit into a new culture would be welcomed. He pointed out that basic airport pickups and student accommodation arrangements are provided. In his evidence he said:

"Last year [2001] the University set up a mentorship system, but I haven't heard much about it. I think the effort has been made but maybe something is not working. It's not failing to work but it's not working."<sup>159</sup>

A former member of CISSTAS, Mr Mike McCausland, made the following points in his written submission sent from China:

"More could be done by some institutions to ensure that arriving students' needs are met and that a climate of mutual trust is established from the beginning ..... I have most experience of the University and AMC's efforts in this regard, and believe the officers responsible for caring for international students there do an excellent job. Academic staff, and the student body, at times do not show the same level of care."<sup>160</sup>

In a written submission provided by Dr Jocelynne Scutt, Anti-Discrimination Commissioner, and three members of the Commission's staff, the following well considered and detailed suggestions were made:

"Mentoring of International Students

2. Each campus which has international students attending ought to establish and operate a volunteer mentoring system where the needs of international students can be recognised, monitored and supported by a person from their own cultural group:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>158</sup> Merren Dalgleish and Toni McWaide, Representatives, ISANA International Education Association, transcript, October 2002, p. 4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>159</sup> Chun-Wah Chin, International Students Officer, Students Association Inc., UTAS Launceston Campus, transcript, October 2002, p. 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>160</sup> Mike McCausland, submission, April 2002, p. 2

- (a) Many international students initially feel isolated and some international students find it difficult to approach people in authority when they are experiencing problems, for cultural reasons:
  - a mentoring system where a more senior international student initially from the same cultural group as the newly arrived student acts as a mentor to the new student would ensure that the new student has an avenue where they can discuss and address any difficulties and concerns they may be having. As the mentor will have been a student at the college/university for some time, they will be able to impart useful advice and support to the newly arrived student;
  - a parallel mentoring system provided by 'main stream' senior students to be a mentor to an international student would enhance cultural exchange, awareness and understanding among students, with the international students being mentored and supported, and they in turn providing new knowledge and understanding to the 'main stream' students.
- (b) The mentoring system could operate on a volunteer basis and would ensure that there is ongoing monitoring of the needs of international students *and* an ongoing opportunity for 'mainstream' students to be 'linked into' the lives and awareness of international students, their needs, understandings and offering of 'new' information and cultural information.

Cross-Cultural Training and Awareness - Educational Institutions

- 3. Cross cultural training is essential for all who have responsibilities towards international students (including professors, lecturers, teachers, supervisors, tutors, administrative staff and resource people, etc).
  - (a) Many difficulties and misunderstandings between international students and their teachers, lecturers, tutors, supervisors etc arise due to a lack of understanding about cultural differences and the way in which the cultural background of the international student impacts upon their approach to their study and the way they interact with teachers and other students. Cross cultural training offered to people who have responsibilities towards international students could reduce the likelihood of misunderstandings occurring.
  - (b) Administrative staff have responsibilities in relation to all students and providing information about various aspects of the institution, programmes, documents, completion of

records, enrolment, etc and they are greatly disadvantaged if they have no training in awareness of cultural difference and language difficulties, etc that international students may experience, and that staff may experience because they do not have additional language skills. They ought not to be left in a position where they can feel threatened or inadequate in doing their job.

- 4. Measures ought to be put in place to encourage the successful integration of international students into the social life of the college or University where they are studying. Measures which could be adopted to increase participation of international students in the social life of the university/college in which they are studying include:
  - (a) Cultural information about the needs of different cultural groups (such as particular food/drink needs) needs to be available and disseminated to heads of societies or the organisers of social events. This would encourage international students to attend a social event without having to worry about the food/drink at the function. For instance, some Asian students are reluctant to attend social events at university as they are worried that there will be no nonalcoholic drinks available.
  - (b) Each large society at university could have an international officer to actively encourage the membership and participation of international students in the social events organised by the society.
  - (c) It seems that the International Students' Officer at the Tasmanian University Union (TUU) is a single position representing all cultural groups. To ensure that the needs of all groups are being addressed, a subcommittee made up of various cultural groups could be formed to advise and support the person in the position of International Students Officer.
  - (d) It is important to ensure that people nominating for election to the position of International Student Officer are genuine international students and not students from an international background who were born in Tasmania, to ensure that the person holding the post has a 'lived' experience of what it is to be in Tasmania from another country, and to be an international student with all that that entails."

Cross-Cultural Training and Awareness – General Community

5. The wider community needs the opportunity to gain information about the needs of international students to encourage their integration into the wider community, and to encourage understanding and awareness on the part of Tasmanians vis-à-vis the lives and cultural of international students and their countries.

- (a) Public lectures or seminars open to members of the public or local community about the needs of international students could encourage their integration and acceptance into the wider community.
- (b) Public lectures or seminars open to the public and local community would ensure that there is some opportunity for members of the public and the local community to learn about other countries and cultures from international students who are 'on the spot' with all their learning and the valuable contribution they can make to the understanding of all Tasmanians of the place of Tasmania in the wider world, and in relation to other countries and other cultures."<sup>161</sup>

Ms Janet Harrington submitted that the question of pastoral care needs to be well addressed by the Tasmanian Government and pointed out that every care and attention should be given to international students "before they arrive here, whilst they are here and after they return to their homeland".<sup>162</sup> She said the importance of this could not be over-estimated. Ms Harrington advocated orientation sessions in the country of origin, similar sessions upon the student's arrival in Tasmania and a debriefing after the student returns home following completion of studies. She said "this would demonstrate the care and concern international students deserve".<sup>163</sup>

In further advocating that a realistic picture of Australia should be portrayed to students before they arrive here she said that "this would reduce the culture shock students experience, which in turn would provide them with more time and energies for their studies".<sup>164</sup>

In her submission Ms Harrington made the following helpful suggestions:

"It would be valuable for each international student to have the name of their own student contact officer to whom they can take their troubles to. These contact officers would ideally contact the international student regularly and check upon their wellbeing.

International students would ideally have their own round table or representative body with elected members from the various educational institutions such as the University of Tasmania, TAFE, Senior Secondary College, High School and English Colleges and others. This body would take international student concerns to other senior authorities or to a government level and act as a great support for overseas students as well as a line of grievance."<sup>165</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>161</sup> Anti-Discrimination Commission, submission, May 2002, p. 3-5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>162</sup> Janet Harrington, submission, April 2002, p. 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>163</sup> ibid, p. 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>164</sup> ibid, p. 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>165</sup> ibid, p. 5

The importance of a student support framework is further emphasised in the evidence given by Ms Santi Mariso, Community Education and Liaison Officer of the Anti-Discrimination Commission who said:

"Support groups from the community are very helpful or from other students from the same country, at least at the initial settling in, may be the first few months, that would be helpful to make them feel secure."<sup>166</sup>

When asked about the effect that CISSTAS had Ms Mariso said:

"It helped, but I think if it was student to student peer group support it would be more helpful, because that support was for I suppose welfare, like a host family system here."<sup>167</sup>

Mrs Jan Kuplis emphasised that Chinese students, in particular, "are not into pastoral care" but rather, they are more concerned about results. She expressed the view that sometimes well meaning people were over-protective of students of Chinese origin whose parents do not expect them to be unduly cared for. She said:

"they expect the students to struggle on their own and make the most of living in another culture - that is part of the whole learning experience ..... they want to be individual and they want to deal with their own problems only within their family."<sup>168</sup>

This Committee believes there remains a role for pastoral care, whether that be in a responsive or proactive sense.

Mrs Jan Kuplis did also support the holding of civic receptions and official welcomes for students and pointed out that the higher the status of the person who hosted the reception, the greater this would be appreciated.

The HCC's submission stated that:

"Based on discussions with international students and those who have worked with international students it seems the social support previously offered by the Council for International Student Support Tas Inc (CISSTAS) was very valuable to both students and home stay families. CISSTAS offered a coordinated approach to this support in the form of welcome picnics and linking students to local families through the Tassie Link project. However, CISSTAS is no longer in operation. The responsibility for this type of social support now falls to international students' advisers who are often under resourced to do this."<sup>169</sup>

Ms Deborah Brewer advocated the establishment of a social and recreational database for international students in Tasmania, containing personal contact names, contact information and general information about activities available to international students. She said that:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>166</sup> Anti-Discrimination Commission, Santi Mariso, transcript, October 2002, p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>167</sup> ibid, p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>168</sup> Jan Kuplis, transcript, June 2002, p. 34-35

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>169</sup> V B Armstrong, General Manager, Hobart City Council, op.cit., p. 6

"by facilitating international students' personal contact with a broad range of 'mainstream' recreational, cultural and sporting organizations, international students would be better able to establish their own personal, social and recreational network".<sup>170</sup>

The Law Faculty at the UTAS has instituted a somewhat unique International Student Support Program (ISSP) which has been of great benefit to international students and which many other institutions in Australia might do well to study and emulate. This program is based on an assisting each student to achieve the best possible academic results rather than merely aiming at a pass and emphasises the provision of pastoral care and support for students.

Commendably, the Faculty aims to provide "a unique and premium level of personal and pastoral care" and even when students return to their home countries the Faculty has an organised program to maintain contact with them. Information that the Faculty has gleaned from its graduates, their parents and employers shows that the students "have an enduring affection for Tasmania with many regarding it as their second home and a place to which they wish to return".<sup>171</sup>

Not only has this system greatly assisted students whilst in Tasmania but it has done much to enhance the reputation of the UTAS and obviously has relevance and importance in marketing terms. The submission made by Ms Lisa Butler and Mr Rick Snell gives the following outline of the ISSP:

"Principals and ideals of the program are as follow:

- To develop a strong working relationship with students and to maintain those relationships with graduates as they embark on professional careers in their home country;
- To take a pro-active approach that aims at preventing the usual problems encountered by international students at the start of their legal studies;
- To have an attitude of assisting each student to achieve the best results possible rather than just aiming at a pass during the course of their degree;
- To have an attitude of providing pastoral care and support for students; and
- To provide opportunities for students from several countries to work together in a co-operative environment.

The constituent features of the program are as follow:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>170</sup> Deborah Brewer, submission, April 2002, p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>171</sup> Lisa Butler and Rick Snell, UTAS Law School, op.cit., p. 4

- Mentoring and Supervision: Coordination of the ISSP entails supporting and providing pastoral care to international students. This role of mentoring and supervision involves -
  - (a) compulsory individual interviews with each student every semester for the purpose of: (i) checking on general wellbeing;
     (ii) reviewing attendance at mainstream and ISSP tutorials; (iii) reviewing assessment; and (iv) reviewing the progress of the ISSP; and
  - (b) being available for student consultation generally.
- Orientation Program for New Students: To assist students settle into the Faculty, a tutor is employed to conduct orientation sessions for new international students. During the initial orientation session students are given a tour of the Law School and Law Library as well as assistance with enrolments, e-mail accounts, student cards and SAPS accounts. Subsequent sessions address the components of the Australian legal system and some basic assignment skills including legal referencing.
- Tutorial Program: For each compulsory subject an ISSP tutorial program is conducted. A tutor is appointed for each subject (generally undergraduates who have demonstrated ability in the relevant subject). Each week the tutor will: (a) conduct a tutorial; and (b) be available for consultation for a period of an hour. The international students are expected to attend both the mainstream tutorials and the ISSP tutorials. Generally, the tutor will cover the law and tutorial topics being conducted in the mainstream classes as well as preparation for examinations.

In addition to tutorials for the compulsory subjects, tutorials are also conducted in Research. The object of the Research tutorials is to assist students undertaking subjects that are assessed by assignment.

• Social Events: Each semester at least one social event is organised for the international students, tutors, and general staff.

The success of the ISSP is evidenced not only by the increase of results received by students studying in Tasmania (with students even achieving at honours level) but also by the contact maintained by our graduates once they return to their home countries.

We put forward the details of the International Student Support Program not as a perfect model that should be adopted by each educational institution, but rather as an example of what can be achieved in the pursuance of a philosophy of pastoral care, guidance and establishment and maintenance of enduring relationships."<sup>172</sup>

<sup>86</sup> 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>172</sup> Lisa Butler and Rick Snell, op.cit., p. 5-6

The submission states that:

"The main purpose of CISSTAS and its member groups was to provide a community-based network of pastoral care and social support services for international students on a Statewide basis, through developing and coordinating local volunteers. Examples of member groups were the Tassie Link Program - matching students with families and individuals for hospitality and support, the Group of International Families - providing a regular support group for the spouses of international students, and the English for Spouses Group. These operated in both Hobart and Launceston, run by volunteers in the main."<sup>173</sup>

These services were provided to secondary students at state and independent high schools and colleges, TAFE, the UTAS and the AMC. The submission points out that for many years CISSTAS was acknowledged as one of the most successful coordinating committees in Australia.<sup>174</sup>

The submission further indicated that CISSTAS had the:

"unique ability to bring together all sectors of the international student industry and with only a paid part-time coordinator (20 hours per week) and the help of many willing and enthusiastic volunteers, CISSTAS was successfully able to coordinate volunteers with a minimum of cost and the maximum of value and flexibility to its sponsor organisations ........ Whilst Government agencies, large tertiary institutions and groups of colleges can deal with issues and needs on an individual basis, only CISSTAS was able to bring all those together on a Statewide basis whilst actively fostering that vital community link."<sup>175</sup>

The authors of the submission made the telling point that they believe:

"..... that international students' experience and thus the overall 'marketability' of Tasmania as an attractive place for students to come to, has been diminished since de-funding enforced the winding up of CISSTAS in August 2001."<sup>176</sup>

The Committee shares the submission's authors' regret expressed in the following terms:

"It is unfortunate that whilst making such a valuable contribution to the experience of international students State-wide, the State Government

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> Maria Taylor and Robin Bowden, submission, April 2002, p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>174</sup> ibid, p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>175</sup> ibid, p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>176</sup> ibid, p. 2

was unable to assist CISSTAS with sustainable funding despite repeated submissions over several years."<sup>177</sup>

As a result of the demise of CISSTAS there is now no integrated support base for international students in Tasmania, although individual institutions continue to provide their own pastoral care to varying degrees.

Ms Taylor pointed out that:

"Tasmania is ideally placed to be able to get something up like this or to at least promote it because we are really altogether in a small place and we all should be really working together."<sup>178</sup>

This does highlight the potential Tasmania has to further enhance its reputation for pastoral care as a means of assisting international students and as a marketing lever.

