

## AFL IN TASMANIA - SUBMISSION TO THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL SELECT COMMITTEE

My name is Joanne Marsh. I have been a neighbour of Bellerive Oval for forty years. Since 2009 [when the floodlighting towers were installed] I have taken on an informal advocacy role in relation to redevelopments of the oval and the ripple out effect on the environment and the community.

I support an AFL Team in Tasmania that is properly funded by sponsors so that the financial burden is not carried by Tasmanian taxpayers.

I am making this submission to the Select Committee because in my opinion as a non-expert witness Bellerive Oval is unsustainable as a venue for large events. It cannot be considered for expansion or play a role in hosting future Tasmanian AFL games.

My main concerns are the Traffic Management Plan and the design and operation of the four floodlighting towers. I believe that the arena is one of the worst examples of flawed planning and decision making by responsible authorities in Tasmania.

The Clarence Interim Planning Scheme 2015 18.3.4 – Commercial and Patron Vehicle Movements, Performance Criteria 2 states ‘A traffic management plan must be provided for any event generating more than 3000 persons. Such plan must provide for safe and efficient traffic management with local impacts minimised.’ For Bellerive Oval this is the Bellerive Oval Transport Plan – BOTP. It is my opinion that this requirement has not been met, is not being met and cannot be met in the future due to the geographical and infrastructure constraints of the location of Bellerive Oval. On-going film evidence shows that parking behaviour is a problem, vehicles are being directed into undesirable and unsafe pathways and risky conflicts between vehicles [including heavy rigid] and pedestrians continue to occur even when crowds are below 10000.

The Clarence Interim Planning Scheme 2015 18.3.3 has the objective of ensuring that external lighting does not have unreasonable impact on residential amenity on land within a residential zone. Acceptable Solutions 2 states that ‘Flood lighting of sport and recreational facilities within 200 metres of a residential zone must not subject nearby residential lots to obtrusive light as defined in AS 4282-1997-1.4.7- [R1 - ...spill light which, because of quantitative, directional or spectral attributes in a given context gives rise to annoyance, discomfort, distraction or a reduction in the ability to see essential information, eg: Signal lights.]

In my advocacy role I have received numerous complaints about intrusive light from the towers causing annoyance and discomfort in habitable rooms, not only from nearby residents but from residents as far away as Rosny Hill. One residence approximately 300 metres from the oval has intrusive light spill impacting all of its habitable rooms due to its orientation on a linear residential lot. I have advocated without success on a number of occasions for the design and operation of the light towers to be independently assessed.

In my opinion the flood lighting installed at Bellerive Oval in 2009 has created unreasonable annoyance and discomfort to residents in a wide radius around the venue.

In my opinion Bellerive Oval cannot be considered as a venue for AFL in Tasmania because of the geographical nature of the area and the lack of a buffer zone between the venue and surrounding residential areas resulting in ongoing environmental harm caused by the spill from floodlighting.

In September 2018 I was accepted by the Resource Management and Planning Appeal Tribunal [RMPAT] to join as a party to the appeal in the Matter between the Clarence City Council and Cricket

Tasmania relating to operational restrictions affecting noise emissions and hours of operation at 15 Derwent Street Bellerive – Bellerive Oval. [RMPAT Ref: 98/18P]. My aim was to enlarge issues related to traffic, parking and pedestrian safety during events at Bellerive Oval. Peter McGlone worked with me as an advocate and we successfully argued for changes to the Permit Conditions that resulted in improvements to the safety and efficiency of the Traffic Management Plan for events at the oval.

In my opinion the changes mediated do not and cannot resolve the on-going efficiency and vehicle and pedestrian movement safety challenges due to the geographical and infrastructure restraints of the location.

It is also my opinion that this venue is a 'soft target' for a critical incident involving vehicular crime.

I have attached my letter to the Police Commissioner dated 20/4/18 for the Committee's information.

I have also included film showing the operation of the Traffic Management Plan in a selection of events 2016- 2019.

Sat.4/6/16 Nth Melb. V Richmond. Attendance: 17844 [10 min.]

Sat 20/8/16 NthMelb V Swans. Attendance: 16495 [22mins]

Wed 7/2/18 20/20 Aust. V England. Attendance: 9958 [15 mins]

Sat 14/4/18 Nth Melb V Carlton Attendance: 14266 [11 mins]

Fri 28/12/18 BB Hurricanes V Thunder Attendance: 10478 [14 mins]

Sat 18/5/19 Nth Melb V Swans Attendance: 12799 [22 mins]

This film demonstrates the plan to be historically and currently inefficient and unsafe and consequently adversely affecting patron safety, the workplace health and safety of the police, bus and taxi operators, supervisors, security and road controlling personnel and local amenity.