The submission of the AMC addressed the matter of pastoral care and assistance given to international students and made the following comments:

- "The educational institutions in Tasmania provide a high level of quality pastoral care and assistance to international students.
- It is important to realise that, in the case of tertiary students, we are dealing with adults. In the provision of support services, there is a continuum, which varies from the situation where a maximum level of support is required, as in a crisis situation, through to the situation where the students require minimum support and assume personal responsibility. In adult learning situations, the aim is to assist students towards the latter end of the continuum, where the students act as responsible self-directing adults. In the initial stages, international students may require more assistance, but in a normal developmental situation, there is a shift towards the other end of the continuum. Failure to understand this model can lead to unreal expectations and can encourage situations of dependency.
- There is need to be mindful of equity. If international students have specific needs, these needs must be addressed, but a comparable level of support should be available for both Australian and international students.
- Programs or events that facilitate interaction with the local community should be encouraged. Such programs ensure that international students gain an experience of Australian hospitality and culture, while at the same time, contributing towards multicultural understanding and harmony in the wider community. Such programs need to be handled with sensitivity, to ensure that additional demands are not placed on the students and/or the educational institutions."<sup>179</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>177</sup> Maria Taylor and Robin Bowden, op.cit.,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>178</sup> Maria Taylor and Robin Bowden, AFOST, transcript, October 2002, p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>179</sup> AMC, submission, May 2002, p. 3

From the perspective of Kai Lee Ng, a Law Graduate from the University of Tasmania, the following details of her experience when first arriving in Tasmania where provided in evidence:

"We were picked up by a person from the International Student Office and we told the person where we would be living. So the person would drop us there and that's pretty much about it. If you choose to stay with the residential colleges, St John Fisher, Christ College or Jane Franklin Hall, then you get support from the College. But if you choose to stay on your own in a shared house the first year that you come here, you are very much on your own. You have to get around on your own."<sup>180</sup>

With the ISSP operating so effectively in the Law Faculty of the UTAS it seems unlikely that law students will now be subjected to a similar experience.

The Committee is of the view that there is further scope for developing programs to assist international students prior to departing from their own countries, upon arriving in Tasmania and during their time in Tasmania.

In saying this, the Committee is both mindful and appreciative of the program and actions of each of the individual educational institutions in Tasmania who cater for international students.

The Committee is also further aware that the schools sector generally provide closer attention, care and support for individual students because of their younger ages. These students would probably not be as actively involved in functions and programs organised between educational institutions by a body such as the former CISSTAS, although many have attended joint functions in past years.

It appears that the main advantage of programs embracing and involving educational institutions on a joint basis would be gained by students studying at a tertiary level. The Committee believes that such programs would be of considerable benefit to those students.

### Recommendations

The Committee recommends:

- (1) That wherever practicable institutions arrange briefings for international students before they leave their home countries, provide adequate pastoral care while studying in Tasmania and maintain regular contact after they return home.
- (2) That cross-cultural information and training be given to all who have responsibilities to international students.

89

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>180</sup> Kai Lee Ng, transcript, November 2002, p. 4

- (3) That government and community leaders host civic receptions or similar functions to welcome international students to their area wherever appropriate and on an annual basis, if possible.
- (4) That each educational institution establish a mentoring system appropriate to their circumstances, including participants from the country of origin of individual students as well as local students.
- (5) That each international student be provided with the name and contact details of a person from whom they may seek support, help and guidance when required.
- (6) That International Student Officers be given the benefit of a support subcommittee which is representative of various cultural groups.
- (7) That an organization of similar structure and with similar objectives to the former Council for International Student Support (CISSTAS) be established with State Government support and funding assistance.

# **Offshore Activity**

# Part 6

Term of Reference 6 – The potential and action needed for Tasmania to establish educational institutions of courses in other countries and the effectiveness or otherwise of any attempts to do so to date.

# 6.1 The Offshore Experience

While traveling to Australia to study remains a popular option for international students, increasingly foreign students are opting to access Australian education in their home country.

This is particularly evident in Singapore, Malaysia and Hong Kong. Figures at the end of 2001 show that it was these three countries which had the largest proportion of offshore students. The majority of offshore students study on campus, however a significant number undertake study via distance education.

Accessing the potential for increased offshore education is really the lesser element in the focus on international students.

To attract students from overseas to study in Tasmania remains the principal focus. There is however the need to package and market programs which are sold or delivered overseas.

Those international students wishing to obtain an Australian University degree have the choice of several different modes of study, including:-

- travelling to Australia to study;
- studying through distance education;
- attending an Australian university campus located in a foreign country; or
- commencing studies overseas by attending an Australian degree course provided through a foreign university and then completing the final year(s) of the course back in Australia (termed a 'twinning' arrangement).

The AEI's – Overseas Student Statistics 2001 indicates that offshore enrolments grew by almost twenty three per cent in 2001 to 42802 Australia wide.

At the IDP organised 16<sup>th</sup> Australian International Education Conference held in Hobart in 2002, it was acknowledged that the total demand for Australian education was set to increase dramatically over the period 2000-2005. It was reported that this would bring about an increase in Australia's share of global demand from 3 per cent in 2000 to 8 per cent in 2025.<sup>181</sup>

Global demand for higher education is set to grow enormously. According to one of the authors of the report "Global Student Mobility 2025: Forecasts of the Global Demand for International Education", Anthony Boham, who is head of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>181</sup> University of Tasmania – Campus Review, Vol. 12 No. 39, October 9-15, 2002 – Anthony Boham as reported by David Myton, p. 1

IDP's planning and research, more than 996,000 international students would be accessing Australian higher education by 2025. Offshore programs would account for 44 per cent of this demand.<sup>182</sup>

The increasing dominance and potential value of demand from Asia for Australian higher education is well known. Several key countries are driving that demand – China, Malaysia, India and Indonesia. The positioning of Australia within the Asia region and the importance of maintaining a very strong regional profile are matters significant in realising this increasing demand.<sup>183</sup>

As indicated by Professor Rudi Lidl, of the UTAS, offshore programs are a rapidly developing sector in international education and it is important to the future internationalisation and reputation of the UTAS that its offshore programs continue to grow.<sup>184</sup>

It is noted that the benefits are not so much in terms of direct income from these offshore operations, but more so from the flow of students who will choose to continue their studies in Tasmania rather than in their own country.

The Committee agrees that in developing opportunities for offshore delivery of courses, not only is the international reputation of the university enhanced, but also opportunities are opened up for staff professional development and the capacity to internationalise curricula and knowledge. As stated by Professor Lidl, this will ensure future graduates of the University of Tasmania have the capacity to respond to both global and regional demands.<sup>185</sup>

Whilst the growth of offshore activity by the UTAS is significant, the Committee views the relationships established to date and others which will be entered into by other educational sectors in Tasmania into the future as also being vital in enabling our education system to compete favourably with other Australian states and indeed other parts of the world.

The Committee sought to gain an understanding of what is being done and in which areas expansion may well be possible.

In its submission the UTAS advised of existing offshore operations in Singapore, Malaysia, Thailand and Vietnam and its plan to expand its operations not only in these countries with further program options but to look at commencing new offshore programs in China and Indonesia over the next two years.<sup>186</sup> The UTAS's offshore operations are not limited to providing its courses to international students, but also provide an opportunity for local students to study the university's courses delivered in other countries through offshore study tours. The university delivers study tour programs in Indonesia, China, Thailand and India.<sup>187</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>182</sup> University of Tasmania – Campus Review, op.cit., p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>183</sup> ibid, P. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>184</sup> Joint submission, op.cit., p. 6-7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>185</sup> ibid, p. 6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>186</sup> ibid, p. 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>187</sup> Joint submission, op.cit., p. 7

It was suggested in evidence that more often than not offshore ventures are ones which operate within a business paradigm. It was claimed that what occurs is a redirection of the focus of education from students to profit as institutions are responding to a need to make ends meet.<sup>188</sup>

The Committee is of the view that offshore activity does represent a business decision however it does not support the claim that there is a shift in focus completely away from students.

The idea of an audit of offshore activity was raised during the course of the Committee's work. This would appear to have some merit given that the various sectors appear to be giving different weight to the offshore effort. It is recognised that varying circumstances prevail within the sectors which would impact on this direction.

The AMC, Australia's National Centre for Maritime Education, Training and Research, has also sought to expand its course delivery arrangements to other countries. The College does not invest capital in overseas countries but works instead with a local partner, either an institution or professional body, to offer AMC programs offshore.

The Committee was made aware of the College's extension into international markets. Some of these offshore activities include:

- postgraduate programs in maritime business offered by distance education;
- in Taiwan, a masters degree in maritime studies is offered in collaboration with the National Koahsiung Institute of Marine Technology; and
- through its commercial arm, AMC Search, the College has been active in Kuwait since 1993 with a range of mainstream programs as a partner in a new institution – the Australian College of Kuwait. TAFE Tasmania is a participant in this exercise.<sup>189</sup>

The AMC has also entered into a number of MoU with maritime universities in Asia and Europe. Student and staff exchanges are a part of these MoU and the College has been host to a number of staff and students from these institutions in recent years. Further, College staff and students have spent time at these partner institutions.<sup>190</sup>

The Committee recognises the need for such exchange and the positive benefits to be gained from them.

The AMC's activity in Kuwait goes to providing intellectual property for maritime related courses, with some staff support. The Committee recognises the possibility of students moving into higher level courses back in Tasmania at a later stage. The Committee was made aware of negotiations in progress between the AMC and its overseas partners.<sup>191</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>188</sup> Jan Kuplis, submission, op.cit., p. 19

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>189</sup> AMC, submission, op.cit., p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>190</sup> ibid, p.4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>191</sup> AMC, transcript, October 2002, p. 21

Issues such as accreditation of courses, the mapping of courses to ensure that learning outcomes are the same, that teaching hours are the same and that qualifications of staff are suitable, are matters which are negotiated and then put in place.<sup>192</sup>

The Committee is interested also in the developments in the Chinese city of Zhangzhou in the Fujian Province with the establishment of the Australia-China Foreign Language School. This private initiative of Dr Zheng Tongtao and his associates highlights a further strong Tasmanian-Chinese connection. Dr Zheng has Australian citizenship and has formerly lectured at the UTAS. The Committee is of the view that the establishment of this language school should further provide a strengthening of the ties between Tasmania and Fujian and make for the promotion of further exchange.

Chinese students are increasingly interested in English language preparation as a precursor to achieving the appropriate standard of English necessary for entry to Australian universities.

Ms Leonie Godridge told the Committee that Dr Zheng has as an objective to make his Australia-China Foreign Language School the centre for the IELTS in Zhanghou with a view to sending Chinese students on to further their studies in Tasmania. The school is catering for all levels – pre-school, primary school, middle school, cadets and both beginner and professional adult learners.<sup>193</sup>

## 6.2 The Benefits of Offshore Operations

Evidence provided clearly indicates that offshore educational opportunities provide a range of benefits. These benefits are:

- a potential flow-on of students into Tasmanian institutions;
- professional development through the interchange of teaching personnel;
- a presence in part of the global education arena; and
- an increased recognition and awareness of Tasmania as an education destination.

The Committee recognises that at this time the delivery of courses offshore is not likely to provide significant economic benefit and supports the view that it be seen more as a strategic method of generating a flow of students to Tasmanian institutions.<sup>194</sup>

In terms of the relationship entered into between the DOE and the South East Ocean Development Company in China, the Committee notes that the contract arrangements provide for both a capitation and base-level fee.

As indicated by the Department's Deputy Secretary, Mr Tim Doe:-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>192</sup> ibid, p. 21

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>193</sup>Leonie J Godridge, submission, May 2002 p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>194</sup> Joint submission, op.cit., p. 17

"the base level fee actually cuts out when we have sufficient students to cover our standard service delivery requirements, plus a profit on top of that. If from this total program at the moment we have about 40 students, we'd still be collecting the full base-level amounts from them, which would lower our trips to China and the marking or whatever. By the time it gets to 100 students, we are making sufficient from the capitation not to collect the base grants. We have a structured program that ensures that we won't be out of pocket and that we start to make money after we get past thirty students and that the amount of money that we make out of it increases the more students we get."<sup>195</sup>

# 6.3 Further Potential

Western education is seen as desirable, however, not all foreign students wish to leave home to access it. This creates opportunities to develop offshore Australian programs.

It was suggested to the Committee that there is further potential for Tasmania to operate and develop programs offshore – there are however questions which arise such as:

- what is in it for Tasmania?;
- are there enough resources to cover the programs?;
- is it cost effective?;
- are the intended outcomes being achieved?;
- who is Tasmania competing with?;
- what are the programs and are they unique in any way?; and
- where is Tasmania positioned in the offshore education field?

The Committee generally accepts the view that it is the university sector that has the greatest acceptance and potential to establish offshore programs particularly in the Asia-Pacific region.

The Committee received evidence which indicated a range of potential offshore development areas which could in fact be considered, not only by the university sector but also the TAFE and schools sectors as well. The Committee believes there is scope for further investigation into offshore educational prospects.

Potential developments at the higher education level were put forward in evidence. These were identified as follow:

- post graduate programs delivered offshore using a summer-school type model;
- part-time graduate programs with a required 'in Tasmania' component;
- doctoral programs delivered through regular visits by lecturers;
- English language and study skills courses to prepare students for study in Australia;
- a foundation studies concept developed for delivery offshore;
- stand-alone offshore campuses administered by Tasmanian providers and staffed by Tasmanians and locals;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>195</sup> Department of Education, Tim Doe, transcript, November 2002, p. 7

- reverse twinning programs where students can study a Tasmanian component as part of an in-country degree program; and
- research collaborations.<sup>196</sup>

Professor Rudi Lidl indicated to the Committee the tremendous growth potential in offshore programs, citing opportunities in three different cities in China.

The Committee notes that the UTAS will be teaching computing and information systems in Fuzhou, the capital of Fujian Province, in Shanghai and in Hangzhou.<sup>197</sup>

Professor Lidl's prediction of one thousand UTAS students studying information technology (IT) in China as offshore students by about 2005 is very encouraging and the Committee notes the real further potential, with this offshore exposure, for some of these students to decide on a Tasmanian experience by choosing perhaps to do their final year of study in Tasmania.<sup>198</sup>

Whilst a large percentage of the UTAS's onshore international students come from Malaysia, the University is aware that this may not continue to be the situation.

As Professor Lidl indicated to the Committee, countries like Malaysia are committed to improving their education system – by creating their own universities and combining colleges. In fact, indications are that certain of the University of Tasmania's offshore partner colleges may indeed become a university.<sup>199</sup>

Against this backdrop of increased in-country training the UTAS has directed its focus more toward the provision of offshore teaching. As Professor Lidl said:-

"we know that there is more and more reluctance to come for the whole duration of a degree to Australia – it is much more attractive to study for two years in Vietnam for your engineering degree and come for two years to Tasmania."<sup>200</sup>

The Committee recognises the very good training program arrangements in engineering which exist between Tasmania and Vietnam.

The Committee was also made aware in evidence of the quite outstanding facilities which have been provided by the UTAS's Chinese partners in Shanghai. The Shanghai Fisheries University has built a new stand-alone complex purely for the UTAS degree to be delivered there. This building was officially opened in September 2002. Professor Lidl described it in the following terms:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>196</sup> Jan Kuplis, op.cit., p 19-20

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>197</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, transcript, October 2002, p. 11

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>198</sup> ibid, p. 12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>199</sup> ibid, p. 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>200</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, transcript, op.cit., p. 5

"Its this big building, with computer labs with rows of 50-60 computers there. All the latest models are sitting there already; we've inspected them. It's really very impressive".<sup>201</sup>

## 6.4 The Difficulties

Delivering offshore programs does present a range of difficulties and problems some of which include:

- ensuring the financial viability of the programs;
- dealing with questions about 'values' and the place of students and communities in the whole scheme; and
- the need, in developing offshore programs, to research the market, develop the product and assess the outcomes.<sup>202</sup>

The Committee recognises that this aspect particularly does take time and resources.

The Committee further recognises that not all business models are sustainable and able to be supported, notwithstanding the desire to develop a program or extend a relationship offshore. Programs offshore need to be based around sound commercial principles.

In addition, evidence to the Committee suggests that in the marketing of Government schools and the Institute of TAFE Tasmania by the Government's marketing arm, activities concentrated quite deliberately on reversing declining number of students in the respective institutions.<sup>203</sup>

The UTAS has also encountered difficulties with numbers reducing from more than 200 students to about 120 toward the latter part of 2002. These students were mainly in Malaysia and Singapore.

Professor Lidl indicated that part of that decrease in number was due to the economic crisis in the late 1990's when student numbers in both Malaysia and Singapore reduced.<sup>204</sup>

In addition to that it was necessary, due to some progress problems with one of the UTAS partners in Malaysia, to enter into arrangements with a new partner, the Binary College in Kuala Lumpur where a Bachelor of Commerce program is offered.<sup>205</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>201</sup> ibid, p. 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>202</sup> Jan Kuplis, submission, op.cit., p. 19

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>203</sup> Joint submission, op.cit., p. 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>204</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, transcript, op.cit., p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>205</sup> ibid, p. 4

Competition offshore is a factor which must be considered. Professor Lidl said the Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology has opened its own campus in Ho Chi Minh City allowing students to remain and study in their own country.<sup>206</sup>

The UTAS has sought to minimise certain risks associated with its relatively recent move into the offshore market, particularly in China. The Committee understands that the UTAS is part of a consortium of universities – the International Education Network (IEN) - and notes the UTAS's desire to combine with other institutions which have market experience. This strategy aids in the risk management aspect of offshore activity by raising an awareness of potential problem areas.<sup>207</sup>

## 6.5 Schools

The Government's offshore schools program is administered by TGSI.

At this level, the DOE has for some eleven years provided staffing, resources and support for curriculum delivery to Tanjung Bara International School in East Kalimantan in Indonesia. This is a primary school providing education for the dependants of the expatriate management staff servicing the Rio Tinto – BHP mining operation. The Committee notes there is no connection between this contract arrangement and enrolment of fee paying international students in Tasmania.

A number of sister school relationships have also been established. The Committee understands that all of these relationships are developing positively. The sister-school relationships are based on educational exchanges between teachers and students in terms of sharing ideas, resources and expertise which do result in a flow of students to Tasmania.<sup>208</sup>

Evidence indicates that the DOE has three agreements to provide curriculum and support of delivery for Year 10 Tasmanian Certificate of Education (TCE) subjects to schools in China.<sup>209</sup>

The Committee notes also that in September 2002 the DOE commenced operations supporting the delivery of the TCE at the China-Australia (Tasmania) International School in Dalian, or CATIS as it is known.<sup>210</sup>

The Committee recognises the Government's partnership role in this venture and the importance of this program. Its success will mean that students will have completed Tasmanian University entrance examinations and a flow of students to Tasmania can be contemplated. Notwithstanding this prospect, the Committee is aware that the TCE is also recognised by every other Australian university and many universities elsewhere in the world, so the potential choice for students of further educational destinations is vast.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>206</sup> ibid, p. 6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>207</sup> ibid, p. 13

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>208</sup> Joint submission, op.cit., p. 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>209</sup> Tasmanian Government Schools International (TGSI), briefing paper, January 2003, p. 1

Agreement was reached to establish the CATIS Program in three additional schools from February this year. These schools are part of the South Ocean Development owned schools in Luoyang, Kunming and Taiyuan.<sup>211</sup>

As stated by the Tasmanian Minister for Education, the Honourable Paula Wriedt MHA in the House of Assembly:-

"not only do students study their Chinese qualifications, but they are also accredited to study their TCE with the hope that approximately one third of the students who are enrolled in the CATIS schools would then apply for a student visa, come to Tasmania, continue their studies either in a secondary college or indeed TAFE, and then perhaps eventually articulate through to the University of Tasmania."<sup>212</sup>

The Committee recognises that the CATIS arrangement is relatively recent and that it will take some time to get a picture of the extent to which gains in numbers of students coming to Tasmania to further their education have been made. It would appear that student numbers are good and that demand is high.

The Assistant Principal of the South Ocean Education Development Group is a former Education Department employee and retired Principal of Elizabeth College, Mr Greg Suitor. His role is to establish the program in China and the Committee met with him when he returned to Tasmania in November last year. He indicated that Tasmanian teachers will be recruited for the new schools with their salaries being met by the South Ocean Education Development Group.<sup>213</sup>

Mr Suitor went on to say:

"The object of the exercise is several pathways: one, to earn the TCE in China; two, to leave China and come to Tasmania to complete the TCE in our schools and colleges in Tasmania; three, to come to Tasmania after the TCE and follow a TAFE pathway; four, come to Tasmania after the TCE and follow a university pathway. They are looking at all those options. Part of the agreement is to send students to Tasmania to complete their education. For example, the company is committed to sending 30 students next year to our colleges. I think, ultimately, something like 200 a year in terms of our colleges."<sup>214</sup>

The potential beyond education of this type of offshore program is also an important factor. Tasmanian teachers will be living in these communities and people from these school communities, may well visit Tasmania.

As Mr Suitor commented:-

"Long term – I am talking about twenty years – no doubt there is going to be some sort of economic return to Tasmania and China through the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>211</sup> ibid, p. 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>212</sup> Minister Paula Wriedt MHA – House of Assembly Hansard, debate on motion concerning

international students; proposed visa changes; and the English Language Testing System, March 2003 <sup>213</sup> Greg Suitor, transcript, op.cit., p. 4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>214</sup> Greg Suitor, transcript, op.cit., p. 4

relationship. For example, most of the people who send their students to the school are probably in some sort of business activity. They will find out about Tasmania, they will find out about the products we have, the markets available – who knows what sort of thing will happen."<sup>215</sup>

The Committee further notes that the Department is looking to India as a further market for the delivery of its offshore programs.

It would appear from the evidence that the offshore operations in the schools sector are more likely to deliver students to university than to the school system, and further, that once students qualify for entry to university they may well be attracted to the better known destinations of Melbourne and Sydney.

#### Professor Lidl said:

"It is just such a strong pull for them, when they come to that age, to live in a big city, the big smoke where the big activity is – that we are too quiet and too sheltered and too small."<sup>216</sup>

The joint submission from the DSD, the DOE, the Institute of TAFE Tasmania and the UTAS contains the following passage:

"That numerous approaches have been made to State Development for the delivery of offshore programs at the schools and the Institute of TAFE Tasmania levels, however the proposed business models have not been regarded as supportable. Whilst State Development accepts that the delivery of courses offshore is not likely to provide large economic benefits, but should rather be seen as another strategic method of generating a flow of students to Tasmanian institutions, it is not prepared to enter into agreements where returns are not evident. A cautious approach will thus be maintained in developing offshore programs."<sup>217</sup>

It was stated that the focus, until relatively recently, of the marketing of Tasmanian Government schools and the Institute of TAFE Tasmania, had been to concentrate activities exclusively on reversing the declining number of students in these respective institutions. Evidence provided however, indicates that the significance of the future potential of offshore program delivery has brought an acknowledgment from the marketers that strategies must include the development of offshore relationships.

Again evidence received noted potential areas for either continued or further investigation. These potential development areas may or may not be marketable or feasible at this time, however they are included to indicate the range of possible activity. They are:

 the establishment of separate Tasmanian school campuses offshore to deliver the full TCE program;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>215</sup> ibid, p. 9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>216</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, transcript, op.cit., p. 22

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>217</sup> Joint submission, op.cit., p. 7

- delivering parts of the Tasmanian curriculum within existing local education frameworks – this could be a shared arrangement with incountry teachers;
- delivering a full Tasmanian curriculum in existing local education frameworks using Tasmanian teachers;
- delivering parallel selected courses with existing programs so students can graduate with dual qualifications;
- short-term holiday programs offshore;
- teacher exchange programs;
- offshore professional development programs such as curriculum and school management;
- distance education programs delivered via the Internet it was noted that this type of delivery relies heavily upon reliable computer service infrastructure and further that very careful consideration needs to be given in the planning stages to the language aspect, knowledge base and cultural appropriateness of materials and delivery style.<sup>218</sup>

The Committee believes that the development of offshore programs should remain a focus for the various sectors and that whilst caution needs to be exercised there must remain a commitment from Government that business models for the TAFE and schools sectors particularly, continue to be explored and that offshore relationships do need to be a key component of the overall strategy.

The Committee notes that targets for the growth in student enrolment and offshore schools are contained in the TGSI Business Plan. It is recognised also that these targets are set by the DOE in conjunction with the DED and the principals of TGSI schools and colleges. These targets are reviewed annually.

# 6.6 TAFE

Unfortunately the role and status of TAFE is not as well understood in Asian countries as it is in Australia. Therefore it is not accorded the same status as a university education.

Evidence suggests that there is a lack of natural position for technical and further education in the international marketplace. Notwithstanding this, there was evidence of cooperation between TAFE Tasmania and a Shanghai-based institution for the delivery of information technology and English language courses. TAFE Tasmania has also entered into an agreement with the AMC and local Kuwaiti interests for the delivery of courses in Kuwait, which were scheduled to start in September 2003.<sup>219</sup>

The Committee would encourage continued activity in the marketing of TAFE's current and potential international programs. Negotiations leading to partnerships is a desirable objective.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>218</sup> Jan Kuplis, submission, op.cit., p. 21

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>219</sup> Joint submission, op.cit., p. 8

The experience in China is noted by the Committee, particularly the involvement with Bang De College in Shanghai concerning a partnership to deliver the first year of the Diploma of Information Systems in China and the second year in Hobart at the Institute.

The awarding of international training contracts to the Institute to provide targeted training to groups is a worthwhile achievement also. Evidence received indicated that teachers from the South East Asia region have been hosted by the Institute and have had a program delivered to meet their training needs.

Whilst the Committee does see these developments as positive there remains a question as to whether there is unexplored potential for further development or, as has been suggested, whether more sustainable links could be made through industry and business already established in target countries.<sup>220</sup>

It was put to the Committee that as countries in Asia become more focused on the service industries as opposed to business, the demand for a wider range of training courses will become apparent. An example was given of young Malaysian students, who are becoming interested in areas such as hairdressing, tourism and child-care as occupations.<sup>221</sup> These courses are provided by TAFE.

It would seem that there is some potential for expansion in the TAFE sector which the Committee believes should be further explored.

The developing schools experience in Dalian for example may well be a lever for the TAFE sector to become involved to a much greater extent. Evidence provided by Mr Greg Suitor suggested that education officials in Dalian, were very enthusiastic about the range of vocational subjects which may be available and receive an appropriate level of recognition. As Mr Suitor stated:-

"I would not be surprised if, in a year or two, TAFE has some institution in China doing middle level training because they do not have a lot of that. They just do not have the technical level training."<sup>222</sup>

When asked about the TAFE potential offshore, Mr Suitor went on to say:-

"I think this relationship we have with South Ocean, because they want to service the students in all pathways there is a really good possibility of something happening with the TAFE side of things."<sup>223</sup>

In terms of future offshore potential in the TAFE sector, evidence received pointed to several areas to which consideration should be given. These were identified as:

- offshore campuses;
- jointly delivered education programs;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>220</sup> Jan Kuplis, submission, op.cit., p. 20

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>221</sup> ibid, p. 20

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>222</sup> Greg Suitor, transcript, op.cit., p. 19

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>223</sup> ibid, p. 19

- staff and student exchange;
- offshore holiday programs summer schools;
- part-time courses aimed mainly at the business sector;
- partnership with the central TAFE organisation in China to develop cooperative programs; and
- the establishment of adult education type programs.<sup>224</sup>

#### University Level

The Committee is of the view that providing educational opportunities offshore at the higher-education level particularly, is of strategic importance and the commitment to increasing that activity is regarded as central to further growth opportunities. The relatively recent creation within the UTAS of the special unit for offshore programs, the Offshore University Business Enterprise (UBE) demonstrates the strategic importance of offshore activity.

#### Professor Lidl stated:

"we have now something like 9 projects on the go. Some of them are very small admittedly. Several projects in Thailand for engineering. Hong Kong is being developed in tourism and there is also an interest in nursing. In Jakarta we are trying to establish an offshore twinning program. In Kuala-Lumpur we have a twinning program in law. We have set up a program in biomedical science – a twinning program".<sup>225</sup>

The twinning arrangements in place to date appear to have been successful in terms of international students coming to Tasmania to complete degree courses. In response to a question on the point of student transfer to Tasmania, Professor Lidl replied:

"Yes, this is a very important point. It is interesting; we are in a consortium with the University of New South Wales. As you know, the University of New South Wales is a very big player internationally in Australia – a very attractive, high ranking university. We are twinning with them and with Melbourne University in Ho Chi Minh City and I was told of a cohort of perhaps 40 students, historically over the last few years perhaps one or two chose to go to New South Wales or Melbourne and the remaining 37 or 38 came to the University of Tasmania. So the record of transfer is really excellent."<sup>226</sup>

In terms of the transfer of students from offshore campuses, the experiences are limited as numbers are small and the provision of offshore courses is relatively recent. The Committee was advised that in the Business Plan for China the UTAS is expecting at least ten per cent of students to transfer from the offshore program to Tasmania.<sup>227</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>224</sup> Jan Kuplis, submission, op.cit., p. 20

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>225</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, transcript, op.cit., p. 12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>226</sup> ibid, p. 15

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>227</sup> ibid, p. 16

The UBE manages and co-ordinates all offshore programs. The programs within the scope of the UBE are:

- courses conducted fully offshore where the UBE derives income directly from fees paid by students enrolled;
- twinning programs where the UBE derives a percentage of the gross fees from students when they transfer from the partner institution to Tasmania to complete their studies. Income may also be received from fees for moderation and where there is a requirement for University staff to be involved in delivery of teaching; and
- articulation arrangements where the UBE will derive income from students when they enrol either offshore or in Tasmania. In addition, income may be received from fees for moderation where there is a requirement for University staff to be involved in delivery of teaching.<sup>228</sup>

Funding arrangements for the UBE take account of the expenses involved in managing the offshore portions of these programs, including staff visits, moderation of examinations, management, administration and marketing expenses. In the case of the twinning program, the UBE incurs expenditure for the initial years when students are studying in their own country and there is no income being derived by the UTAS. Once the students commence with the university, a small percentage is deducted from the gross fees and paid to the UBE.<sup>229</sup>

#### Quality Assurance

The Committee was interested in the question of the integrity of UTAS degrees awarded to students in offshore programs. The aspect of quality assurance was considered.