I strongly believe that legislative protection of the interests of communities in relation to the adverse effects of developments such as arenas near residential areas is urgently required in Tasmania.

Thank you for taking the time to consider my submission.

Yours sincerely,



Joanne Marsh

[Redacted]

[Redacted]

9/7/19

20/4/18

Dear Commissioner Hine,

We are writing to you about the BELLERIVE OVAL TRANSPORT PLAN [BOTP]/BLUNDSTONE ARENA TRANSPORT PLAN [BATP].

This plan must be implemented for large events at the venue as a condition of approval for the southern stand {2001} and subsequent redevelopments. It is managed by a committee consisting of representatives from Cricket Tasmania, Clarence City Council, Tasmania Police, Metro Tasmania and has one resident's representative.

We {Joanne Marsh as writer} first raised concerns with the Clarence City Council about the planning strategies, efficiency and safety of the BOTP in January 2010 after the first event under lights. Since then we have raised concerns with a number of authorities including government ministers, Tasmania Police, Cricket Australia, AFL, The RACT, sponsors, Metro, the Integrity Commission and the Ombudsman over many years. In 2013 as a non-expert witness Joanne conducted a traffic and parking assessment and has also written ten Bellerive Oval Report Cards documenting the operation of the BOTP and other issues related to traffic, parking and safety and amenity in the surrounding area. These documents were initially submitted to the Clarence City Council. These documents clearly demonstrate the deficiencies of the BOTP and the management of surrounding areas. Responses we have received have demonstrated tardiness and a refusal by individual authorities to take responsibility or assist in these matters.

Our main areas of concern related to southern roads and public order continue to be:

1. Pedestrian safety
2. Safe access and egress for local residents and visitors
3. Occupational health and safety of bus and taxi operators, traffic controllers and security staff
4. Nuisance parking
5. Consumption of alcohol in public streets
6. The effectiveness of communication between committee members and other stakeholders particularly patrons, the local community and bus and taxi operators

At the heart of our work is our belief that the constraints of the local infrastructure demonstrate that the responsible planning authorities should have reasonably foreseen that the redevelopment of the 15 Derwent Street site would require rigorous assessment of the management of pedestrian safety, parking, taxis and buses and access and egress to the site. We believe that the on-going problems are a direct result of inadequate initial assessments and that there are hard questions that need to be asked and responded to.

In the past three years our work has focussed on three safety hot spots:

1. The temporary bus mall and interchange in Church Street
2. The movement of taxis and pedestrians in Derwent Street and Church Street particularly the roundabout area
3. The intersection of Alma Street and Cambridge Road

The Premier Will Hodgman and The former Police Minister Rene Hidding have recent communication about these issues.

Due to our persistent evidence gathering and complaints action has been achieved in relation to two of the safety hot spots.

The buses are now 'caged' in the upper end of Church Street. This means that the movement of pedestrians and buses is now largely separated and controlled.

The taxis have recently been located to Douglas Street. This means that they are no longer sharing the road and the roundabout with pedestrian patrons leaving the two main entrances of the complex.

It has taken years for these changes to happen despite clearly high risk situations being accepted by the Clarence City Council and event organisers.

We continue to be concerned about the management of the Alma Street/ Cambridge Road intersection after large events. {we are part of a group of people who petitioned for this intersection to be controlled by operating traffic lights} Here the normal operation of the lights is usually disabled and the lights flash amber. Traffic is not monitored continuously by police officers as at other local intersections after large events. A stream of hundreds of cars enter Alma Street and bank up along the entire street. An occasional vehicle in the large volume of traffic moving along Cambridge Road gives way to some traffic in Alma Street. Mostly cars exiting Alma Street do what has been described by these motorists as a 'Kamikaze Run' out onto Cambridge Road. {see enclosed film}. We have witnessed many frightening near misses and have seen the angst of drivers with young children, L platers, P platers and elderly drivers as they attempt to negotiate this dangerous situation.

On the night of the 14<sup>th</sup> April after attempting to attract the attention of a number of police cars passing us on Cambridge Road to the plight of the drivers in Alma Street we were fortunate enough to meet First Class Constable Makrogamvrakis 2524 who arrived on a motor cycle. This police officer must be commended for his willingness and ability to listen respectfully and respond to the road safety concerns of members of the public. We discussed a number issues related to this intersection and possible solutions. The main conclusion is that this intersection is not safe without the control of police officers after large events when the lights are flashing amber. There also needs to be some control of the volume of traffic entering Alma Street post-event.

Constable Makrogamvrakis has undertaken to write a report on the matter and advised us to write to you the Police Commissioner. We believe that you will investigate the matter and we look forward to seeing a resolution of this major safety hot spot after large events at the 15 Derwent Street venue.

Yours sincerely,

Joanne and Victor Marsh