In answer to the question - how do we protect the integrity of our degrees? Professor Lidl replied:

"the quality assurance aspect, as we call it, is a very important component of those activities and one of the reasons for the university setting up a University Business Enterprise (UBE).

When one looks at the procedures manual for that UBE I think half of it is taken up with quality assurance processes."<sup>230</sup>

The Committee was told that course approval processes are stringent. At the UTAS the matters are first dealt with by various Faculty Committees. Proposals are then put before the Teaching and Learning Committee which is chaired by the Vice Chancellor. Finally the Academic Senate has an opportunity to scrutinise the proposal.<sup>231</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>228</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, submission, November 2001, p. 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>229</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, submission, op.cit., p. 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>230</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, transcript, op.cit., p. 12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>231</sup> ibid, p. 13

Professor Lidl went on to say:

"Unlike some other universities we very strongly believe in saying we have a bachelor of computing and wherever you do that bachelor degree it's the same quality. It does not matter if it's in Hobart, in Launceston, in Fuzhou or anywhere else you want to teach it and to ensure that, we have in place those various quality assurance processes".<sup>232</sup>

The provision of TCE subjects offshore also raises questions about quality assurance. In answer to the question of how Tasmania is going to provide the measures to guarantee that the quality is maintained over a longer period of time, Mr Tim Doe, Deputy Secretary, DOE, said:

"Ultimately the quality control is achieved by the students taking external exams in China and those exams will be marked in Tasmania so the same standards will be applied to the scripts that come from China as apply to our own students. In terms of ongoing moderation of the teaching, there are two issues there – we've got Tasmanian teachers who already understand the standards and are trained to implement those standards but we will also have, from time to time, people going from Tasmania to China, subject specialists, just as they do to our schools in Hobart"<sup>233</sup>

Further Mr David Kilpatrick, Manager, TGSI said:

"It might be likened to the British Council of Education or the American Schools Foundations who might have 200 schools across the world where they're providing accreditation, subject moderation and supervision to a range of schools from different sites. The model that Tasmania is developing at the moment, under the Department of Education, is very similar to that well tested accreditation model which exists in that format. It involves a series of accreditation steps, visits and professional development training and a series of standards that the schools would have to go through to guarantee quality." <sup>234</sup>

The Future Focus

The Committee's view is that a continued focus on developing offshore activity across all sectors is desirable, although it is acknowledged that there are strains placed upon resources – both financial and human. Offshore programs are conducted in addition to the international student programs being run in Tasmania and it is recognised that pressure upon staff can and does occur. Evidence provided suggests that, at the UTAS level at least, any expansion of offshore programs could not be undertaken within the current staffing structure.<sup>235</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>232</sup> ibid, p. 14

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>233</sup> Department of Education, Tim Doe, transcript, p. 5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>234</sup> ibid, p. 6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>235</sup> Paul Rigby, transcript, December 2002, p. 15

As Mr Paul Rigby, Director of International Services at the UTAS said:

"There is a limit to what you can do if it involves teaching outside Tasmania. I think we are going to be approaching that limit as we get up towards – I think we have 800 students in China but that is going to go to about 3000, I think, within three or four years, it might even be sooner. We are not going to be able to service these students out of staff located here."<sup>236</sup>

Mr Rigby advised the Committee that attempts are made to lessen the pressures on staff who are involved in teaching offshore units, and also to control costs associated with the course delivery.

In terms of financial costs the developmental and start-up phases are costly and financial gains may indeed not flow for several years. As Professor Lidl stated:

"in financial terms, offshore activities are always less profitable than the onshore activities."  $^{\rm 237}$ 

The point was made in evidence by Ms Helen Cox, that the establishment of educational institutions and courses in other countries should be undertaken less urgently and assigned a lower priority than promoting Tasmania as an educational destination. It was suggested that only after addressing this issue should the issue of offshore programs be pursued.<sup>238</sup>

Whilst accepting the proposition that attracting international students to Tasmania to undertake courses of study must remain a key objective, the offshore effort should in the Committee's view continue to be aggressively pursued.

The success of both programs will depend on the transfer of students offshore to Tasmania.

Offshore enrolment numbers for the UTAS for 2002 were 197.

The Committee recognises the Tasmanian Export Award presented to the University in 2002. This award recognised excellence in exporting by firms and organisations throughout the State. The UTAS – International Services Division was one of several Education Award nominees recognised for its campaigns in attracting international student enrolments. This was a significant achievement.

The Committee supports the development of the partnership agreement between the State Government and the UTAS. A key strategy within that agreement is the recognition that there needs to be collaboration on international projects, offshore programs and short courses.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>236</sup> ibid, p. 15

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>237</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, transcript, op.cit., p. 16

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>238</sup> Helen Cox, submission, op.cit., p. 3

In terms of the offshore programs, the Committee is hopeful that the issues, strategies and indicators identified in that partnership agreement will enhance and complement the opportunities presented to date. The Committee fully recognises the growth in competitor activity, both nationally and internationally, and that it is against this background that the UTAS must position itself and compete.

Existing offshore programs include:

- Faculty of Commerce program in Commerce at Binary College in Malaysia and Sumbershire Eucation Group in Singapore;
- School of Engineering twinning programs at Ho Chi Minh University of Technology, Vietnam and King Mongkut University of Technology, Thailand, and a bridging course conducted at Prime College, Malaysia; and
- Faculty of Law twinning program at Kolej Damansara Utama, Malaysia.

Offshore program developments include:

- School of Information Systems program at Binary College, Malaysia, and a major in information systems within the Bachelor of Commerce program at Sumbershire Education Group, Singapore;
- Faculty of Health Science twinning program in biomedical science and pharmacy at Kolej Damansara Utama, Malaysia;
- School of Engineering Graduate Certificate program at Srinakharinwirot University, Thailand;
- IEN Consortium proposal for offshore programs in information systems and computing in China (the University of Tasmania is a member of this consortium);
- School of Visual and Performing Art at Launceston proposal for one unit to be taught at Chiang Mai University and Silpakorn University, Thailand.<sup>239</sup>

# Table 7: Projected Unit Enrolments for Offshore Programs in Malaysia and Singapore

2002	2003
406	804
868	868
	406

(Source – submission from Professor Rudi Lidl November 2001)

As previously indicated offshore programs provide a potential flow of students who choose to continue studies in Tasmania rather than in their home countries. The internationalisation of curriculum benefits all students in terms of future employment choices and opportunities and various witnesses who appeared before the Committee stressed the need to ensure that courses are well recognised internationally.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>239</sup> Professor Rudi Lidl, submission, op.cit., p. 3

The Committee is aware that not all attempts to establish offshore programs have met with success and that this area of endeavour is still relatively new. Notwithstanding, the Committee believes strongly that more experience is needed to grow, particularly in dealing with other cultures. As knowledge and skill in the delivery of offshore programs develop further successes will inevitably flow.

There must be a clear strategy in place in terms of offshore activities, and this strategy must be sufficiently flexible to allow the sectors to respond to opportunities which present themselves in the future.

The Committee believes that there are further market opportunities for the delivery of programs offshore. There does need to be a continued emphasis placed upon the delivery of niche-type opportunities offshore and this requires the identification of additional strategic market opportunities.

The potential for offshore student recruitment is considerable. Tasmanian work to date in establishing a presence, relationships and reputation as an international providers of education has been positive. The Committee supports the development of technologies which will allow courses, particularly at the university level, to be delivered to more international locations and students.

## Recommendations

The Committee recommends:

- (1) That the strategies identified in the partnership agreement between the State Government and the University of Tasmania, insofar as they relate to offshore programs, be vigorously pursued with a continued focus on collaboration and the pooling of resources.
- (2) That other sector institutions continue to examine the feasibility of finding an off-shore partner to provide and support the delivery of off-shore programs.

## **Primary Economic Driver**

## Part 7

## Term of Reference – The potential for education to become a primary economic driver in the Tasmanian economy.

International Education is already a primary economic driver in Australia, however Tasmania is too small to become a world competitor in onshore international education. As source countries improve their education systems, revising curriculums, expanding intakes, offering new courses and employing Australian, English and American tutors and lecturers, the attraction of Tasmania as a destination may wane.

The further development of offshore education however offers some promise. The outcomes driving the offshore education enterprise include a flow of students into Tasmanian institutions, professional development through a regular interchange of teaching personnel, a foothold in part of the global education arena and an increased recognition of Tasmania as an education destination. These outcomes are positive for our State and complement the onshore effort.

Each onshore international student pays approximately \$20,000 annually for tuition, accommodation and other expenses and therefore the direct economic benefit to the State is estimated to be in the range of \$40-\$42 million annually. This is a very significant contribution to the State's economy. Further economic benefits are obtained from expenditure by visiting families and friends and employment created through the presence of both students and their visitors.

In terms of total factor income by industry in Tasmania the manufacturing sector is the largest followed by health and community services. The manufacturing sector is worth \$1.6 billion to Tasmania's economy. Education ranks below agriculture, forestry and fishing, construction, retail trade and finance and insurance services. Education total factor income for 2002-03 was \$601 million.<sup>240</sup>

The focus on economic benefits in relation to international marketing was criticised by some. The National Liaison Committee for International Students in Australia (NLC) stated in its submission that we should focus also on the non-commercial benefits. The NLC contends that these should be:

"prioritised whereby a bigger international community would help promote cultural exchange and social integration in the State amongst all sectors of the community, which may be done through the activities brought about by these students. The presence of international students in classes, providing viewpoints from different backgrounds would enrich the educational experiences for local students also."<sup>241</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>240</sup> ABS Australian National Accounts: State Accounts 2002-03 Total Factor Income is that part of the cost of producing the gross domestic product which consists of gross payments to factors of production (labour and capital). It represents the value added by these factors in the process of production and is equivalent to gross domestic product less taxes plus subsidies on production and imports.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>241</sup> National Liaison Committee for International Students, NLC submission, p. 2-3

The Committee believes that the education of international students is significant in terms of its economic contribution. It does not however, believe that it will be a primary economic driver in the Tasmanian economy.

### **Additional Matters**

### Part 8

Term of Reference – Any other matters relevant to marketing, recruiting and catering for the educational and personal needs and welfare of international students in Tasmania.

### 8.1 The Classroom

At the secondary, senior secondary and TAFE level specifically there is evidence suggesting that the presence of international students without a high level of English competency has increased the workload of teachers in whose classes these students have enrolled. This is largely because of the studentcentred nature of Tasmanian education, as opposed to the teacher-centred, lecture-driven educational culture which many fee-paying students are accustomed to.

Evidence before the Committee indicates that:

"learning [in Tasmania] is...very interactive in the classroom..."<sup>242</sup>; and

"students are actively encouraged to debate ideas, to unpack social and political issues and take different and often opposing points of view."<sup>243</sup>

Given the student-centred nature of education in Tasmania and the determination of teachers to provide a quality experience for all, the presence of students who do not have an adequate level of English competency can act as a brake on the pace of coverage of a syllabus.

A witness before the Committee described an experience at College level where he taught a class of seventeen students, fourteen of whom were international fee paying students. While seventeen is considered to be a small class by local standards, the witness commented that given the make up of the class it was akin to a class of thirty, which would be considered large.<sup>244</sup>

Evidence before the Committee also suggested that Tasmanian teachers are committed to ensuring that all students come to grips with current material before new material is introduced. When students without a high level of English competency are present, the pace of instruction can be slowed, causing stress for teachers who are aiming to cover the full syllabus. Resentment or unease may also arise, particularly for those students both local and international, who feel that they are not covering as much of the syllabus as other classes may be.

International students tend to enrol in a narrow range of subjects and they are not spread throughout the broad curriculum offered by Tasmanian schools and colleges.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>242</sup> Deborah Brewer, transcript, October 2002, p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>243</sup> ibid, p. 3-4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>244</sup> AEU – Phil Cox, transcript, October 2002, p. 6

Evidence relating to a teaching experience at Elizabeth College was tendered:

"We find ...that a lot of students want to do economics and accounting for instance, so there is a very large proportion of [international] students in those classes, and in many cases their English is just not up to studying those subjects, which actually disadvantages the local students because the pace has to be so much slower. The comment that was made to me by somebody who teaches economics and accounting... was that she feels she is very, very behind time in the course because she has to take it at the pace of those international students, of whom there are many in the class."<sup>245</sup>

It has been suggested to the Committee that class sizes should take account of the extra work generated for teachers when students without a high level of English competency are included. Such a principle is already applied when students with special needs are included in classes. The AEU suggested that there should be provision to reduce the overall size of the class. This would enable teachers to spend the time with all students to ensure that satisfactory progress is made.<sup>246</sup>

One witness suggested that:

"...an international student is probably equivalent to two local students in terms of their general resource management."<sup>247</sup>

Combined with an expectation of passing TCE courses in one year<sup>248</sup> – an apparently common expectation among international students that is not shared by or expected of local students - the lack of English competency can cause great stress for teachers who are determined to deliver a quality education to all students. A view was expressed that a Tasmanian administered test of the level of English competency was necessary.

Possible remedies include the provision of special teacher aide assistants with high level ESL skills to individual students in class.

A further suggestion was for "a period of preliminary cultural adjustment before formal courses are actually commenced."<sup>249</sup> This type of approach would enable a student to acclimatise to the Tasmanian educational culture. This could reduce the impact on teachers in dealing with some of the issues brought about through the integration of international students with high expectations into general classes.

The Committee understands that tensions can arise when students feel that they are not fully covering course material due to the restraints brought about because of other students' language difficulties. As indicated by the AEU in evidence:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>245</sup> AEU –Sue Ball, transcript, op.cit., p. 8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>246</sup> AEU, submission, op.cit., p. 7-8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>247</sup> AEU –Phil Cox, transcript, op.cit., p. 8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>248</sup> AEU –Sue Ball, transcript, op.cit., p. 9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>249</sup> AEU – Mike Poate, ibid, p. 2

"Often they can't perform at the same level because of English problems, but with support that problem wouldn't be there. Again what we're talking about is providing support for these students so that they can participate and they can progress at the correct pace. But it's too much to expect the ordinary teacher in the classroom to provide that level of support; it just couldn't be done."<sup>250</sup>

A related issue is the time of arrival of fee paying overseas students. The Committee was told that students may arrive at almost any time during the year. This depends mostly on the timing of visa approvals rather than the pattern of the Tasmanian school year. The AEU made a comment in relation to this point:

"Mr Cox - ...We've recently formed some classes at Hobart College in the last few weeks to cater for a group that came in September [2003], and as I left the college this morning to come here I noticed there were another half a dozen new students, probably from mainland China, who were coming as well. They were being taken around and introduced to some of the teachers.

Ms Thorp - Would they be expecting to start in classes?

Mr Cox – They would be expecting to start in classes this week, yes. That is interesting given that we have about three weeks to go before the end of year examinations start. What are they going to do? Are they going to just sit around? We have to provide a program for them whenever they arrive and that means finding a teacher, creating a class, or in this case a number of classes in a number of different subject areas, to run a program with them to the end of the year."<sup>251</sup>

Witnesses suggested that this fact could be turned to the advantage of the students, and the system in general, if the time were taken to provide preparatory cultural work and some English instruction courses, for example, to better prepare them for the start of the next year.<sup>252</sup>

Developments in partnership arrangements whereby students are taught TCE subjects in their country of origin prior to coming to Tasmania – such as in Dalian – will assist in addressing the issue of cultural adjustment but not all students who pay to study in Tasmania will have had such an experience. Even those in partnership schools may not get the true Tasmanian picture if they are not taught by teachers with experience of the Tasmanian system. It would seem logical that such teachers be transferred to the partnership schools from Tasmania without loss of entitlements to enhance the likelihood that students will be better prepared on arrival in Tasmania.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>250</sup> AEU – Mike Poate, transcript, op.cit., p. 2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>251</sup> AEU – Phil Cox, ibid, p. 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>252</sup> AEU – Mike Poate, ibid, p. 2

Cultural adjustment is of course a two-way street. The Committee received evidence that international fee paying students experienced disappointment with the way in which they were treated because of their difference.<sup>253</sup> It was suggested that:

"...some sort of educational campaign that really informed Tasmanians about the advantages to Tasmania of increasing the number of international students who come here would be useful."<sup>254</sup>

It was further suggested that a television campaign directed at changing attitudes may be a means of bringing about the climate of welcome that is needed to ensure that students returning to their own countries become positive ambassadors for the Tasmanian experience.<sup>255</sup>

It should be emphasised that fellow students were not identified as being at fault in not welcoming international students. Schools and colleges in Tasmania have a long history of being inclusive, welcoming institutions.

To provide the extra support and assistance necessary to ensure that the Tasmanian educational experience is a positive one, there is a need to ensure that the fees paid by the parents of students are used to provide direct assistance in the classroom.

Evidence before the Committee suggested that this was not always the case and that the fees paid by international students have been used in the past to fund capital or other expenditure that does not directly address the need for assistance to the international fee paying student program. Such allocations may be appropriate where the program is funded so that all needs are met but it appears that, at this time, there may well be a need for further direct assistance.

The AEU said:

"What tends to happen is that our classes are formed from a mixture of local students and international students and there is no ceiling on the class size for those classes, other than the normal ceiling, which operates for every other class, which is about 30, and so if we are funding the international students from the [school] resource package then there is a substantial amount of funds that is not going directly into It might be going into a counselling program for those the classroom. students where they have some pastoral care or direct carers involved in their welfare, it might be to support some tutorial programs if there seems to be a need for that, but largely the funds are not expended in the What happens to the funds is that they go into the classroom. development of the general college infrastructure so it might, for example, go to recarpeting a number of classrooms, it could go to the refurbishment of teaching areas, it could go to additional outside recreation areas or sports equipment. There will be a variety of areas where it could ao."256

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>253</sup> Deborah Brewer, op.cit., p. 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>254</sup> ibid, p. 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>255</sup> ibid, p. 8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>256</sup> AEU – Phil Cox, op.cit., p. 5

Witnesses stressed that teachers need assistance to deliver a quality program to all the students who may comprise a class, whether they be international fee paying students, students of local origin or refugees. As the teacher–student relationship is the most important aspect of the fee-paying student's experience, this is where the scarce resources should be directed.

To address concerns raised by the AEU in regard to the role of the Tasmanian teacher in this process, the development of precincts may allow for the appropriate level of resourcing so that the regular classroom teacher who has international students in his or her class will not be disadvantaged or stressed.

The development of educational precincts may be one strategy to address resource issues. An educational precinct is a cluster arrangement of a college and feeder schools designated as those institutions to which full-fee paying international students are directed.

What is also required is professional development for teachers and training for teachers in, for example, cultural awareness, which the ESL teacher could provide, if the resources were available.

### 8.2 Retention of Students

A further important issue is that of retaining students who commence their studies in Tasmania but for a variety of reasons transfer to universities in other States.

Whilst there is no statistical evidence before the Committee to give an indication of the rate of transfer, the numbers generally are not high. It is in Tasmania's interest to investigate ways of ensuring that international students attracted to Tasmania for education are indeed provided with every opportunity and encouragement to continue to tertiary level study here in this State.

The Committee well understands that the perception by students of greater opportunities in the mainland cities of Melbourne and Sydney particularly and the existence of larger cultural-specific networks that can be relied upon in those larger cities for added support, are difficult hurdles to overcome. The Committee makes general comment only in relation to retention merely to highlight this matter as one which was put before it.

Encouraging international students to remain in Tasmania to study at the tertiary level is a matter which the Committee considered.

In meeting with the Federal Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs, the Honourable Phillip Ruddock MP and his First Assistant Secretary, Mr Abul Rizvi, a bonus points initiative was discussed as a measure being considered at the Commonwealth level. The Federal Minister consequently introduced the initiative from 1 July this year.

The Committee very much welcomes this decision. Overseas students who now study and reside in regional Australia - for the purpose of this initiative includes all of Tasmania - will now be awarded five bonus points if application is made to migrate under the General Skilled Migration points test. The purpose of the measure is to attract overseas students to regional Australia, including Tasmania, and to encourage them to remain and contribute their skills to the benefit of the region.

In other evidence concerning the retention of students, Mr Andrew Barr, Principal of Scotch Oakburn College raised the matter of the need to establish links between students at the School level and the UTAS. At the present time there is little if any mixing between the two levels notwithstanding that there is only a year or two difference in age.

A large proportion of International students who complete study at the School level in Tasmania are often lost to mainland universities, particularly Melbourne and Sydney. The Committee supports any measures which aid the retention of students in Tasmania.

Mr Barr in evidence put forward a proposal based around a year 13 of study. The Committee was advised that this concept is particularly entrenched in the New Zealand education system. In expanding on this proposal, Mr Barr said:

"a year 13 is about helping that transition between school and university so they can do a mixture of subjects from both school and university. It ties in a little with what happens in Melbourne and Sydney. Victoria is more my experience. At VCE level students generally can do a couple of subjects that count for both school, their VCE, and first year university. What Professor Le Grew and I were talking about last night was marrying those two concepts and certainly creating that for our existing local students or all students to create that link for our students in year 12 to be doing a subject that counts for university as well as for the TCE but to take that further for our international students, in a year 13 concept. So not rush them into having to do a full list of university subjects while they are developing their English – which is the main aim of these students; they come here to have education in English – so that they could have a mixture of university and school subjects while they are here, be that in year 12 or year 13. I think it is furthering that link between the two."<sup>257</sup>

When asked whether the year 13 proposal would have application to local students, Mr Barr replied:

"That is what happens elsewhere; that is what happens in Melbourne and Sydney – Melbourne especially, through the University of Melbourne and Monash University."<sup>258</sup>

The Committee supports the principal and the further investigation of this proposal.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>257</sup> Andrew Barr, Principal, Scotch Oakburn College, transcript, March 2003, p. 5-6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>258</sup> ibid, p. 6

#### Recommendations

The Committee recommends:

- (1) That an assessment be made of support arrangements provided to teachers involved in the delivery of programs to international students in Government schools.
- (2) That there be increased opportunity for deliberation between teachers and administrators by way of a Forum to be held annually.
- (3) While the Committee acknowledges the high quality educational experience being delivered to full-fee paying international students in many State schools and colleges, it recommends the examination of the concept of the development of educational precincts, that is, a cluster arrangement of highs schools and a college for more focused resource allocation.
- (4) That the concept of a year 13 transition year of study in Tasmania be fully investigated.

# **Glossary of Terms**

AEI	Australian Education International – the part of the Commonwealth DETYA that is responsible for working with the Australian education and training industry to promote the industry internationally.	
AEU	Australian Education Union	
AFOST	Assistance Fund for Overseas Students in Tasmania	
AMC	Australian Maritime College	
CATIS	China-Australia (Tasmania) International School	
CISSTAS	Council for International Student Support in Tasmania	
CRICOS	Commonwealth Register of Institutions and Courses for Overseas Students. CRICOS is the Commonwealth listing of approved providers and the courses that may be offered to overseas students. Courses not listed on CRICOS must not be offered or provided.	
DED	Tasmanian Department of Economic Development	
DETYA	Commonwealth Department of Education, Training and Youth Affairs	
DIMIA	Commonwealth Department of Immigration, Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs	
DOE	Tasmanian Department of Education	
DSD	Tasmanian Department of State Development (former)	
ELICOS	English Language Intensive Course for Overseas Students	
ESL	English as a Second Language	
FFPOS	Full-Fee Paying Overseas Students	
FTE	Full-Time Equivalent	
нсс	Hobart City Council	
IDP	International Development Program Education Australia	
IELTS	International English Language Testing System	
IEMU	International Education Marketing Unit	

IEN	International Education Network
ISANA	International Students Network of Australia – peak representative body for professionals in Australia and New Zealand who work in student services, advocacy, teaching and policy development in international education
ISSP	International Student Support Program
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
NLC	National Liaison Committee for International Students – peak representative body for international students in Australia, formed in 1986. NLC represents over 150,000 international students in every State and Territory.
OPC	Offshore Processing Centre
Overseas Student	A person who holds a student visa issued under regulations made under the Commonwealth Migration Act 1958
PQI	Pre-Qualified Institution
PRC	People's Republic of China
Provider	An institution, body or person in Australia that provides courses to overseas students (as defined in s.3 of the ESOS Act) A provider must comply with State or Territory approval requirements
PVA	Pre-Visa Assessment
TAFE	Technical and Further Education
ТСЕ	Tasmanian Certificate of Education
TGSI	Tasmanian Government Schools International
TISOSS	Tasmanian Independent Schools Overseas Student Services
τυυ	Tasmanian University Union
UBE	University Business Enterprise
UTAS	University of Tasmania
VET	Vocational Education and Training

List of Witnesses	Attachment 1
ALEXANDER, Mr. T.	President, Tasmanian University Union
AZIM, Mr. Nurul	Student, Australian Maritime College
BACKHOUSE, Mr. J.	
BALL, Ms. S.	Member, Australian Education Union, Tasmania Branch
BARNETT, Ms. R.	Miro Films
BARR, Mr. A.	Principal, Scotch Oakburn College
BOWDEN, Ms. R.	Committee Member, Assistance Fund for Overseas Students in Tasmania (Inc)
BREWER, Ms. D.	
BUTLER, Ms. L.	Law Faculty, University of Tasmania
CAMPBELL, Mr. A.	General Manager, Investment, Trade and Development, Department of Economic Development
CHIN, Mr. Chun-Wah	International Students Officer, Students Association Incorporated, University of Tasmania
COX, Mr. P.	Member, Australian Education Union, Tasmania Branch
COX, Ms. H.	Director, Tasmanian College of English
DALGLEISH, Ms. M.	Tasmanian Branch Representative, ISANA: International Education Association
DICKINSON, Mr. G.	
DOE, Mr. T.	Deputy Secretary, Tasmanian Government Schools International, Department of Education
DUNCAN, Mr. I.	Registered Migration Agent and Partner Argyle Law
FRANCIS, Ms. R.	Social Worker, Anti-Discrimination Commission

GEORGE, Ms. A.	Training Consultant, Anti-Discrimination Commission
HALL, Mr. C.	
HARRINGTON, Ms. J.	
HERR, Dr. R.	Associate Professor, School of Government, University of Tasmania
HUDSON, Mr. D.	Chair, AFS Hobart
HUNT, Mr. R.	Secondary Colleges Organiser, Australian Education Union, Tasmania Branch
HUTTON, Mr. N.	Commercial Manager, Friends School
JONES, Mr. R.	Representing the Australian Maritime College
KELDER, Mr.	
KILPATRICK, Mr. D.	Manager, Tasmanian Government Schools International, Department of Education
KO, Ching Ching	Tasmania Branch Convenor, National Liaison Committee for International Students
KUPLIS, Ms. J	
LEE, Ms. C.	
LENNOX, Ms. A.	
LIDL, Prof. R.	Deputy Vice Chancellor, University of Tasmania
MARISO, Ms. S.	Anti-Discrimination Commission
McWAIDE, Ms. T.	Tasmanian Branch Representative, ISANA: International Education Association
NG, Ms Kailee	International Student and University Graduate, University of Tasmania
PANG, Dr. A.	Academic Dean, WEC Missionary Training College

PHILLIPS, Mr. B.	Department of Education
POATE, Mr. M.	President, Australian Education Union, Tasmania Branch
PRICE, Ms.C.	Friends School
RADFORD, Ms. R.	Chair, AFS Hobart
RIGBY, Mr. P.	Director of International Services, University of Tasmania
RYAN, Mr. T.	Computer Support Officer, Help Desk, University of Tasmania
SCUTT, Dr. J.	Anti-Discrimination Commissioner, Anti- Discrimination Commission
SNELL, Mr. R.	Law Faculty, University of Tasmania
SUITOR, Mr. G.	Assistant Principal, South Ocean International School
TAYLOR, Ms. M.	Public Officer, Assistance Fund for Overseas Students in Tasmania (Inc)
TOPPIN, Mr. B.	Principal, Hutchins School
VAGG, Dr. E.	Representing the Australian Maritime College

### List of Submissions Attack

# Attachment 2

ALEXANDER, Mr T.	President, Tasmania University Union
ARMSTRONG, Mr V.B.	General Manager, Hobart City Council
BACKHOUSE, Mr J.	
BACON, J.	Premier of Tasmania
BARNETT, Ms. R.	Producer, Miro Films
BESWICK, Mr. S.	Policy Analyst, Multicultural Tas. DPAC
BILLETT, Mr. P.	Assistant Principal, Launceston College
BLADEL, Hon. F.	Acting Minister of Education
BOWDEN, Mr R.	AFOST
BROOKE, Mr. A.	Student Section, Department of Immigration & Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs
BREWER, Ms D.	
BUTLER, Ms L.	University of Tasmania, Faculty of Law
CALVERT, Mr G.	
CAMPBELL, Mr A.	Department of Economic Development
CHAN, Ms J.	Tas Branch Convenor, National Liaison Committee For International Students in Australia (NLC)
CHIN, Chun-Wah,	International Students Officer, Students Assoc. Inc., UTAS
COX, Ms H.	Tasmanian College of English
CROSS, Ms R.	Assistant Secretary, Australian Education International, Commonwealth, Department of Education, Training and Youth Affairs
DICKINSON, Mr G.	
DWYER, Mr. J.	Manager, School of Audio Engineering
ELLIOTT, Mr D	State Manager, Australian Education Union, Tas. Branch

FORREST, Dr. M.	Secretary, Department of Education
GODRIDGE, Ms L.	Australia-China Foreign Language School
GOULSTON, Mr. M.	Bright Ideas Tasmania P/L
HALL, Mr C.	Director of Development, Hutchins School
HARRINGTON, Ms J.	
HENDERSON, Ms C.	
HERR, Assoc. Prof R.	School of Government, University of Tasmania
HEWSON, Dr J.	Bright Ideas Tasmania P/L
HICKS, Mr B.	Director, Metrostate Holdings P/L
HUDSON, Mr D.	Chair, AFS Hobart
HUTTON, Mr. N.	The Friends' School
KELDER, Mr J.	
KELLY, J.	CEO, Department of State Development
KUPLIS, Ms J.	
LENNOX, Ms. A.	
LIDL, Mr R.	Deputy Vice Chancellor, University of Tasmania
LING, Mr T.	National Liaison Committee for International Students in Australia (NLC)
McCAUSLAND Mr M.	
McINTOSH, Mr P.D.	
McWAIDE, Ms T.	Tas Branch Rep., ISANA International Education Association
MURPHY, Mr C.P.	General Manager, Development, TAFE Tasmania
OTWAY, Dr. N.	Principal, Academic & Student Services, Australian Maritime College
PERSCHKY, Mr R.	Principal, The WEC Missionary Training College
RADFORD, Ms R.	AFS Tasmania

RYAN, Mr T.	Help Desk, University of Tasmania
SCUTT, Dr J.A.	Anti-Discrimination Commissioner, Anti-Discrimination Commission
SNELL, Mr R.	University of Tasmania, Faculty of Law
TAYLOR, Ms. M.	AFOST
TOPPIN, Mr W.D.	Principal, Hutchins School

### List of Documents

### **Attachment 3**

Tasmanian Parliamentary Library – Parliamentary Research Service Paper Number 311/2001 dated 6/12/01. – Background Briefing Issues

Tasmanian Parliamentary Library – Parliamentary Research Service – Summary of Paper 311/2001 prepared by Ms Marina Fusescu. – Background Briefing Issues

Mr Tony Ryan – Help Desk, University of Tasmania – Paper presented at the South Pacific User Services Conference (SPUSC), Queensland University of Technology November 2001.

Tasmanian College of English – brochure – general background information.

Australian Education International – An Australian Government Initiative – Policy Research and Analysis

Tasmanian Parliamentary Library – Parliamentary Research Service Papers 1, 2, and 3 Number 278/2001 dated 22 June 2001

Department of Education – International Education Material – Historical Background, Policies and Guidelines, Student Numbers – Tas Government Schools International, Student Visas, Private Providers.

South Australian College of English (SACE): Tasmanian College of English Brochure

AFS Website information

Correspondence from Dr Alan Pang, WEC Missionary Training College relating to an application for a student visa by Saybel Nunez Crespo from Venezuala

Statistics relating to overseas enrolments at the Australian Maritime College by year and primary source country.

Tasmanian Parliamentary Library – Parliamentary Research Service Paper Number 263/02-03 dated 28 November 2002 – Main Issues Arising from Submissions.

Tasmanian Parliamentary Library – Parliamentary Research Service Paper Number 281/02-03 dated 9 December 2002 – Written Submissions Terms of Reference.

Tasmanian Parliamentary Library – Parliamentary Research Service – Paper Number 303/02-03 dated 24 December 2002 – Matters raised in evidence.

House of Assembly Hansard March 2003 – Motion Re: International Students and English language testing

Cooloola Sunshine Institute of TAFE – Course brochure and disk

TAFE Queensland – A Guide for International Students

About our Universities – Queensland Government Brochure

Central Queensland University Brochure – Where Students Come First

Central Queensland University Brochure - Study at CQU 2003

Central Queensland University Brochure – Postgraduate Study at CQU 2003

House of Assembly Hansard March 2003 – Motion moved by the Honourable Paula Wriedt MHA, Minister for Education concerning proposed student visa changes and English language testing.

Unihouse City West Development – Adelaide – Brochure of Student Accommodation

Universal English and Commercial College, Sydney, NSW

- Direct Entry Pathways Leaflet
- 2003 Course Timetable
- Colour College booklet

Shane Global Village English Centres

- Colour booklet entitled 'Adventure in Learning'
- 2003 fees booklet

Letter to Don Wing from Nordin Abdul Rahman – International Students and Scholarship Schemes

University of Tasmania – Leaflet entitled 'International Education Activities' English Australia Survey of Major Elicos Regional Markets in 2002 Tasmanian Industry Audits: Government Services 1999

Australian Education International – (AEI) – Year 2001 Final International Student Numbers

Commonwealth Department of Science, Education and Training – Selected Higher Education Statistics 2002

## Minutes of Proceedings Attachment 4

#### LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

#### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

#### MINUTES

#### Tuesday, 16 October 2001

The Committee met at 11.00 a.m. in the Legislative Council Ante-Chamber, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present: Mr Fletcher, Ms Thorp and Mr Wilkinson

Apology: Mr Wing

#### Order of the Council

The Order of the Legislative Council dated 11 October 2001 appointing the Committee, having been circulated, was taken as read.

#### **Election of Chairperson**

Mr Wilkinson was elected Chairperson and took the Chair.

#### **Committee Direction – Initial Discussion**

Discussion was had concerning the options for the initial direction to be followed by the Committee.

At the conclusion of general discussion a general directions strategy was agreed to.

#### Resolved:

- (a) that initially the key stakeholders be contacted and requested to provide, if possible, by about 16 November 2001 a background paper of fact concerning the education of international students in Tasmania as a means to better inform the Committee;
- (b) that the request letter specifically also seek to have included in the background paper advice on the following four aspects;
  - (i) the perceived potential for attracting international students;
  - (ii) the level of current resources available both financial and human;

- (iii) an identification of targets and the benefits which flow;
- (iv) a summary of the outcomes desired to be achieved from the input of allocated resources;
- (c) that from advice initially received the Committee aim to produce a general background discussion-position paper by the end of the calendar year for general availability;
- (d) that advertisements calling for submissions or requests to present verbal evidence be placed at a time to be agreed upon but not prior to the end of the calendar year;
- (e) that an informal forum of international students be convened by the Committee prior to the end of the calendar year to commence dialogue around the Terms of Reference;
- (f) that a press release be arranged by the Chairperson at the appropriate time to provide detail of the Committee's planned initial strategy.

#### Next Meetings

#### Resolved:

That the Committee meet next on Friday 23 November and again on Friday 7 December 2001 for the purpose of finalising a position paper.

At 11.45 a.m. the Committee adjourned until 9.15 a.m. on Friday 23 November 2001.

#### LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

#### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

#### MINUTES

#### Thursday 22 November 2001

At 1.00 o'clock p.m. in the Legislative Council Ante-Chamber, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present Mr Fletcher, Mr Wilkinson (Chair) and Mr Wing.

Apology Ms Thorp

#### Confirmation of Minutes of previous meeting

The Minutes of the meeting held on Tuesday, 16<sup>th</sup> October 2001 having been circulated were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

#### Administrative Matters-

#### **Resolved:**

(a) That witnesses be heard under Statutory Declaration with the exception of Ministers of the Crown who may be called.

- (b) That evidence be recorded verbatim unless otherwise ordered by the Committee.
- (c) That so much of Standing Order No. 257 be suspended as would prevent strangers being admitted when the Select Committee is examining witnesses, unless the Committee otherwise resolves.

(d) That Ms Marina Fusescu be the Parliamentary Research Service officer to be assigned to the Committee for the purposes of providing research support.

#### Submissions to be taken in evidence

Resolved, That the following submissions be taken into evidence -

- (a) W.D. Toppin Principal of the Hutchins School
- (b) J. Kelly CEO, Department of State Development
- (c) Professor Rudi Lidl Deputy Vice-Chancellor, University of Tasmania
- (d) Greg Calvert

(e) Jane Chan and Terence Ling – National Liaison Committee for International Students in Australia (NLC)

(f) Rebecca Cross – Assistant Secretary, Australian Education International, Commonwealth Department of Education, Training and Youth Affairs.

#### Documents to be taken in evidence

**Resolved**, That the following documents be taken into evidence –

Papers provided by Ms Marina Fusescu, Parliamentary Research Service.

#### **Committee Budget**

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the matter of the Committee's budget to 30 June 2001 be considered with a view to the Chair providing written advice to the President and Clerk.

#### Next Meeting

#### Resolved,

That the Committee next meet on Monday 3 December 2001 in Committee Room 2.

At 1.55 o'clock p.m. the Committee adjourned.

#### LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

#### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

#### MINUTES

#### Wednesday, 22 May 2002

The Committee met at 9.20 o'clock a.m. in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

# Members Present: Mr Fletcher, Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Ms Thorp and Mr Wing

#### Order of the Council

The Order of the Legislative Council dated 12 March 2002 reappointing the Committee, having been circulated, was taken as read.

#### **Confirmation of Minutes of previous meeting**

The Minutes of the Meeting held on Thursday 22 November 2001 having been circulated were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

#### Business

**Resolved**. That the following submissions be taken into evidence:-

SUBMISSION	REF NO
Mr Dave Elliott, State Manager, Australian	7
Education Union, Tas. Branch,	
Dr Martyn Forest, Secretary, Dept. of Education	8
Ms Tony McWaide, Tas Branch Rep., ISANA	9
International Education Association	

4.0
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40

Mr Robin Bowden and Maria Taylor (AFOST)	42
Ms Alison Lennox,	43
Dr. Neil Otway, Principal, Academic & Student Services, Australian Maritime College	44

Resolved, That the following documents be taken into evidence:

- 1. Mr Tony Ryan, Help Desk, University of Tasmania The Special IT needs of Overseas Students
- 2. Tasmanian College of English Brochure

#### Other Matters -

*Timetable for commencement of hearings* – The Committee considered the matter of public hearings. General discussion ensued.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Committee first meet informally with students both in the South and in the North of the State.

**Press statement re the Committee's intended program** – The Committee considered this matter and agreed that further consideration be given to this at a later time.

*Letter to Secretary, Department of Education* – <u>Resolved</u>, That a letter be forwarded to Dr Martyn Forrest, Secretary of the Department of Education advising that the Committee as part of its initial work is intending to meet and speak informally with students and others in their school environment.

#### Next Meeting

*Resolved*, That the Committee next meet on Thursday 30 May 2002.

#### Adjournment

At 10.08 o'clock am the Committee adjourned until 9.00 o'clock am on Thursday, 30 May 2002.

#### LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

#### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

#### MINUTES

#### THURSDAY 30 MAY 2002

The Committee met at 9.08 o'clock a.m. in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Ms Thorp and Mr Wing

Apology: Mr Fletcher

#### **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting:**

The Minutes of the Meeting held on Wednesday 22 May 2002 having been circulated were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

#### Business:

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the submission received from Leonie Godridge, Australia-China Foreign Language School, Zhangzhou City, Fujian Province (Ref No. 45) be taken into evidence.

#### **Other Matters:**

Submissions – The Committee considered the range of submissions received and discussion ensued concerning initial witnesses for public hearings.

- **<u>Resolved</u>**, That the first witnesses to be examined be Jan Kuplis (Ref No. 35) and Mr Greg Calvert (Ref. No. 6).
- **Resolved,** That the two above-mentioned witnesses be listed for examination on Monday 17 June 2002 during the morning.

Meeting with Students – The Secretary advised the Committee that due to University examinations it would not be possible for on-campus informal meetings with students until after the examination period which runs from 8-25 June 2002.

- **<u>Resolved</u>**, That informal meetings with University students both in Hobart and Launceston be scheduled for a time that does not conflict with examinations.
- **<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Committee also schedule on-campus informal meetings with students from TAFE, the Launceston College and the Australian Maritime College at a time mutually agreed.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That, if possible, the Chair arrange a meeting with international students studying at the Fahan School for Monday 17 June 2002 preferably in the afternoon.

Survey of International Students – The Committee discussed the matter of the availability of an international students database which may facilitate contact by the Committee in terms of a possible survey of students.

It was agreed that a survey may be useful and that further consideration be given by the Committee to this matter.

#### **Next Meeting:**

**Resolved,** That the Committee next meet on Monday 17 June 2002.

#### Adjournment:

At 9.57 o'clock a.m. the Committee adjourned until 10.30 o'clock a.m. on Monday, 17 June 2002.

#### LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

#### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

#### MINUTES

#### MONDAY 17 JUNE 2002

The Committee met at 10.45 o'clock a.m. in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Ms Thorp and Mr Wing

Apology: Mr Fletcher

#### **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting:**

The Minutes of the Meeting held on Thursday 30 May 2002 having been circulated were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

#### Business:

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the submission received from Dr Richard Herr, Associate Professor of Political Science, University of Tasmania (Ref No. 25) be taken into evidence.

#### Witness:

MS JAN KUPLIS was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew.

#### Witness not called:

MR GREG CALVERT was scheduled to appear before the Committee but was not called.

#### **Next Meeting:**

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Chair in consultation with Members determine future meeting times.

The meeting was suspended at 12.45 o'clock p.m. until 3.00 o'clock p.m. at the Fahan School.

#### Fahan School – Meeting with Students:

The Members of the Committee met informally with staff and international students studying at the school.

The meeting with the students concluded at 4.15 o'clock p.m.

#### Adjournment:

At 4.15 o'clock p.m. the Committee adjourned sine die.

#### LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

#### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

#### MINUTES

#### THURSDAY 26 SEPTEMBER 2002

The Committee met at 9.25 o'clock a.m. in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

Committee reappointed 25 September 2002.

Members Present: Mr Wilkinson, Mr Fletcher, Ms Thorp and Mr Wing

Mr Wilkinson took the chair.

#### **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting:**

The Minutes of the Meeting held on Monday 17 June 2002 having been circulated were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

#### Business:

The Committee considered the future timetable for the examination of witnesses and associated matters.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That witnesses be called to appear before the Committee during the week commencing Monday 21 October 2002.

That the Committee meet on 21, 22 and 23 October 2002 in Hobart and 24 and 25 October 2002 in Launceston.

That the Committee travel interstate for the purpose of continuing its work and that the Committee depart on Tuesday 19 November 2002.

That the Committee travel to Canberra and that consideration be given to the prospect of travelling to Sydney and Brisbane to gather further information.

#### **Next Meeting:**

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Committee next meet on Tuesday 15 October 2002 at 12.00 o'clock noon.

#### Adjournment:

At 10.00 o'clock a.m. the Committee adjourned until 12.00 o'clock noon of Tuesday 15 October 2002.

#### LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

#### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS IN TASMANIA

#### MINUTES

#### **TUESDAY 15 OCTOBER 2002**

The Committee met at 12.08 o'clock p.m. in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present:

Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Mr Fletcher, Ms Thorp and Mr Wing

#### **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting:**

The Minutes of the Meeting held on Thursday 26 September 2002 having been circulated were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

#### Documents taken into Evidence:

*Resolved*. That the following documents be taken into evidence:

- Department of Education International Education: Background, Policies and Data
- Brochure Education in Tasmania, Australia Nurturing Human Potential
- Brochure Tasmanian Government Schools International Program (Ref No. 7)

#### **Correspondence from the Secretary of the Department of Education:**

The Chair Tabled a letter dated 9 October 2002 from Dr Martyn Forrest, Secretary, Department of Education concerning the future appearance of Mr Greg Calvert before the Committee.

The correspondence was considered:

**Resolved,** That a draft reply to the letter be prepared by the Chair and circulated for the consideration of Members of the Committee prior to the reply being sent.

#### **Business – Consideration of Proposed Witness Timetable:**

The Committee considered the proposed witness timetable for the week of hearings 21 - 25 October 2002 both in Hobart and Launceston.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the timetable be agreed subject to confirmation of witness availability.

#### **Next Meeting:**

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Committee next meet on Monday 21 October 2002 at 9.15 o'clock a.m. in Committee Room No 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

#### Adjournment:

At 12.43 o'clock p.m. the Committee adjourned until 9.15 o'clock a.m. on Monday 21 October 2002.

#### LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

#### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS IN TASMANIA

#### MINUTES

#### MONDAY 21 OCTOBER 2002

The Committee met at 9.15 o'clock a.m. in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

# Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Mr Fletcher, Ms Thorp and Mr Wing

#### Examination of Witnesses:

<u>Mr Bill Toppin</u> and <u>Mr Christopher Hall</u> were called, made the Statutory Declaration and were examined.

The witnesses withdrew.

#### Unavailability of Witness:

The Chair advised the Committee that the Tasmania Branch Convenor for the National Liaison Committee for International Students, Ching Ching Ko who was the next witness scheduled to appear before the Committee was not available due to personal reasons.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That Ching Ching Ko be again invited to appear before the Committee at a later time.

The meeting was suspended at 10.30 o'clock a.m. and resumed at 11.45 o'clock a.m.

#### Document taken into Evidence:

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the brochure SACE Adelaide as provided by Helen Cox, Director, Tasmanian College of English be taken into evidence (Document Ref 8).

<u>Mr Mike Poate</u>, President; <u>Mr Rod Hunt</u>, Secondary Colleges Organiser; <u>Ms Sue Ball</u>, Member and <u>Mr Phil Cox</u>, Member, Australian Education Union, Tasmania Branch were called, made the Statutory Declaration and were examined.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the further submission provided by the Australian Education Union, Tasmanian Branch be taken into evidence (Ref. 7).

The witnesses withdrew.

The meeting was suspended at 1.00 o'clock p.m. and resumed at 2.05 o'clock p.m.

#### Examination of Witnesses:

<u>Mr Johannes Kelder</u> was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew.

<u>Mr John Backhouse</u> was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew.

<u>Mr Edward Alexander</u>, President, Tasmanian University Union was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew.

#### Adjournment:

At 5.00 o'clock p.m. the Committee adjourned.

#### LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

#### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS IN TASMANIA

#### MINUTES

#### TUESDAY 22 OCTOBER 2002

The Committee met at 9.00 o'clock a.m. in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Mr Fletcher, Ms Thorp and Mr Wing

#### Examination of Witnesses:

<u>Ms Helen Cox</u>, Director, Tasmanian College of English was contacted by telephone in Adelaide for the purpose of discussing the submission previously provided to the Committee.

<u>Ms Roslyn Barnett</u>, Miro Films was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

Ms Barnett provided a copy of a CD produced by Miro Films for Swinburne University of Technology.

**Resolved,** That the CD form part of the Committees official evidence.

The witness withdrew.

<u>Mr Tony Ryan</u>, Computer Support Officer, Help Desk, University of Tasmania and <u>Ms Chiria Lee</u> were called, made the Statutory Declaration and were examined.

The witnesses withdrew.

The meeting was suspended at 1.00 o'clock p.m. and resumed at 2.05 o'clock p.m.

#### Examination of Witnesses:

<u>Dr Richard Herr</u>, Associate Professor, School of Government, University of Tasmania was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew.

#### Unavailability of Witness:

The Chair advised the Committee that Mr Peter McIntosh who was the next witness scheduled to appear before the Committee was not available due to personal reasons.

The meeting was suspended at 3.05 o'clock p.m. and resumed at 4.05 o'clock p.m.

#### Examination of Witnesses:

<u>Ms Janet Harrington</u> was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew.

<u>Ms Maria Taylor</u>, Public Officer and <u>Ms Robin Bowden</u>, Committee Member, Assistance Fund for Overseas Students in Tasmania (Inc) were called, made the Statutory Declaration and were examined.

The witnesses withdrew.

#### Adjournment:

At 6.00 o'clock p.m. the Committee adjourned.

#### LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

#### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS IN TASMANIA

#### MINUTES

#### WEDNESDAY 23 OCTOBER 2002

The Committee met at 9.15 o'clock a.m. in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Mr Fletcher, Ms Thorp and Mr Wing

#### Examination of Witnesses:

<u>Dr Jocelynne Scutt</u>, Anti-Discrimination Commissioner; <u>Rebekah Francis</u>, Social Worker; <u>Santi Mariso</u> and <u>Anita George</u>, Training Consultant, Anti-Discrimination Commission were called, made the Statutory Declaration and were examined.

The witnesses withdrew.

<u>Ms Deborah Brewer</u> was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew.

The meeting was suspended at 11.50 o'clock a.m. and resumed at 3.10 o'clock p.m.

Examination of Witnesses:

<u>Mr Nick Hutton</u>, Commercial Manager, Friends School and <u>Ms Cheryl Price</u> were called, made the Statutory Declaration and were examined.

The witnesses withdrew.

<u>Ms Lisa Butler</u> and <u>Mr Rick Snell</u>, Law Faculty, University of Tasmania were called, made the Statutory Declaration and were examined.

Additional Submission taken into Evidence:

<u>**Resolved.**</u> That two emails Tabled by Mr Snell from former international students who have graduated from the Law Faculty be taken into evidence. (Ref. 41)

The witnesses withdrew.

<u>Mr David Hudson</u>, Chair AFS Hobart and <u>Ms Ruth Radford</u>, Chair AFS Tasmania were called, made the Statutory Declaration and were examined.

Additional Submission taken into Evidence:

**<u>Resolved</u>**. That the website information on AFS Tabled by Mr Hudson be taken into evidence. (Document Ref. 9).

The witnesses withdrew.

<u>Ms Alison Lennox</u> was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew.

Next Meeting:

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Committee next meet tomorrow, Thursday 24 October 2002 at 11.45 o'clock a.m. at Henty House, Launceston.

#### Adjournment:

At 6.54 o'clock p.m. the Committee adjourned.

#### LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

#### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS IN TASMANIA

#### MINUTES

#### **THURSDAY 24 OCTOBER 2002**

The Committee met at 12.00 o'clock noon in the Conference Room, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor, Henty House, 1 Civic Square, Launceston.

Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Mr Fletcher and Mr Wing

Apology:

Ms Thorp

<u>Ms Toni McWaide</u> and <u>Ms Merren Dalgleish</u>, Tasmanian Branch Representatives, ISANA: International Education Association were called, made the Statutory Declaration and were examined.

The witnesses withdrew.

#### Launceston College Visit:

The Chair advised the Committee that a visit to Launceston College was scheduled for 2.30 o'clock p.m. today and that the College Principal, Mr Keith Whenn, the Deputy Secretary, Department of Education, Mr Tim Doe and the Launceston College International Students Officer, Ms Merren Dalgleish will meet the Committee.

The meeting was suspended at 1.25 o'clock p.m. until 2.30 o'clock p.m. at Launceston College.

#### Launceston College Visit:

The Committee met at the Launceston College with the Principal, the Deputy Secretary of the Department of Education and the College International Students Officer. The Committee was also conducted on a tour of the areas of the College principally set aside for International Students.

The meeting at the College concluded at 4.00 o'clock p.m.

# Examination of Witnesses – Conference Room, Henty House, 1 Civic Square, Launceston:

<u>Mr Chun-Wah Chin</u>, International Students Officer, Students Association Incorporated, University of Tasmania was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew.

#### **Next Meeting:**

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Committee meet again tomorrow, Friday 25 October 2002 at 9.15 o'clock a.m. at Henty House, Launceston.

#### Adjournment:

At 6.28 o'clock p.m. the Committee adjourned.

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

# INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS IN TASMANIA

# MINUTES

## FRIDAY 25 OCTOBER 2002

The Committee met at 9.15 o'clock a.m. in the Conference Room, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor, Henty House, 1 Civic Square, Launceston.

Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Mr Fletcher and Mr Wing

Apology: Ms Thorp

## Examination of Witnesses:

<u>Professor Rudi Lidl</u>, Deputy Vice Chancellor, University of Tasmania was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew.

<u>Dr Alan Pang</u>, Academic Dean, WEC Missionary Training College was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

## Additional Documents taken into Evidence:

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the correspondence Tabled by Dr Pang relating to an application for a student visa by Saybel Nunez Crespo from Venezuela be taken into evidence. (Document Ref. 10)

The witness withdrew.

The meeting was suspended at 12.30 o'clock p.m. and resumed at 2.00 o'clock p.m.

<u>Dr Elizabeth Vagg</u> and <u>Mr Rob Jones</u>, representing the Australian Maritime College were called, made the Statutory Declaration and were examined.

## Additional Document taken into Evidence:

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That statistics Tabled by Mr Jones relating to overseas enrolments at the Australian Maritime College by year and primary source country be taken into evidence. (Document Ref. 11)

The witnesses withdrew.

<u>Mr Geoff Dickinson</u> was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew.

### Adjournment:

At 3.50 o'clock p.m. the Committee adjourned sine die.

## LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

#### MINUTES

#### WEDNESDAY 13 NOVEMBER 2002

The Committee met at 9.00 o'clock am in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

#### Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Mr Fletcher and Mr Wing

Apology: Ms Thorp

### **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meetings:**

The Minutes of the meetings held on Tuesday 15 October, Monday 21 October, Tuesday 22 October, Wednesday 23 October, Thursday 24 October and Friday 25 October 2002 having been circulated were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

### Document taken into Evidence:

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the additional information from Professor Rudi Lidl relating to international student numbers be taken into evidence.

### Examination of Witness:

Greg Suitor, Assistant Principal, South Ocean International School, was called made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew.

### Adjournment:

At 10.20 o'clock am the Committee adjourned sine die.

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

## INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

### MINUTES

### MONDAY 25 NOVEMBER 2002

The Committee met at 9.15 o'clock a.m. in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Mr Fletcher and Mr Wing

## **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting:**

The Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 13 November 2002 having been circulated were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

### **Correspondence Tabled:**

Letter dated 8 November 2002 from Dr Martyn Forrest, Secretary, Department of Education concerning the future appearance of Mr Greg Calvert before the Committee.

### Examination of Witnesses:

Ching Ching Ko, Tasmania Branch Convenor, National Liaison Committee for International Students was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew.

<u>Tim Doe</u>, Deputy Secretary, <u>David Kilpatrick</u> and <u>Bob Phillips</u>, Department of Education were called, made the Statutory Declaration and were examined.

The witnesses withdrew.

<u>Alan Campbell</u>, Department of Economic Development was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew.

The meeting was suspended at 12.45 o'clock p.m. and resumed at 2.15 o'clock p.m.

Ms Thorp took her place.

<u>Kailee Ng</u>, International Student and University Graduate, University of Tasmania was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew.

### Hon Philip Ruddock MP – Meeting:

The Chair advised the Committee of the meeting scheduled for 4.00 o'clock p.m. today with the Hon Philip Ruddock, Federal Minister for Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs.

The meeting to be held in the President's Rooms.

### **Next Meeting:**

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Committee meet next on Friday 6 December 2002 at Parliament House.

#### Adjournment:

At 3.22 o'clock p.m. the Committee adjourned.

### LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

### MINUTES

#### FRIDAY 28 MARCH 2003

The Committee met at 1.35 o'clock pm in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Mr Fletcher, Ms Thorp and Mr Wing

**Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting:** The Minutes of the meeting held on Monday 25 November 2002 having been circulated were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

### **Correspondence and Additional Information taken into Evidence:**

<u>**Resolved**</u>, That the following correspondence and additional information received be taken into evidence -

• Letter dated 20 December 2002 from Alan Campbell, Department of Economic Development relating to student numbers update.

- Email dated 12 December 2002 from Mr Paul Rigby, University of Tasmania and relating to the recognition of Law degrees in Singapore.
- Letter dated 2 January 2003 from Robin Bowden and relating to Aus AID funding of students.
- Additional information dated 20 January 2003 from Tasmanian Government Schools International (TGSI) as requested by Select Committee.
- Letter dated 4 March 2003 from Mr Abul Rizvi, First Assistant Secretary, Migration and Temporary Entry Division, DIMIA and relating to information sought by the Select Committee on the proposed regional initiative for international students to study at regional Universities and answers to questions raised prior to the Committee's meeting on 25 November 2002 with the Federal Minister, Phillip Ruddock.

## Other Matters – Transcripts to be referred and taken into Evidence:

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the following transcripts be referred to the Committee and be taken into evidence-

Mr Greg Calvert and Mr Paul Rigby – Transcript taken on Friday 6 December 2002.

Mr Andrew Barr, Principal, Scotch Oakburn and Mr Narul Azim, International Student, AMC – Transcript taken on Wednesday 12 March 2003.

**Release of Transcript of Evidence:** <u>*Resolved*</u>, That the Committee authorises the release of the transcript of evidence given on Monday 25 November 2002 by Timothy Doe, Robert Phillips and David Kilpatrick from the Tasmanian Department of Education.

### Examination of Witnesses:

<u>Alan Campbell</u> General Manager, Investment, Trade and Development, Department of Economic Development, <u>Timothy Doe</u>, Deputy Secretary, and <u>David Kilpatrick</u>, Manager, Tasmanian Government Schools International, Department of Education were again called, made the Statutory Declaration and were examined.

The witnesses withdrew.

<u>Ian Duncan</u>, Registered Migration Agent and Partner Argyle Law was called, made the Statutory Declaration and was examined.

The witness withdrew

**Progress to Date:** The Committee discussed its work to date and future program. Matters arising from the evidence obtained to date were also discussed. It was agreed that the Committee, prior to commencing work on its formal report phase, travel to Queensland and New South Wales for the purpose of meeting with educators and administrators in international student programs in those States.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That travel be undertaken during the week commencing Monday 7 April 2003.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Schools and TAFE Sector on the Queensland Sunshine Coast be given some priority by the Committee and that specific areas of accommodation, pastoral care and cultural diversity be considered.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That travel and meeting arrangements be made by the Secretary in conjunction with the Chair and that the Committee Members be advised accordingly.

Next Meeting: <u>Resolved</u>, That the Committee meet next on Monday 7 April 2003 in Queensland.

Adjournment: At 3.50 o'clock pm the Committee adjourned.

## LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

### MINUTES

### MONDAY 7 APRIL 2003

The Committee met at 1.00 o'clock pm at the Cooloola Sunshine Institute of TAFE at Mountain Creek, Mooloolaba, Queensland.

Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Ms Thorp and Mr Wing

Apology: Mr Fletcher

**Business:** The Committee met with Ms Karen Tucker, International Students Officer with the Cooloola Sunshine Institute of TAFE and discussed international student education matters at the Institute. The Cooloola Institute is one of seven TAFE institutes on the Sunshine Coast. The Committee also met and had discussion with an international student from Sweden who is studying Tourism Management at the Institute. At the conclusion of the meeting at 3.00 o'clock pm the Committee travelled to Central Mooloolaba for a further meeting.

## Documents taken into Evidence:

Resolved, That the following documents be taken into evidence -

- Cooloola Sunshine Institute of TAFE Course Brochure and disk (16)
- TAFE Queensland A Guide for International Students (17)
- About our Universities Queensland Government Brochure (18)

In Mooloolaba the Committee met with Mr Glen McGowan, a senior officer with the Queensland Education Department on the Sunshine Coast.

The meeting concluded at 5.20 o'clock pm.

## **Next Meeting:**

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Committee next meet on Tuesday 8 April in Brisbane.

Adjournment: At 5.22 o'clock pm the Committee adjourned.

## LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

## INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

## MINUTES

## TUESDAY 8 APRIL 2003

The Committee met at 10.00 o'clock am at the Queensland Office of Higher Education, Education House, 30 Mary Street, Brisbane.

Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Ms Thorp and Mr Wing

### Apology: Mr Fletcher

**Business:** The Committee met with the following officers from the Queensland Government Department of Education :-

- Ms Leigh Tabrett, Assistant Director-General, External Portfolio Relations;
- Ms Nicole Brigg, Manager, Education International; and
- Mr Roger White, Manager, Community Service Obligations, Education International

The meeting concluded at 11.45 o'clock am.

At 12.00 o'clock noon in the Queensland Government Executive Building at 100 George Street, Brisbane, the Committee met with the following officials from the Queensland Department of Premier and Cabinet Special Unit – Queensland Education and Training International:-

- The Honourable Paul Braddy, Chair of the Queensland Education and Training International Board;
- Mr Scott Sheppard, Director; and
- Ms Fiona Morris

The meeting concluded at 1.05 o'clock pm.

The meeting was suspended at 1.05 o'clock pm and resumed at 2.15 o'clock pm.

**Business**: At 2.15 o'clock pm at the Brisbane Campus of the Central Queensland University at 108 Margaret Street, Brisbane, the Committee met with Mr Ross Springolo, Corporate Development Manager. Members were conducted on a tour of the campus.

### Documents taken into Evidence:

Resolved, That the following documents be taken into evidence -

- Central Queensland University Brochure Where Students Come First (19)
- Central Queensland University Brochure Study at CQU 2003 (20)
- Central Queensland University Brochure Postgraduate Study at CQU 2003 (21)

The Meeting concluded at 3.40 o'clock pm.

## Other Business:

**Sub Committee** – <u>Resolved</u>, That Mr Wilkinson (Chair) and Ms Thorp be authorised to meet with individuals in Sydney on Wednesday 9 April 2003, as previously arranged, and submit relevant information to the Committee at a later stage for its consideration.

Resolved, That the following scheduled meetings be conducted:-

- 11.30 o'clock am at Parliament House, Macquarie Street, Sydney Mr Brian Hicks, Director and Mr Garry Parker, Director Gold River Group.
- 2.00 o'clock pm at the International Students Centre, George Street, Broadway – Ms Judith Vincent, Director, International Students Centre and Ms Elizabeth Webber, Senior Adviser, Schools Program, NSW Department of Education and Training.
- 3.30 o'clock pm at the Universal English and Commercial College, Level 12, 222 Pitt Street Sydney – Mr Mikio Kamokasu, Managing Director; Mr Vincent Bastick, Marketing Manager – South East Asia, Shane Global Village English Centres; and Ms Cheryl Moran, College General Manager.

### Next Meeting:

**Resolved.** That the Chair advise Members of the next meeting date with a view to it being held during the scheduled Parliamentary Committee activity week commencing Monday 12 May 2003.

Mr Wing returned to Launceston during that evening.

Adjournment: At 3.55 o'clock pm the Committee adjourned sine die.

## LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

### MINUTES

#### **FRIDAY 16 MAY 2003**

The Committee met at 9.30 o'clock am in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Ms Thorp and Mr Wing (via telephone conference)

Apology: Mr Fletcher

## **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting:**

The Minutes of the Meetings held on Friday 28 March, Monday 7 April and Tuesday 8 April having been circulated were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

## Additional Information to be taken into Evidence:

Resolved, That the following additional information be taken into evidence –

- House of Assembly Hansard March 2003 Motion moved by the Honourable Paula Wriedt, MHA, Minister for Education concerning proposed student visa changes and English language testing.
- Unihouse City West Development, Adelaide Brochure of student accommodation development.
- Universal English College, Sydney NSW
  - Direct Entry Pathways Leaflet
  - 2003 course timetable
  - Colour College booklet
- Shane Global Village English Centres
  - Colour booklet entitled 'Adventure in Learning'
  - 2003 fees booklet

### Business:

### **Report Preparation:**

The Committee discussed the preparation of the Committee's Report.

The Chair presented a paper entitled 'Report Focus Points' and the Committee proceeded to link those 'focus points' to the Terms of Reference.

For the purpose of report writing the Chair allocated Terms of Reference to Members of the Committee.

**<u>Resolved</u>**. That draft report sections be available when the Committee next meets.

### Next Meeting:

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Committee next meet on the afternoon of Monday 16 June 2003 at Parliament House.

## Adjournment:

At 10.30 o'clock am the Committee adjourned until 2.15 o'clock pm on Monday 16 June 2003.

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

## INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

## MINUTES

### MONDAY 16 JUNE 2003

The Committee met at 2.15 o'clock pm in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Mr Fletcher, Ms Thorp and Mr Wing.

### **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting:**

The Minutes of the Meeting held on Friday 16 May 2003 having been circulated were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

### Business:

### **Report Preparation:**

The Committee noted the draft sections presented and further considered the key recommendation areas.

The Chair requested that Members individually continue work on previously allocated Terms of Reference with a view to having final drafts available as soon as possible.

### **Next Meeting:**

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Committee next meet on Tuesday 15 July 2003 at Parliament House.

### Adjournment:

At 4.00 o'clock pm the Committee adjourned until 10.00 o'clock am on Tuesday 15 July 2003.

## LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

### MINUTES

### MONDAY 25 AUGUST 2003

The Committee met at 10.30 o'clock am in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Mr Fletcher, Ms Thorp and Mr Wing.

### **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting:**

The Minutes of the Meeting held on Monday 16 June 2003 having been circulated were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

## Additional Correspondence to be taken into Evidence:

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the correspondence dated 19 August 2003 from the Acting Secretary of the Department of Education be taken into evidence. The correspondence provided answers to several questions raised in correspondence by the Committee Secretary on 11 August 2003. **Additional Documents to be taken into Evidence:** 

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the following additional note and documents be taken into evidence –

Note from Nordin Abdul Rahman. (25).

Australian Education International Overseas Students Statistics 2000 – Parliamentary Library (26).

Students 2002 – Selected Higher Education Statistics 2002 – Commonwealth Department of Education, Science and Training (27).

## Business:

## **Report Preparation:**

The Committee noted the further draft sections presented and further considered and noted the key recommendation areas.

The Chair requested that remaining draft sections be completed as soon as possible.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That all draft sections be checked for accuracy of content and compiled into one document for further consideration.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Chair present a draft list of all recommendations to accompany the full draft of the Report for further consideration.

### Next Meeting:

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Committee next meet on Thursday 4 September 2003 at Parliament House.

## Adjournment:

At 1.00 o'clock pm the Committee adjourned until 1.00 o'clock pm on Thursday 4 September 2003.

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

## INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

### MINUTES

### MONDAY 24 NOVEMBER 2003

The Committee met at 11.00 o'clock am in Committee Room No. 1, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present: Mr Fletcher, Ms Thorp, Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Mr Wing

## Confirmation of Minutes of previous meeting:

The Minutes of the meeting held on Monday 25 August 2003, having been circulated, were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

## Additional Information taken into Evidence:

Resolved, That the following additional information be taken into evidence –

- University of Tasmania Leaflet entitled 'International Education Activities'. [Doc. 26]
- English Australia Survey of Major Elicos Regional Markets in 2002. [Doc 27]
- Tasmanian Industry Audits: Government Services 1999. [Doc 28]
- Australian Education International (AEI) Year 2001 Final International Student Numbers. [Doc 29]

### Business:

The Committee considered the draft report.

Ms Thorp withdrew.

The meeting was suspended at 1.20 o'clock pm.

The meeting resumed at 2.04 o'clock pm.

Members Present: Mr Fletcher, Mr Wilkinson (Chair) and Mr Wing.

The Committee continued to consider the draft report.

Ms Thorp resumed her seat.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That further consideration of the draft report be held over until tomorrow.

### **Next Meeting:**

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Committee next meet on Tuesday 25 November 2003 at 9.00 o'clock am in Committee Room No. 4.

Adjournment: At 5.05 o'clock pm the Committee adjourned.

## LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

### INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

### MINUTES

### **TUESDAY 25 NOVEMBER 2003**

The Committee met at 9.00 o'clock am in Committee Room No. 4, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present: Mr Fletcher, Ms Thorp, Mr Wilkinson (Chair) and Mr Wing

### **Business:**

The Committee further considered the draft report.

The meeting was suspended at 9.50 o'clock am.

The meeting resumed at 10.10 o'clock am.

Members Present: Mr Fletcher, Ms Thorp, Mr Wilkinson (Chair) and Mr Wing.

The Committee continued to consider the draft report.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That a second draft be prepared and ready for consideration when the Committee next meets.

## Next Meeting:

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Committee next meet on Monday 1 December 2003 at 11.15 am in Committee Room No. 2.

Adjournment: At 12.38 o'clock pm the Committee adjourned.

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

## INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

## MINUTES

## WEDNESDAY 3 DECEMBER 2003

The Committee met at 9.00 o'clock am in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present: Mr Fletcher, Ms Thorp, Mr Wilkinson (Chair) and Mr Wing

## **Confirmation of Minutes of previous meetings:**

The Minutes of the meetings held on Monday 24 November and Tuesday 25 November 2003, having been circulated, were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

**Business:** The Committee continued to consider the draft report.

Ms Thorp withdrew.

- Table of Contents agreed to.
- Executive Summary agreed to with Amendments.

• Summary of Recommendations up to and including Part 2 agreed to with Amendments.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That further consideration of the draft report be held over until Friday, 5 December 2003. **Next Meeting:** 

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Committee next meet on Friday, 5 December 2003 at 9.00 o'clock am in Committee Room No, 2.

Adjournment: At 10.40 o'clock am the Committee adjourned.

## LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

## INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

## MINUTES

## FRIDAY 5 DECEMBER 2003

The Committee met at 9.10 o'clock am in Committee Room No. 2, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present: Mr Fletcher, Mr Wilkinson (Chair) and Mr Wing

Apology: Ms Thorp

### **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting:**

The Minutes of the Meeting held on Wednesday 3 December 2003 having been circulated, were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

### Business:

The Committee further considered the draft Report.

### Part 3

Recommendation 1 agreed to with Amendment. Recommendation 2 agreed to.

### Part 4

Recommendation 1 agreed to. Recommendation 2 deleted. Recommendations 3 and 4 agreed to. Recommendation 5 agreed to with Amendment. New Recommendation 6 made and agreed to. Recommendations 7 and 8 agreed to.

## Part 5

Recommendation1 agreed to with Amendment. Recommendation 2 to 4 agreed to. Recommendation 5 agreed to with Amendment. Recommendation 6 deleted. Recommendations 7 and 8 agreed to.

## Part 6

Recommendation 1 agreed to with Amendment. Recommendation 2 agreed to.

### Part 8

Recommendations 1 to 3 agreed to. New Recommendation 4 made and agreed to. (To follow Recommendation 2).

### Introduction

Agreed to.

### Parts 1 to 8

Considered and agreed to with Amendments.

#### **Resolved**, (1) That the Amendments be made to the draft Report.

- (2) That Part 2 of the Report have certain additional information provided by Mr Abul Rizvi from DIMIA included.
- (3) That the Report in its final form be available on Wednesday10 December 2003 for adoption by the Committee.
- (4) That the Report when adopted be presented to Mrs Sue Smith MLC, the Honourable Member for Montgomery in her capacity as Deputy President.

### **Next Meeting:**

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the Committee next meet on Wednesday 10 December 2003 by telephone conference facility.

## Adjournment:

At 12.02 o'clock pm the Committee adjourned until Wednesday, 10 December 2003.

## LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

## INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

## MINUTES

## WEDNESDAY 10 DECEMBER 2003

The Committee met At 9.45 o'clock am in Committee Room No. 3, Parliament House, Hobart.

Members Present: Mr Wilkinson (Chair), Ms Thorp and Mr Fletcher and Mr Wing via telephone conference facility

## **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting:**

The Minutes of the meeting held on Friday 5 December 2003 having been circulated were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

## Additional Information Taken into Evidence:

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That detail relating to recent reforms to the processing of Visas and related matters by the Department of Immigration and Multicultural and Indigenous Affairs be taken into evidence.

### Business:

The Committee further considered the draft Report.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the additional text relating to:

- (a) visas;
- (b) homestay; and
- (c) economic value

be incorporated into the draft Report.

**<u>Resolved</u>**, That the draft Report be further considered on Friday, 12 December 2003.

## Adjournment:

At 10.35 o'clock am the Committee adjourned until 9.30 o'clock am on Friday 12 December 2003.

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

## INTERNATIONAL STUDENTS

### MINUTES

### FRIDAY 12 DECEMBER 2003

The Committee met at 9.30 o'clock am in Committee Room No. 3, Parliament House, Hobart.

*Members Present:* Mr Wilkinson (Chair) and Ms Thorp [Mr Fletcher and Mr Wing via telephone conference facility]

### **Confirmation of Minutes of Previous Meeting:**

The Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 10 December 2003 having been circulated were accepted as a true and accurate record and confirmed.

### Business:

The Committee took into consideration the draft Report for final adoption.

**Resolved**, That the draft Report be considered Party by Part.

Executive Summary to stand part of the Report. Summary of Recommendations with Amendment to stand part of the Report.

Introduction to stand part of the Report. Part 1 with Amendment to stand part of the Report. Parts 2 and 3 to stand part of the Report. Part 4 considered and held over. Parts 5 to 8 to stand part of the Report.

At 10.30 o'clock am the meeting was suspended.

The meeting resumed at 4.30 o'clock pm.

Members Present:	Mr Wilkinson (Chair) [Mr Fletcher and Mr Wing via
	telephone conference facility]

#### Business:

The Committee further took into consideration the draft Report for final adoption.

**Resolved,** That Part 4 be further examined.

Amendment made. Part 4 to stand part of the Report. Glossary of Terms and Attachments 1 to 4 to stand part of the Report.

At 5.35 o'clock pm the Committee adjourned sine die.